

Palmer, Lisa M

From: richard hurst [dustardmog@hotmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 15, 2013 9:37 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ashe

I was raised on the water. It is and will remains an important part of my past and future. 99000\$ does not even begin to scratch the surface of the cost it will take to rehabilitate these lakes rivers and streams. Sent from my Verizon Wireless 4G LTE Smartphone.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: sabrina hilario [sabrinahilario@hotmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 15, 2013 12:05 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: "You have to determine the extent of the contamination before you know what it is you have to do to clean it up," said Jamie Kritzer

Dear Lisa,

I am writing you to share my disappointment in the way the pollution of Mountain Island Lake has been handled. Do we really want to measure the damage before and then know what we need to clean up?

That not only sounds expensive but also unintelligent.

I hope the Duke-DENR deal stops pollution before it happens. I hope that we try our bests to preserve nature instead of destroying it and then trying to repair it.

Thanks,

Sabrina

Sabrina Hilario
Flying Pig Studio
www.flyingpigstudio.com
sabrina@flyingpigstudio.com
828.406.0835

Palmer, Lisa M

From: David Bragg [dbragg@icloud.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pond pollution

To whom it may concern,

We moved to North Lake Wylie just over a year ago and had no idea of some of the hazards surrounding our area until recently. The pollution to Mountain Island Lake and the downstream rivers caused by the coal ash pond at Riverbend is well documented to be a threat to Charlotte's drinking water and the lake my family lives on. It's time for Duke to take responsibility and safely remove the mess they have created at Riverbend. They should have to remove its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Immediate action should be taken. I would like future generations to experience clean and safe water for drinking and recreation.

sincerely,
David Bragg

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Laura Lee Rosenfeld [llprosenfeld@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake

- You want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
- Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
- It is time to take action and end the delays.
- Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and CEMT should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 600,000 people.
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Roundbay don't linger for generations to come.

My husband and I recently purchased a house in Mountain Island Lake. We could not be more disappointed with this proposal. This proposal does nothing to reduce the existing pollution in the lake. By refusing to take action and only asking for more study, the failure to act takes on a greater toll. Each day that passes allows the coal ash to continually pollute our lake. Pollution is pollution, whether it is "contained" or not. We need cleanup, not containment. While the drinking water may be safe for now, that time is limited if no action is taken. Please take care of this, require cleanup - for the good of the present and the future.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Pompi, Eric [eric.pompi@bankofamerica.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR/Duke Coal Ash Settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Thank you for your service to the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Services. I am writing you to share my concerns with the proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy regarding the coal ash ponds at Mountain Island Lake from the Riverbend Steam station.

I have lived on Mountain Island Lake for seven years, and think it is one of the Charlotte areas best kept secrets. The natural resources that my three children are able to enjoy in the Mountain Island area while boating, kayaking and swimming in the lake are truly a treasure that should be nurtured and protected. While I know that mankind has not always been the best steward of these natural resources, I always took some level of comfort knowing that the water my children were swimming in was being used as a source of drinking water for Mecklenburg County.

My concern with the proposed settlement is that it does not do nearly enough. This settlement will not stop the pollution of the lake and groundwater in the area, and will also leave a significant amount of coal ash remaining in the lagoons that are very close to the lake. The significant flooding along the Catawba River this past year has demonstrated how tenuous the earthen berms used to separate the coal ash from the lake truly are.

I have previously worked for an electric utility and am fully aware that the coal ash problems is something the entire utility industry will have to deal with in the near future. That said, there has to be some action to clean up this pollution instead of years and years (*and years*) of more studies while the pollution continues (and expands). We use the phrase "Obligation to serve" often when describing an electric utilities duty to serve its customers. We need to have an addendum added that with this obligation to serve comes an equal "Obligation to Clean Up the pollution created while serving customers...."

Please hold a public hearing on the settlement proposal so the voice of the public can be heard.

Thank you for your consideration and support of this request

Sincerely,

Eric Pompi
12030 Matthew Martin LN
Charlotte, NC 28216
(704) 393-9679

This message, and any attachments, is for the intended recipient(s) only, may contain information that is privileged, confidential and/or proprietary and subject to important terms and conditions available at <http://www.bankofamerica.com/emaildisclaimer>. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete this message.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mark Levi [mlevi720@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend ash ponds

I'm writing this email in hopes that it helps hold Duke Energy accountable in a real way for the pollution they have caused and continue to cause along the Catawba River chain and Mountain Island lake in particular. DENR has years of proof that Duke has polluted Mountain Island lake in a real and illegal way. We do not need more studies and a small fine levied, we need real fines and a cleanup before much worse pollution occurs. Before a final decision is reached, hold a public hearing, present all the facts and let the public not only hear them, but weigh in on the situation. This is a public lake and close to a million people depend on it for drinking water and recreation. This is not the time for closed door meeting and deals. Bring this out into the public eye and enforce the laws that are meant to protect us all.

Thanks

Mark Levi
704-957-4656
9524 Windygap Rd
Charlotte, NC 28278

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cara Zinno [caraprice1974@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:55 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M

Dear Lisa,

I live on Mountain Island Lake and I am requesting that a public hearing take place on the proposal so our community is able to voice our opinion. It is a shame and Duke Energy is extremely unethical in the way they are handling this settlement. This is our earth to care for and this is the drinking water for many, many people in Charlotte. This has the potential to devastate many generations to come if not properly addressed and settled. Thank you for your time, I appreciate it.

Sincerely,

Cara Price

Sent from Yahoo! Mail for Windows 8

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dhstoughton@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:16 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: overlook@braesael.com
Subject: Proposed Coal Ash Settlement with Duke Energy

August 14, 2013

Dear Ms. Palmer,

My wife, Janice Stoughton, and I are residents in the Overlook Subdivision on Mountain Island Lake and own a home with water front on the Lake. We are submitting our strong objections to the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and N.C. DENR regarding Duke Energy's coal ash ponds at Mountain Island Lake that is pending before the North Carolina State Court.

We are frankly dismayed and perplexed that DENR would support such an ineffectual and meaningless settlement. The proposed settlement does nothing to clean up coal ash pollution at Mountain Island Lake. The proposed settlement only asks Duke Energy to submit more information regarding the seeps and ground water contamination at Duke Energy's coal ash ponds. However, these problems are well documented and have been known for years.

The proposed settlement allows Duke Energy to continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake and groundwater that will eventually reach the Lake.

The settlement leaves millions of tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, which is the drinking reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities.

The settlement only includes a token fine of \$36,000 that would forgive years of illegal pollution by this multi-billion company.

As North Carolina citizens, we want an effective and just resolution of this very important environmental risk to the health and safety of the general public and the Mountain Island water reservoir for an estimated 860,000 people.

1. We want a public hearing on the settlement proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
2. We want any settlement to require Duke Energy immediately to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
3. We want Duke Energy to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and to store it safely in a lined landfill.

We trust that DENR will do what is right and support a settlement that takes action now and ensures that this serious environmental risk is not left to linger to plague future generations.

Respectfully submitted,

David H. Stoughton
Janice R. Stoughton

12576 Woodland Cove Court
Charlotte, NC 28216

Phone: 980-207-0339

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kerry Hutton [kerry@gizmogear.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Duke Settlement regarding Riverbend Steam Plant

Dear Lisa Palmer,

I am writing to you as a citizen of Gaston County as well as a resident of the area below the Riverbend Steam Plant. I have lived on the lake for over 12 years with my husband, three grandchildren and a mother-in-law just up the street. Our home is located within 2 miles downstream of the Riverbend Steam Plant directly on the lake.

I feel the currently proposed settlement with Duke regarding the unlined coal ash ponds is severely lacking and inadequate for the protection of our water supply on Mtn Island Lake. We have significant concern not only for recreation but more alarming is the potential for the damage that could be caused to our water supply if there is a breach in the coal ash ponds at Riverbend Steam Plant.

As a resident who would be directly impacted by issues of the unlined ponds I would ask your consideration for:

1. A public hearing so that we can voice our concerns regarding our neighborhood and water supply.
2. Move to get a solid commitment (in a timely manner) from Duke on a SOLUTION to this problem.
3. Addressing immediate issue of numerous leaks in the existing ponds
4. Removal of current coal ash to a safe dry storage and lining of existing ponds.
5. Concrete plan to dismantle and remove the current structure from the site of Riverbend Steam Plant.

The Riverbend Steam Plant has give Duke and other companies many many years of profitable service. But as in Boy Scouts, everyone should pack out what they pack in. Duke is responsible for addressing the removal of the coal ash. We ask they not be indifferent to the danger these ponds present to the surrounding communittee of Stonewater, The Bend and the over 860,000 people who's lives rely on this waterway to survive.

Your consideration in this issue is much appreciated.

Sincerely,



Kerry M. Hutton

314 Horseshoe Lake Dr Mt Holly NC 28120

[Kerry@gizmogear.com](mailto:kerry@gizmogear.com)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Linda yahoo Mail [lindalesniak3@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake

Please consider a public hearing to hear our voices that keeping Mountain Island Lake clean is so important to us and our children.

Thank you,

Linda Lesniak, MIL resident

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Linda Hamrick [lindy0501@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy needs to clean-up the coal ash

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I want to enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Thank you,
Linda Hamrick
Resident of Mount Holly, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Valerie Reynolds [vsreynolds@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pond Closures

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to request that Duke Energy be required to close the coal ash ponds in NC to prevent knowingly contaminating surface waters that serve as drinking water sources for residents. Please know that I don't make this request blindly. As a NC resident and energy consumer, I know that ~50% of our electricity is generated by coal-fired power plants. As a geologist and former professor, I also am aware of the various steps (discovery, extraction, transportation, burning, and storage) by which the use of coal for electricity (and other purposes) harms both the environment and human health. The demonstrated leakage of coal ash sludge into Mountain Island Lake, specifically, is only one means at one location. This problem is guaranteed to become more severe as small leaks become larger and occur more frequently. The massive negative impact of the Kingston ash spill in TN

The first sentence of the NCDENR's mission statement is to protect NC's environment and natural resources. Coal presents a challenge because we rely on it so heavily, yet it is THE biggest source of air pollution and contributes more than any other factor to global warming. I realize that the coal ash contamination into Mountain Island Lake is seemingly minor. I know that the ponds are leaking. I know they will continue to leak. I also know that there are strategic limits (e.g., drinking water standards) designed to protect the environment and human health. However, I believe that the NCDENR is being short-sighted in its decision not to require Duke Energy to do everything in its power to prevent further contamination of the drinking water resource relied upon by nearly a million people.

However,

Please Help Stop Mountain Top Removal Coal Mining
<http://www.ilovemountains.org/>

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Graham Carling [graham.carling@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:30 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Catawba River Settlement

Dear Ms Palmer,

As a resident living on and drinking from the waters of Mountain Island Lake I feel it is imperative that the correct action be taken around the coal ash remaining from the power plant.

Leaving the coal ash where it is simply invites a disaster for the health of all those who rely on Mountain Island Lake for drinking water, let alone the environmental impact and harm to the marine and plant life.

Please ensure that the coal ash is safely removed and disposed of in a dry state in a lined land fill where it will not cause further harm.

Best regards

Graham Carling

12471 Preservation Pointe Drive,

Charlotte

NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Arthur Scott [arthurscott11@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake

Ms. Palmer,

As a resident on Mountain Island lake that participates in water sports on and in the lake, I am very concerned about Duke Power and how they have not taken action to clean up and maintain appropriate levels of pollution from the River Bend plant.

Please add my concerns to others speaking out on this important issue.

Thank you,

Arthur Scott.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: JM [jmillchef@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Make Duke Energy clean up their coal ash

I am disappointed that I even have to take time out of my day to write this. I am urging you to make Duke Energy clean up their coal ash waste immediately.

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: stella duffy [eautumncrow@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:38 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: proposed settlement regarding the toxic coal ash lagoon pollution on the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake

Aug 14, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. stella duffy

2911 Alabama Ave

Durham, NC 27705-2603

(919) 471-4691

Palmer, Lisa M

From: beststressless@carolina.rr.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:29 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: from Ellyn Kirschner--Charlotte NC resident--meeting your August 14th deadline re:do-NothingSettlement and Duke Energy and DENR

Importance: High

August 14, 2013

Dear Ms. Palmer,

We need a settlement that has Duke Energy clean up its pollution. The proposed settlement deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and ground water. The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies, rather than being responsible for the cleanup. Both DENT and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it.

I would appreciate a Public Hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard. It is timely that the pollution of Mt. Island Lake cease, and that specific action is taken to end the delays. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to THE DRINKING WATER RESERVOIR FOR 860,000 PEOPLE and for future generations.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION,

ELLYN KIRSCHNER

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Seth Gartner [sgartner@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:22 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Riverbend ash

Lisa,

I live on Mt Island Lake (Duke subsidiary development: Crescent), swim in the lake, and drink the water as a resident of Mecklenburg County. I would think we all agree the continued storage of ash will only lead to more problems as we go forward. It could even be catastrophic such as with the TVA power plant ash pond dam failure. Why can you not have Duke Energy clean up the mess they made at the site before it causes more contamination than we already have? Time will not make it any better.

Seth Gartner

Charlotte, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: julia rankin [jmonet2@att.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution

As a citizen of Asheville, I am outraged at Duke/Progress Energy. Progress spent huge amounts of money on making cleaner what was coming out of its smoke stacks but failed to mention that it would be dumping toxic coal ash into unlined lagoons along the French Broad River and on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, a drinking water source for over 800,000 people.

This so-called settlement is a disguise, a step on the road to bankruptcy and a settlement that does not fix the problem. The government of North Carolina is supposed to support the health of its citizens, its land, water and air. We demand that the on-going pollution be stopped and that the coal ash be moved to and safely stored in a dry lined landfill. This should be done at the expense of Duke/Progress and not at the expense of the rate payers. It should be forced to clean up its own messes, like the rest of us. I would also like to ask for a public hearing on this critical issue.

Thank you,
Julia B. Rankin

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Amelia Burnette [aburnette@selcnc.org]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 7:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: DJ Gerken; Patrick Hunter
Subject: Comments on Draft Consent Order, State of North Carolina ex rel. N.C. DENR, Division of Water Quality v. Duke Energy, 13 CVS 4061 (Wake County)
Attachments: 2013-08-14 SELC Comments on Proposed Settlement (Asheville Plant).pdf

Please accept the attached comments on behalf of Sierra Club, the Western North Carolina Alliance, Waterkeeper Alliance, and the Southern Environmental Law Center. Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have questions or concerns.

Regards,

Amelia Burnette

Amelia Burnette
Senior Attorney
Southern Environmental Law Center
22 S. Pack Square, Suite 700
Asheville, North Carolina 28801-3494
828-258-2023 tel
828-258-2024 fax
aburnette@selcnc.org
SouthernEnvironment.org

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mandy [commongroundofstanley@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 6:56 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy coal ash lawsuit settlement

To Whom It May Concern:

I am Writing in regards to the Duke Energy coal ash lawsuit settlement. As an environmental consultant I know that the state generally does a good job at protecting public water resources but in this instance they have entirely missed the mark. As a volunteer supporting the ongoing research involving the concentrations of pollution in the vicinity of the outfall I have seen first hand how quickly the water from the outfall clogs filters used in sampling, and the marked change in water color as compared to the rest of Mountain Island Lake. As an avid kayaker, I know that the water around Mountain Island Lake and especially the water near the outfall is not an area I would choose to paddle. Lastly and most importantly, as a local resident and parent who's family's drinking water source is Mountain Island Lake, I think that it is asinine at best and border line negligent that that Duke Energy is valued more than my family.

Sincerely,

A Concerned Citizen

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Angie Kuklinski [riverrunners@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 6:53 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments regarding River Bend Steam Station Mt Holly NC and Clean Up

Please note that these are my comments regarding the coal ash ponds at the River Bend Steam Station and the need for Duke Energy to address and clean up these problems.

- It is important to have a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
- Please require DUKES ENERGY to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
- Action should be taken to end delays in addressing the issues at Mt. Island Lake and the coal ash ponds.
- Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DHEM should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 650,000 people.
- It is important for these measures to be addressed to ensure that clean water and safety is ensured for citizens and to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't begin for generations to come.

Christopher Subdubert Resident
Mt.Holly, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: rebecca collett [rcollettphoto@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 6:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke E. and Mountain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer,

This email is to kindly request a public hearing on the proposal for an agreement between Duke Energy and the State of NC regarding Mountain Island Lake. Please do all you can to stop the pollution of this lake, as it affects the 850,000 or more people who drink and use water from the Catawba River. Please take action to end the delays. For public health and safety, Duke Energy should be required to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it in a dry state in a lined landfill. Please have Duke Energy and DENR take action to protect our drinking water.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Rebecca Collett
5413 Camilla Drive
Charlotte, NC 28226

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sam Perkins [sam@catawbariverkeeper.org]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 6:30 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on DENR-Duke Draft Consent Order
Attachments: Sam Perkins Catawba Riverkeeper Comments on Draft Consent Order.pdf

Please see attached file.

Sincerely,

--
Lisa Palmer

CONTACT US
Catawba Riverkeeper
PO Box 1000
Catawba, SC 29615
www.catawbariverkeeper.org

Palmer, Lisa M

From: akarson@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 6:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: AKarson@aol.com
Subject: The settlement with Duke.

This settlement does not seem to do anything to help us ordinary citizens who are distressed at the pollution being created by Duke at its Asheville site. We already know (we don't need more monitoring) what's happening to the groundwater and the French Broad River. The coal ash lagoons are already leaking, so why is more monitoring needed about that? More and more coal ash there is just going to worsen a problem that clearly already is substantial. The settlement imposes a negligible fine and allows indefinite delay in the interest of monitoring which isn't needed. Is the evidence of agencies like the WNCA disputed? Is our River Keeper not believed? So much work has gone into this, and we are deeply disappointed. Do the threats they threatened to sue have to be revived? Is that the only way to get effective action? At present it seems like that.

At the least, we need a public hearing in Asheville at which both Duke and those who want serious action can be heard. We want a long-term solution to the coal ash problem and we want clean-up by Duke. We want an end to the delays over this. People's life and health are at stake, and a further delay is absolutely unconscionable and unacceptable.

Please offer the citizens of this city some hope. This proposed settlement is no answer.

Thank you,

Ann Karson.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Skylar Kramer [smshand@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:57 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend Coal Ash Ponds

Hello Lisa,

I am writing to encourage you to make the right decision for the proper handling of the Riverbend coal ash ponds. I am actually appalled to hear of the current state of this situation. Being the large corporation they are, I am amazed that Duke Energy has not taken more of an initiative to resolve this matter internally in efforts to be a respectful corporate citizen and neighbor. It is further appalling that they are not being held accountable for their actions and that there could be significant damage caused not only to the Mountain Island Lake community, but also to the city of Charlotte's drinking water. Please think logically about this situation and take the proper action.

I would hope that you will consider taking IMMEDIATE action. Duke needs to clean up their mess, just as we would expect our neighbors to clean up their own messes. The hazards of the improper handling of coal ash ponds are obvious and proven. Duke has the option to move the coal ash to a lined landfill, which is preferred, or they may choose to line the current ponds in order to protect the surrounding land and water. Please do more than placing a Band-Aid.

I have a baby who just turned one and it is extremely important to me that he grow up in a healthy environment. He should be able to enjoy swimming in this beautiful lake and drink the water without wondering of the dangers. And we as parents should be able to feel good about our decision to live here and raise our child. If we don't see this situation handled appropriately, we will consider our alternative options for our choice in communities.

Thanks for your serious consideration.

Skylar Kramer
resident of MIL

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sally Kneidel [sally.kneidel@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:42 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Sally Kneidel
Subject: settlement by DENR that lets Duke continue to pollute Mt. Island Lake

Hello Ms. Palmer:

I'm a biologist and a writer. I was very disturbed to learn about the DENR-Duke settlement that simply calls for more study, when the pollution from Duke's coal-ash ponds at Riverbend is already well-documented.

The settlement suggests an appalling lack of concern for public welfare and natural resources by DENR.

It also demonstrates the stranglehold that Duke Energy has on our state government, including DENR.

As a frightened citizen, I am calling on DENR and Duke to hold a public hearing on the proposed settlement. Let the public have a voice in our own health and future!

Please stop the coal-ash pollution at Mountain Island Lake immediately -- it may not be your drinking water, but it is mine and my family's. There's no legitimate excuse for allowing the pollution to continue.

Please force Duke Energy to move its high-risk coal-ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it in a lined landfill, in a dried form that won't leak.

Please don't allow corporations to control our state and our health. Please.

Thank you for accepting comments.

Sincerely,
Sally Kneidel, PhD

424 Bertonley Avenue

Charlotte NC 28211

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Diane McClure [diane@mcclurefamily.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake Coal Ash Ponds

Mountain Island Lake is the water supply for the Charlotte region. I would expect the most strict enforcement of this precious resource. Once it's polluted, it will never be the same. My children swim in this lake and I don't want to find out later that it made them sick because Duke got away with not following the law. A small fine of just \$36,000 is nothing to a company that earns millions in profit each year. It is cheaper for them to pay the fine than to pay for the cleanup necessary.

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't draw out for generations to come.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Alma Alston [alston.alma@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up Mountain Island Lake

The residence of Mountain Island Lake has been very patient and cooperative with Duke-DENR in regards to resolving the clean up and continued dumping of ash into Mountain Island Lake.

I am appealing to you to please understand the urgency of ensuring clean water and air in our community; therefore, I am counting on you to ensure that dumping waste and to clean up the waste that has already taken place be resolved.

Sincerely,

Alma Alston

Palmer, Lisa M

From: diane strahm [dlgstrahm@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution oft Island Lake

Stop the pollution! Please consider the population that you are affecting in your continued pollution of Mt. Island lake a d surrounding river.

Let the voice of the people be heard. The same people that use the lake as drinking water for Charlotte.

It is a slap in the face of this community for Duke to be fined a paltry \$36,000 fine for years of abuse.

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jacksonjordan@netzero.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:57 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Settlement between Duke Energy and NC DENR

I am writing to oppose the proposed settlement with Duke Energy. We live on Mountain Island Lake and often go kayaking and hiking around the lake. We have seen some of the coal ash ponds and were horrified that this is being allowed to happen since this is the source of drinking water for the Charlotte area. Duke should be held accountable and forced to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and instead put it in a landfill which has been lined to protect the land and water from pollution. I would like a public hearing so the public can learn more about this situation. We need to make Duke take action now for the safety of current and future generations.

Sincerely,

Beth Jackson-Jordan

11324 Canoe Cove Lane

Huntersville, NC 28078

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mary Bickerstaff [mxbmar@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:58 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Draft Settlement between NC State government and Duke/Progress Energy

Dear Ms. Palmer, I want to voice my vigorous opposition to the draft settlement. There is sufficient research data to support immediate action by Duke/Progress Energy to remove the 1964 and 1982 coal ash ponds above I 26 and the French Broad River from the present "high hazard" rating before we have a disaster like the Kingston Power Plant in Tennessee in 2008. John Bickerstaff

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Maggie Ullman [MULLman@ashevillenc.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Julie Mayfield; Kelly Martin
Subject: Fwd: Coal Ash Resolution
Attachments: 20130814153127166.pdf; ATT00001.htm

Lisa, please see the attached public comment from the City of Asheville.

Thanks,
Maggie Ullman
Chief Sustainability Officer
City of Asheville

PS- Please excuse brevity and typos, sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Tom Downing <TDowning@ashevillenc.gov>
Date: August 14, 2013, 3:48:40 PM EDT
To: Maggie Ullman <MULLman@ashevillenc.gov>
Subject: FW: Coal Ash Resolution

Maggie,

Please find the coal ash resolution attached.

Thanks,

Tom Downing
City Manager's Office & Mayor's Office
Administrative Assistant
City of Asheville, North Carolina
828-259-5604 City Manager's Office
828-259-5600 Mayor's Office

70 Court Plaza
PO Box 7148
Asheville, North Carolina 28802
TDowning@ashevillenc.gov

Π Think Green! Please do not print this e-mail unless necessary
The Asheville Way: Continuous Improvement, Integrity, Diversity, Safety and Welfare, and
Excellent Service

-----Original Message-----

From: no-reply_General-Admin@ashevillenc.gov [mailto:no-reply_General-Admin@ashevillenc.gov]

Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:31 PM

To: Tom Downing

Subject:

This E-mail was sent from "RNP18B906" (Aficio MP C4000).

Scan Date: 08.14.2013 15:31:27 (-0400)

Queries to: no-reply_General-Admin@ashevillenc.gov

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Shannon Armstrong [shannonharmstrong@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake and Duke energy.

Hello. I am a resident of Mount Holly in Gaston County and live in the Stonewater community on Mountain Island Lake. I am also a mother of two young children and have my elderly in-laws, who live in the same neighborhood. The safety of our environment and of Mountain Island Lake is very important to me...and many others.

Please stop the pollution of our lake...of our drinking water!!

Please allow a **public hearing on the proposal** with Duke/DENR so the public's voice can be heard.

Please seriously consider having the removal of the coal ash ponds to a more safe, properly lined containment.

Thank you!

Shannon Armstrong, RN, BSN

Holistic Health Coach & Nurse Educator

704-619-2798

[Simply Rebalance](#), founder

Healthy Lifestyle Designing and Coaching

Find me on [Facebook!](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jenny Edwards [jedwards@danriver.org]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:41 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Comments - Proposed Settlement - DENR/Duke Energy
Attachments: Coal Ash Comments.docx

Dear Lisa,

Please accept the attached letter as a comment on the proposed coal ash settlement between DENR and Duke Energy.

Many thanks,

Jenny Edwards
Rockingham County Program Manager
[Dan River Basin Association](#)
336-339-6169

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Nancy Nicholson [nancyenicholson@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Cleanup

To whom it may concern:

We who are deeply concerned about the earth on which we live, and hopefully our future generations, ask for a public hearing about cleaning up the coal ash polluting Mountain Island Lake and others.

Please give this the attention it deserves.

Sincerely,

Nancy Nicholson

--

Nancy E. Nicholson

nancyenicholson@gmail.com

704-377-9273

www.OptimalHealthCharlotte.com

Peace within. . .Peace between. . Peace among . . Peace beyond. Virginia Satir

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mike North [mikenorth@windstream.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:32 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Ponds

Ms. Palmer, I have lived on Lake Norman for 13 years and have been aware of the controversy over the coal ash ponds for some time. I also have been a Duke Energy shareholder and have witnessed the company's success over the years. Duke Energy is disgracing itself (as is DENR) by doing little or nothing to remove the coal ash ponds from around any lake. The poorly lined (or less) lagoons are cheap, old school methods of dealing with a toxic, messy, substance. Duke has plenty of money to take care of this coal ash mess properly and responsibly, if they had any ethical bone in their body. DENR employers seem to be too scared by our very "un-environmental" state leaders to take a proper stand and demand Duke clean this mess up, or DENR can contract someone to remove this poison and backcharge Duke Energy the cost. Please have the courage to do what is right and necessary.

Thanks, Mike North
Mooresville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Pauline Self [junatuna@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:36 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbed coal ash ponds

As an individual who owns land with coal on it, I am still against polluting Mountain Island Lake with the coal ash ponds at Riverbend. This is my drinking water and that of my grandchildren! Yes, the fine for Duke was a slap on the wrist. There must be more done to prevent pollution of the lake. You have my voice and vote to make things right!

Pauline Self

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sara Behnke [sebehnke@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Settlement with Duke Energy on coal ash

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a Mountain Island Lake resident, I am very disturbed by the proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy. This settlement allows Duke to continue to pollute Mountain Island Lake, our drinking water, as they have for nearly a century. I would like to see the millions of tons of coal ash at the Riverbend site moved to a dry, lined storage site. This action should be immediate to protect Charlotte's drinking water and the lake. Instead the proposed settlement calls for more study instead of clean-up. Duke and DENR both know about the pollution in the lake and have done nothing to stop it. And this settlement was discussed without any public comment. As residents and taxpayers who live near the lake and drink the water from it, we should have a say in what happens! A fine that boils down to \$36,000 is a slap on the wrist to Duke and a slap in the face to taxpayers and citizens like me. I know I also speak for many of my neighbors who feel the same way.

To summarize:

* We want a public hearing on the proposed settlement to the public's voice can be heard.
* We want to know the contents of the settlement between Duke and DENR.
* We want to know what will be done to protect the drinking water of the people of Charlotte.
* We want to know what will be done to protect the drinking water of the people of Charlotte.
* We want to know what will be done to protect the drinking water of the people of Charlotte.

Thank you,

Sara Behnke
Resident, Mountain Island Lake
2013-08-14

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Paul Nitsch [pnitsch@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke and DENR clean up your coal ash mess NOW!!!

Dear Mrs. Palmer,

Please send this to the appropriate person as soon as you can.

Polluted drinking water slowly but surely kills us, our families, and Mother Nature with all its creatures.

Is this what you want??

If you live around here it will slowly but surely kill your family too. The neurotoxin Fluoride in our drinking water just "puts the top on the i." Please get informed about all these things. It is in the best interest of your family too if you care to be healthy or not. There is a reason why the US is such a sick nation. A lot depends on what they dump into our drinking water!

Thank you!

Charlie

We need a settlement that gets Duke to clean up its pollution, not a settlement that asks for a study of it.

Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash in large unlined lagoons right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The coal ash is separated from the lake only by earthen berms that leak hundreds of thousands of gallons of polluted water into the Lake and groundwater. Based on years' worth of data documenting these problems, DENR stated in its filing that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

What's wrong with the proposed settlement?:

- The Duke-DENR deal **does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater** – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake and groundwater that will eventually reach the Lake.
- The Duke-DENR deal **leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for**

Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities those systems serve.

- The Duke-DENR deal **only requires more studies instead of cleanup**, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it.
- The Duke-DENR deal includes **only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution** by this multi-billion dollar company.

Tell DENR and DUKE:

- You want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Witt, Pamela [pamela.witt@ncdenr.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:21 PM
To: NCDENR.DENR.Division-Directors.and.Support-Staff; NCDENR.DENR.Archdale;
NCDENR.DENR.GSCBuilding.List; NCDENR.denr.gscnrcbuilding.list; DENR-MNS
Subject: FW: Deck 65 Upper Level Exit - Salisbury Street
Attachments: DetailedMap.pdf; ATT00001.c; ATT00003.c; ATT00004.c

FYI.....Please see the information below regarding Deck 65 Salisbury Street exit.

Pamela Witt
NC DENR
Financial Services Division
Purchase and Services
1605 MSC 27699-1605
217 West Jones Street Raleigh, NC 27603
P/919-707-8529 F/919-707-8529

From: Manning, Rebecca E
Subject: Deck 65 Upper Level Exit - Salisbury Street

Please inform your employees that the Deck 65 Upper Level Exit on Salisbury Street is out of service.

Parts are being ordered and we hope the work will be completed early next week. We will let you know as soon as this exit is back in working condition.

Thank you.

Becky Manning
State Parking Division
919-807-2407 ph
919-807-2316 fax
becky.manning@doa.nc.gov
www.doa.nc.gov/parking



Email correspondence to and from this address may be subject to the North Carolina Public Records Law "NCGS.Ch.132" and may be disclosed to third parties.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Marion Welch [rwelch12@austin.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: It's Duke Energy's responsibility!

When my children and grandchildren moved near this power plant they were told that it would be shutting down and dismantled. How could they have imagined that Duke Energy would be so cruel and selfish not to remove their dangerous leavings with them!! This is so morally reprehensible that I have no other words to describe it. This is so wrong! Must companies be called to the courts to comply with their simple civic and moral duties? I will NEVER vote for another Republican candidate. Marion Welch

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Phillips, Regina [reginap@cityofgastonia.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 4:05 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power Coal Ash Pond Settlement Comments

Importance: High

Ms. Palmer,

On behalf of the City of Gastonia, I would like to request that the comment period on the Duke Power River Bend Steam Station Coal Ash Pond Settlement Agreement be extended. The City of Gastonia provides drinking water to about 100,000 citizens of Gastonia and Gaston County each day from Mountain Island Lake. **The City of Gastonia has only become aware of a proposed settlement yesterday and cannot possibly respond to such a complex issue so quickly.**

Furthermore, we would like to request that a public hearing be scheduled in Gaston County to give those citizens most impacted by any settlement some opportunity to offer their thoughts.

Your assistance in these matters would be most appreciated.

Sincerely,

Ed Munn,
Manager
City of Gastonia

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne MC [armccarthy@comporium.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:48 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Ash Settlement

To Whom it May Concern:

We are writing to express our concerns and alarm regarding the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and the NC DENR.

As documents have already shown, this issue has been studied and reports of violations presented, on the leakage of coal ash residue into the ground and water adjacent to the the unlined Coal Ash ponds owned and "maintained" by Duke Energy. This issue has continued to persist with NO resolution provided or planned by its owner. The time is NOW for Duke Energy to correct this serious water contamination.

The families and children (over 860,000 residents) who rely on the water source at Mountain Island Lake are at risk for health issues over the time it is taking to get this area cleaned up. While I do not live in NC, the issue is regional and not just a state issue. That water continues to flow into my water source at Lake Wylie. While it may be "diluted" the chemicals are still there and the old adage "an ounce of prevention is worth a pound of cure" certainly more that applies to this situation.

Prevention of further pollution is now the mandatory cure by requiring Duke Energy remove the 2.7 million tons of the coal ash to a lined dry area. This proposed settlement does not seek a resolution of this continuing pollution. Duke Energy must be accountable and agree to move the coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake. The EPA has already cited NC as not keeping up with the clean water initiatives it had done in the past. Let this issue be an indication that the residents are getting the **protection required to obtain clean safe drinking water.**

We request this change to the settlement to ensure this contamination problem does not continue to linger.

Sincerely yours,
Anne McCarthy R.N.
Michael J. McCarthy, M.D.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Larissa Via [viali2050@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:48 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: *Please stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake*

Ms. Palmer,

It is not right that Duke should be allowed to pollute drinking water for over 860,000 people without hearing their opinion on the matter. As a concerned citizen of North Carolina, I am asking DENR to please have a public hearing on the settlement proposal for Duke. The citizens of the Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region already have enough problems on their hands with transportation, an ever-increasing population, sprawl, and poor air quality--please don't take away the right for these citizens to have a healthy drinking reservoir.

Sincerely,

Larissa Via
James Madison University B.A.

Writing, Rhetoric and Technical Communication

& Geographic Science (Environmental Studies)

"It is every person's obligation to put back into the world at least the equivalent of what he takes out of it". ~Albert Einstein

Palmer, Lisa M

From: richard.hornsby [richard.hornsby@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR/Duke coal ash settlement

Dear Lisa Palmer,

My name is Richard Hornsby and I'm a resident of Charlotte, NC. I assume you've received a number of comments on the DENR-Duke coal ash deal already, and I'm sure my concerns are similar to or the same as those of other North Carolina residents. Of course, I'm very concerned that the deal does nothing to prevent Duke from continuing to pour contaminated water into Mountain Island Lake. I'm worried too about the millions of tons of coal ash that continue to sit in an unlined pond adjacent to the lake, from which 860,000 people get their drinking water. And I'm frustrated that the deal calls for only a token fine, that it excuses years of documented illegal pollution, and that it mandates merely that further studies be undertaken, rather than ordering Duke to clean up its mess!

What I really hope you will do -- and what I am urgently asking you to do right now -- is to hold a public hearing on this proposal. There is little that is more important to us, the citizens of Charlotte, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other affected communities, than having a source of water that is safe for drinking and bathing. Surely then we should be afforded the opportunity to have our voices heard with regard our concerns about the DENR-Duke coal ash settlement. Thank you for your time.

Richard L. Hornsby

4611-D Hedgemore Dr.

Charlotte, NC 28209
704-605-1538

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Monica Burke [mjb2845@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed coal ash settlement.

Duke needs to be severely punished for the pollution to the environment on the Catawba River Valley. The \$36,000 fine is a drop in the bucket for them. They need to clean up their mess instead of continuing to study it.

Monica Burke

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Connie Miller [connie_mgtc@me.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: sam@catawbariverkeeper.org; Ellen Goff
Subject: Document from My Writing Spot: Connie D. Miller
Attachments: mydocument.txt

Your document from My Writing Spot is attached to this email.

Connie Driscoll Miller
Medical Gas Training & Consulting, LLC
359 Windy Pine Drive
Lake Wylie SC 29710
www.medgatraining.com
connie@medgatraining.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: J B [jessiboyer@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up ASH by Duke

Duke should be held accountable for any ash or other run-off left in our Catawba River system without the public paying for any clean-up for such. It is the right thing to do. Generations depend on what we do now; we all depend on the Catawba.

--

Jessi Boyer 

Mooreville NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: sally coenen [coenen53@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:26 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash

- **We need a settlement that gets Duke to clean up its pollution. I would very much appreciate a public hearing to address this matter.**
- **Duke should stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake, move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.**
- **Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**

Thank you for your

consideration -- Sally Coenen

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Chris Morelli [wylomorelli@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:20 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: stop the pollution of the catawba!

Lisa,

We like a public hearing on the proposal with Duke-DENR about Mountain Island Lake unlined leaking coal ash lagoons. We want our voices heard. We like Duke to stop continuing polluting Mountain Island Lake and be held accountable for past pollution as well. Stop procrastinating with removal of the coal ash ponds. We enjoy our clean drinking water and lake recreation. Imagine the impact from the leaks in the past and present from these ponds or heaven forbid complete failure from these ponds.

Review the link below.

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kingston_Fossil_Plant_coal_fly_ash_slurry_spill

Chris Morelli

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cindy Campbell [Cindy@rentcolumbia.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up

Ms. Palmer,

Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people**.

Cindy Campbell
Lake Wateree

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bernadette Jackson [berdyjackson@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Settlement Agreement

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to ask that you reject the proposed settlement agreement with Duke. Please work with the WNC Alliance and demand that Duke clean up the leaking coal ash lagoons now.

Respectfully,

Bernadette Jackson

Palmer, Lisa M

From: terri david [terri_david@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:09 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pollution

Ms. Palmer,

Any settlement or removal of pollution should stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater, and coal ash should be moved away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake. If the pond fails at the French Broad River, it is predicted that there will be loss of life. Asset agencies such as USEPA supposed to protect the public rather than protect the bottom line of corporations? It seems priorities to protect human life have gone by the wayside. Public hearings on the matter should be

held. People have a right to know just how dangerous coal ash ponds are, and how they might possibly die should one fail.

Terri David
848-928-182

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Laura Knowlson [knowlsonl@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:05 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake and Pollution

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am a resident on Mountain Island Lake and I also have a house in Charlotte. I am very concerned about the water quality of the lake from two perspectives. We drink the water at our Charlotte home which comes from the reservoir at Mountain Island Lake and we have a well at our lakehouse so the quality of the ground water is also important to us.

I am aware of the recent proposed settlement between NC DENR and Duke over the pollution of the coal ash ponds into our beloved lake and find it shocking that so little is being proposed as a solution. A token gesture fine and a promise of further study does not solve the ongoing, illegal and completely socially irresponsible behavior of Duke, nor does it stop the pollution of the drinking water for our entire area. We need these coal ash ponds to be removed entirely from the Mountain Island Lake area.

My questions, still unanswered, are why Duke has such little regard for the lake and the population it serves? Why were these coal ash lagoons not lined adequately to begin with? Why is this pollution being allowed to continue? DENR has already stated that this situation is a serious threat to public health and to our water supplies so why is something not being done about it?

Please allow the public to be heard at a public hearing at the very least. My family lives next to and plays in the lake. We drink the water. Duke has a duty to undo the harm it has already done and stop this contamination going forward. Please hold them responsible and accountable for the sake of the community and the environment we all live in.

Respectfully yours,
Laura Carlevatti
Horseshoe Drive
Mount Holly, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Don Kamb [dekamb@mindspring.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: 'Don Kamb'
Subject: DENR-DUKE COAL ASH SETTLEMENT

I am writing/commenting to request rejection of the proposed settlement on this issue. A public hearing on the proposal is needed so that the public's voice can be heard.

Any settlement must put a stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake, for the area resident and for those downstream. Duke should be made to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a lined landfill. Both Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for area residents and for those downstream.

This situation needs to be dealt with now and fixed, so that the pollution and contamination does not continue and this problem is not drawn out for generations to come.

Don Kamb

dekamb@mindspring.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jessi Clarkson [jessi.clarkson@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mt Island coal ash comments

Please forward to the voices from Duke Energy on this subject:

I will be teaching at a school near the coal ash pond. My mother-in-law worked faithfully for years for Duke Energy. I know that Duke does many wonderful things for our community and has reputable name across the state for it's philanthropy and donations to the arts in Charlotte. This is the time be really serious and reestablish itself as an Energy producer that doesn't leave a mess behind.

This is 2013 not 1973.

We teach our children to clean up after themselves.

Give a hoot! Don't pollute!

How can we teach our children these core values, if a leading player in the nation's energy is willing to give up and not pursue a diligent clean up of this coal ash pond immediately?

Please protect our children's drinking water.

I taught a brave young child last year who educated me about the potential dangers of the coal ash pond. She stood up to the big voices at Duke and has been an inspiration to and to the school and to the Mountain Island community in general.

Please delay no further and remove this carcinogenic mess from our region.

Respectfully

Jessi Clarkson

MS/US Music Teacher

Mountain Island Charter School

Mt Holly, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ellen Goff [eog9612@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Pollution

August 14, 2013

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I am writing to urge DENR to not accept the proposed settlement with Duke Energy over their coal ash lagoons and the serious pollution they are causing.

The ongoing pollution of Mountain Island Lake and local ground water must be stopped and the damage mitigated.

Any settlement with Duke Energy must begin with cleaning up coal ash pollution. Do not allow them to stall by "studying" the situation.

There must be a public hearing on this proposed settlement to allow the public to be heard.

Thank you for your consideration.

Ellen Goff

981 Bonum Road

Lake Wylie, SC 29710

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ellen Goff [eog9612@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Pollution

August 14, 2013

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I am writing to urge DENR to not accept the proposed settlement with Duke Energy over their coal ash lagoons and the serious pollution they are causing.

The ongoing pollution of Mountain Island Lake and local ground water must be stopped and the damage mitigated.

Any settlement with Duke Energy must begin with cleaning up coal ash pollution. Do not allow them to stall by "studying" the situation.

There must be a public hearing on this proposed settlement to allow the public to be heard.

Thank you for your consideration.

Ellen Goff

981 Bonum Road

Lake Wylie, SC 29710

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Costello, Ann [Ann.Costello@asigovt.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:43 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Protect our drinking water -- clean up pollution

The 2.7 million tons of coal ash in large unlined, earthen bermed lagoons right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake threaten the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. Based on years' worth of data documenting these problems, DENR stated in its filing that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

ACTION ... not further study is needed.

What's wrong with the proposed settlement? The Duke-DENR deal:

- **does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater.**
- **leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and others.**
- **only requires more studies instead of cleanup.**
- **includes only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution.**

Take ACTION:

- **Take action and end the delays.**
- **Protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- **Move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.**
- **Hold a public hearing on the proposal.**

Thank you for deeper consideration of the issues and threats to our ground water and water systems.

Ann Costello

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Nadia Luhr [nadia@ncconservationnetwork.org]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: NC Conservation Network - written comments on proposed consent order between Duke and DWQ
Attachments: NCCN Comment - Duke DENR Proposed Settlement.pdf

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I am writing to submit written comments, on behalf of the North Carolina Conservation Network, on the proposed consent order between the Division of Water Quality, Duke Energy Progress, Inc. and Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC for claims related to the Asheville Steam Electric Generating Plant and the Riverbend Steam Station.

The North Carolina Conservation Network's written comments are attached.

Please don't hesitate to contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Nadia Luhr

--

Nadia L. Luhr, Policy Analyst
NC Conservation Network
nadia@ncconservationnetwork.org
919-857-4699 x 107 (p)
919-833-8819 (f)

19 East Martin Street
Suite 300
Raleigh, NC 27601
www.ncconservationnetwork.org

Palmer, Lisa M

From: grizzer2010@yahoo.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:24 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash

I believe that it is long past time for all of humanity to realize that the water that we have now is all that we are going to get. There hasn't been any new stuff for several billion years and there isn't going to be any more. Saying that, we must realize that our water supply belongs to every living being on this earth. Polluting it is pure and simple theft from the rest of us users. Theft of personal property usually results on punishment of the thief. I consider the water on this earth is, along with 7 billion others, my property. It's time to stop the theft.

Sid Smith

Cornelius, North Carolina

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Fawcett, Jeff [Jeff.Fawcett@affiniagroup.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 2:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake / Riverbend

Ms. Palmer, I am a resident in the Overlook subdivision on a waterfront lot on Mountain Island Lake. I am very concerned that even though Duke Energy has "closed" the Riverbend Power Plant, toxic chemicals continue to be emitted into the lake from the coal ash ponds. This is our drinking water and where I swim, boat and live!! Please share my concerns with your organization and continue to pursue Duke Energy to clean up their mess. What's wrong with the proposed settlement? The Duke-DENR deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake the and groundwater that will eventually reach the lake. The Duke-DENR deal leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities those systems serve. The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies instead of cleanup, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it. The Duke-DENR deal includes only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company. What would happen if there was a catastrophic event in this area or a "100 year flood?" The coal ash pond "dam" could easily be breached and MIL water could not be consumed!!

Please work to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake!! It is time to take action and end the delays. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people. I want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't draw out for generations to come.

Jeff Fawcett
4420 Solemn Pointe Lane
Charlotte, NC 28216
jeff.fawcett@affiniagroup.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Randy Miller [hddpinla@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:54 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't Let Duke settlement stand

Dear NC DENR,

PLease don't let your settlement with Duke Energy concerning the Mountain Island Lake coal ash ponds stand without a public hearing to determine how the people of this area feel about the inadequate fine and corrective measures being taken.

Thank you,

Randy Miller - Mountain Island Lake resident

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Debra Demske [debdemske@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy's Coal Ash Ponds

Hello,

I am writing today to urge DENR to do more to clean up their mess. The settlement being negotiated puts public health and safety at risk by allowing Duke to further delay action cleaning up this contamination. Why are we allowing Duke to continue to pour contamination into Mountain Island groundwater? Why are they allowed to leave tons of coal ash where it will leak into our water? And a \$36,000 fine? Really? Really? Really? After all the laws that corporation has broken? It should be more like 360 million just to get their attention.

Protect our water and our health, don't settle for this!!!!

Debra Demske

1206 #3 W. 4th St

Winston Salem, NC

27101

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joe Ogburn [joe.ogburn208@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke-Denr settlement

We have owned property on Mountain Island lake since July 1967, 46 years. In recent years we have seen the water quality deteriorate to the point that many of the fish are not safe to eat. It is documented that the pollution resulting from the large unlined lagoons has directly caused a deterioration in the water quality and will continue to pollute our water supplies until it is cleaned up.

We strongly feel that we need a settlement that gets Duke Power to clean up its pollution, not a settlement that asks for a study of it.

Joe F. Ogburn

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Caroline Martin [rivergirl1@charter.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pond Pollution

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to ask you to support the Catawba Riverkeeper Foundation in their request that Duke Energy clean up the and safely store the coal ash that is seeping into the drinking water at Mountain Island Lake. A public hearing on this proposal is needed to give a voice to the people affected by this pollution. As a nurse, I am very concerned about health issues. Cancer rates in highly developed countries are higher than in lesser developed countries, and this has been attributed to environmental pollution. We can control some of this, and clean water is an essential part of that control. Protecting the health of our citizens is also advantageous to us economically, from reducing healthcare costs to attracting business and people from outside our State.

Thank you for this opportunity to voice my concerns.

Sincerely
Caroline Martin, RN, BSN
Big Sweep Volunteer Coordinator

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Genia Tyson [genia_tyson@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please Stop Coal Ash Pollution!

- TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

As a resident of the lower lake, Lake Wateree, in the Catawba River chain, I am concerned about the pollution and disregard shown by some who work and live in the upper lakes. As stewards of this earth and caring individuals, we must all show concern for and serious regard for what we are doing to our environment and one another. Therefore, I request that a public hearing on the coal ash disposal be held so that the public's voice may be heard. While moving the coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and storing it in a dry state in a lined landfill may be expensive, the cost and detriment to the environment, the drinking water, and ultimately the people would be more. Please act now, without delay, and stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.

Thank you for your consideration of my concerns,

Eugenia Tyson

PO Box 598

Winnsboro, SC 29180

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jim deason [jimd046@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash pond cleanup

I just found out about all of this last week when my wife and I looked into moving to a neighborhood on Mountain Island Lake. After doing a little research I have to say I am totally shocked that the region's water reservoir is located adjacent to such a disaster and has been for so long!! I have grown up in Gaston county and never realized this was going on as I drank out of the faucet for the last 50 years!

On the upside it is exciting to think it could finally be cleaned up and as well should!! I doubt we will relocate to that lake if there is no positive signs of a near future cleanup. And I would certainly spread the word about being cautious what you drink.

I would do anything I could to help in the process of getting this complete plant and ash pond cleanup and area being restored to woodland. It IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO for everyone!!

James Deason

3731 S New Hope Rd

Gastonia, NC 28056

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sandra Doyle [sandyd@charter.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:38 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Toxic Coal pollution

Aug 14, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Please watch this and think about it. It is time that human health and local control count for something...this is an account of some REPUBLICANS trying to take their communities back from corporations up north.

<http://vimeo.com/61778883>

PIELC 2013 Keynote Address by Thomas Linzey of CELDF from cheryle easter Plus 5 months ago /

Thomas Linzey of Community Environmental Legal Defense Fund (CELDF) delivers the keynote address of the 31rst Public Interest Environmental Law Conference (PIELC) held at the University of Oregon in Eugene, Oregon, February 28 through March 3, 2013. Linzey points out the folly of the traditional avenues of redress environmental law has pursued, offering a new model to return democracy to the people currently hi-jacked by a corporate friendly legal system.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Sandra Doyle

19 White Bridge Rd

Weaverville, NC 28787-7323

Palmer, Lisa M

From: mwillis23 [mwillis23@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash ponds

The settlement is ridiculous. My husband and I moved to the overlook at Mountain Island Lake over 8 years ago. We boat quite frequently on the lake and hang out at the sandbar right by the coal ash pond. We did not realize how close we were to the coal ash until we read about the legal actions.

My husband suffered kidney cancer three years ago. Luckily, with the removal of the kidney he has been cancer free. I'm not so lucky. Diagnosed with stage iv lung cancer this year. We're not pointing fingers, just find it interesting that we both came down with serious cancer with no history in either family of cancer or smoking.

Duke should absolutely have to clean up their mess!!! Our beautiful City and Lakes should not have to suffer from their negligence.

Thank You

Jamey and Randy Willis

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mike Thornburg [mkthorn@roadrunner.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy and coal ash pollution on Mt Island Lake

Lisa, I urge NC DENR to take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people** contained within Mt. Island Lake. After years of polluting these waters it is unthinkable that Duke Energy would abandon leaking coal ash lagoons alongside these waters. These lagoons are leaking and will contaminate both the river water and the ground water feeding the river. More studies are needed and action taken to avert this travesty of justice.

Duke enjoys a monopoly via public mandate and as such is required to protect the public which enables its' very existence. Please take action now! Mike

Mike Thornburg
mkthorn@roadrunner.com
704.756.7918 Mobile
704.948.7433 Home

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail message, including all attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, alteration or distribution is strictly prohibited and may violate state or federal law. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail, delete this email and destroy all copies of the message.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jon Perry [jperry@gmi3.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I was just reviewing some of the information on the Catawba Riverkeeper's website that was disturbing about the potential contamination of Mountain Island Lake from coal ash by Duke Energy. I also did some other research and found numerous articles on this issue. If this contamination is happening, or has a good probably of happening, it seems like more needs to be done to eliminate the issue since Mountain Island Lake is the drinking water for probably close to one million people. The containment of the coal ash ponds seems critical and seems not to be happening properly. If there is something that I could do to help, besides just letting you know my concern, please let me know. I live on MIL so this is a close to home concern for me. Thank you for your time. Jon Perry

Palmer, Lisa M

From: klblacknc@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:22 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: clean water

Please help by having Duke clean up our water!!!!

Thank you,

Lynn Black

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jeff.montgomery@wellsfargo.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 1:12 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Catawba River Settlement

Lisa –

I'd like to make my opinion known. I think it's time Duke cleaned up the coal ash ponds at their River Bend facility. Even the possibility of more contamination in Charlotte main drinking water source is too great a risk to not take action. I'd like the opportunity to voice my opinion. Please consider a public hearing on the matter.

Thanks for your consideration.

Jeff

Jeff Montgomery
Data Strategy & Integration
Global Financial Institutions
Wells Fargo International Group
MAC D1053-091
301 South College Street
Charlotte, NC 28202
Tel 704-715-6124
jeff.montgomery@wellsfargo.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Seth Twery [stwery@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M; karen.bentley@MecklenburgCountyNC.gov; Rep. Charles Jeter; Senator Jeff Tarte
Cc: Marrene Twery
Subject: Proposed Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Lisa and elected representatives, I am a long time resident (20+ years) in your respective districts and homeowner on Mountain Island Lake. I would like to voice my displeasure in the proposed settlement of the Duke Energy Coal Ash lawsuits specific to RiverBend on Mountain Island Lake. The settlement is wholly inadequate.

I appreciate negotiated, political resolution to public issues. I understand it happens a majority of the time even with basic public safety issues. I am asking your active participation in this instance to achieve a realistic, results oriented outcome. The 'facts' that I have looked at largely come from the Catawba Riverkeeper organization and Sam Perkins research. It appears solid and reasonably objective to me.

The facts are that the RiverBend Coal Ash ponds are the leading contributor to highly elevated Arsenic and other heavy metal content in Mountain Island Lake. Although the plant is closed there is no plan to remove, contain or inhibit further pollution of our main regional water supply.

My suggestion / request:

- Stop the rhetoric and debate over how much of an issue it is
- Drive the owners, responsible parties to be accountable for a set of actions - over a reasonable time and at a reasonable cost - to eliminate the source of pollution
- Focus on the tremendous economic development opportunity to drive job growth and tax revenues that could be accomplished if the 100+ acres in question is redeveloped over time into a vibrant lake community. Particularly if it is aligned with the 300 adjacent acres owned by Andreas Bechtler who is proposing a large environment friendly development in the same area.

As I understand it, the cost of a complete clean up is something under \$10mil. Although a huge number, it is almost negligible compared to the cost and risk of a massive failure similar to the TVA Kingston Coal Ash pond failure in 2008 which has cost more than \$1billion to date.

Please let's act and not talk. Open to discuss further if you have interest.

Seth Twery
704-277-2506
stwery@yahoo.com
www.linkedin.com/in/SethTwery

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Brian McCarthy [bmccarthy@lutron.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:55 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the Pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Hello Ms. Palmer:

As homeowners near Mountain Island Lake, we are concerned about the cleanliness of the lake water. I have been informed regarding the Duke-DENR deal; it does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake and groundwater that will eventually reach the lake. The Duke-DENR deal leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities those systems serve. The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies instead of cleanup, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it. The Duke-DENR deal includes only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company. There should be a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake. It is time to take action and end the delays. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people. We want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't draw out for generations to come.

Thanks,
Brian

Brian McCarthy
Lutron Electronics Co., Inc.
Sales Director - Lowe's
M - 443-421-3012

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Behnke, David [David.Behnke@VerizonWireless.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: We need a settlement that gets Duke to clean up its pollution, not a settlement that asks for a study of it.

Lisa

It has come to my attention that DUKE and DENR are **NOT** taking appropriate steps to clean up the coal ash ponds at the Riverbend Steam station and continues to slowly poison the drinking water of Mountain Island Lake that supplies the greater Charlotte metro area.

I have see first-hand the leaking, contaminated water that flows from the ash ponds into Mountain Island Lake . **Have you or anyone from DENR?**

This is a no-brainer. Please have DENR and DUKE take the appropriate immediate action to 1) Stop the pollution, 2) Clean their mess, and 3) Preserve this area to the state that it was back in 1920 before Duke contaminated this specific area to our land and water.

Thank you

David Behnke | Global Enterprise Manager | Verizon Wireless
Charlotte, NC
704-995-3533 [IDavid.Behnke@VerizonWireless.com](mailto:David.Behnke@VerizonWireless.com)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mike Paulson [mpaulson@weidmuller.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash at Mountain Island Lake

Hello Lisa,

I am aware that there is a movement that requests that Duke Energy move Riverbend Plant's coal ash storage to a safer location other than an unlined pond next to Mountain Island Lake.

We have seen a catastrophic breach in the TVA, it is not out of the question that this coal ash could harm the Catawba River.

I live on Lake Wylie, enjoy the water and work in the automation and process control industry, especially in the Energy segment. Coal, as an Energy fuel, is the most unclean fuel. We know that Nuclear plants are under construction and many coal plants are closing or being converted to Gas plants. Renewable energy sources are being built at a record pace. This is because we are finally doing something about the problems associated with burning coal at over double the CO2 emissions. Along with these wise and environmentally sound projects and initiatives, we must move fast to clean up existing coal ash storage! Let's avoid a Catastrophe in the Carolinas.

Please take action to stop the seepage into Mountain Island Lake. Please take action by requesting that Duke remove all coal ash from their plant sites. Often, roads can be built with some of this byproduct but at the very least it must be moved far away from our source of drinking water for our fine metroplex known as Charlotte.

Please conduct a public hearing on this matter.

Best Regards,

Mike Paulson
York County, SC
Mobile: 734.658.1121
mpaulson@weidmuller.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Andreas Kisslinger [akisslinger@mac.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:50 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Very concerned over continuation of Mountain Island Lake

Being a resident at The Overlook, I am very concerned over the negligent handling of waste by Duke and DENR. We have recognized a stunning increase of dirt and waste on the water's surface lately, flowing slowly downstream. If this is related to the pollution through coal ash deposits of powerplants nearby, then it has a publicly visible and very obvious effect already. It has affected boats, but seems to be especially dangerous to kayakers, paddle boarders and swimmers - anyone close to, or in, the water. I used to enjoy paddle boarding and swimming in the lake, but was unable to get into the water lately due to massive amounts of dirt and waste flowing with the current on the water's surface. I recognized this last while paddle boarding on the evening of Monday, August 12th, 2013. Hearing that this pollution may come from waste of powerplants in the area, contaminating the water on a continuous basis, we are sincerely afraid to enter the water now. This will affect the real estate market in the area and we are considering to put our house on the market ourselves. Having learned about the pollution of the lake we earnestly consider moving away from the lake areas after all, as the steady current of the lakes might affect Lake Wylie and other parts of the Catawba river system as well. We are highly concerned for the families who remain here, trying to enjoy the lake and waters through various outdoors activities, let alone for drinking water/ground water should it reach those levels as well.

Best regards,

Andreas Kisslinger, Resident at The Overlook Community

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cnuttin@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:49 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Public Hearing

I would like to request a public hearing to review the proposed settlement of the Duke-DENR deal which will not end the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater. As a resident of the Overlook Community I, as well as my neighbors, have some serious concerns about our safety in consuming drinking water from Mountain Island Lake. Thank you.

Charles and Karen Nutting
12693 Overlook Mountain Dr.
Charlotte, NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Greg Padgitt [gregpadgitt@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:36 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake Coal Ash Pond Clean up

To: Ms. Lisa Palmer, DENR and DUKE
Re: Mountain Island Lake Coal Ash ponds and ongoing pollution
From: Greg Padgitt
Mecklenburg County resident (Mt Isle Harbor neighborhood on Mountain Island Lake)
Address: 2902 Shady Reach Lane, Charlotte, NC 28214

My plea is the same as many, many residents who feel neglected and slighted.

- We want **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **We want to Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake!**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- We enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Greg Padgitt
2902 Shady Reach Lane
Charlotte, NC 28214

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cheryl Hecht [checht@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake - Duke Riverbend Power Plant

Dear Ms. Palmer:

Our family would like to request a public hearing regarding Duke Power's Riverbend Power Plant on Mt. Island Lake. Duke Power continues to pollute our lake and is being asked to pay a ridiculously low fine for doing so for many years!

We need to end the delays and work to move the coal ash away to be stored safely in a lined landfill.

Mt. Island Lake is the drinking water for 860,000+ people!

Please hear this request, and take action.

Reinhard & Cheryl Hecht
12517 Preservation Pte.
Charlotte, NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: J S Lyles [jslyles@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: johnhodge@johnhodgelaw.com
Subject: Duke Coal Ash

I object to the proposed settlement with Duke Energy that allows that corp. to not be required to clean up the coal ash it made that is threatening the Catawba River.

Joseph Lyles

155 Rion Circle

Winnsboro SC 29180

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jason C. Hollar [jhhollar2@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Dukes Silly Fine for polluting MIL

As a resident of Mountain Island Lake I'm offended at the silly fine the NCDENR has imposed on Duke Energy for polluting the ground and waters of MIL. This is another example of BIG business fleecing the public for there own gains and paying off the government to overlook the blatant disregard for the environment.

The fine does nothing for the existing problem other than call for a "study". This is a problem that Duke created and should be responsible for in its entirety.

I look forward to additional public forms on this matter.

Jason Hollar

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bill DeYoe [deyoebill@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mt. Island Lake, Duke Clean up

Ms Palmer, I am sure you have received many notes about concerns surrounding the now closed plant and the lack of responsibility that DUKE is taking in the clean up of what has been left behind. I am amazed that anyone could even remotely consider ignoring what is so obviously an immediate and a long term problem and important to thousands of people. Please add my humble voice to the concerns of the public and I ask your help in securing commitment from DUKE that they will fully clean up the coal ash issues, the remains of the building left behind, the land and return the location to a condition even better than they found it almost 100 years ago.

While I respect business of all size, and honor all that they do for the community with their services, employment, taxes, charitable participation and more there is an obligation to take care of what their business wake will cause as they move forward. As my family may have a picnic near the shores of the lake, we go in and use the space we choose and before leaving make sure everything is taken out. We used it up, took the fun equity from the location for the day, and made sure that whatever use it may be needed for next, the space is ready. Is this really all that difficult to understand?

DUKE has made millions/billions over decades from using a space that they own and that is no problem for me in any way. Now they are done with it and they must make sure that they spend a small portion of the benefit they gained to clean it up FULLY!

This is vital Ms Palmer. Please make this a priority, now.

Thank you.

BILL DEYOE
Stonewater Resident

Boat Slip owner

Mount Holly NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Charla Miller [charla.miller@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke cleanup

I am writing to express my concerns over the contamination of Mountain Island Lake. I understand that public comment on the Duke settlement ends today and would like to request a public hearing to go over the issues that I do not feel have been addressed. A \$36,000 penalty and subsequent studies on the issue is kicking the can down the road instead of addressing the pollution and possibility for continued contamination. I live in a development on Mountain Island Lake and my toddler and infant daughters will soon be swimming in this lake and I am very concerned about the safety of the water. I believe Duke should be required to clean up its coal ash lagoons and should not be allowed to use the lake as its private dumping ground. As someone who works for a large corporation, I can say that a \$36,000 penalty is nominal and will not change the practices of a large corporation. In summary, I think Duke should be held to the same standards that I hold my own children - they should be required to clean up their OWN mess.

Thank you,
Charla Miller
Overlook Resident

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Chuck Myers [medeqp@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M; Chuck Myers
Subject: Catawba Cove keeper - Mountain Island Lake, NC - Duke RiverBend Steam Plant

08/14/2013

Lisa,

It concerns be to hear and see that Duke power is shutting down the Riverbend location on Mt. Island Lake.

Without being responsible servants on the land and associated lake, for the clean up from the aftermath of many years of managing the plant and the lake just below the minimum risk levels set by the state. Duke Power has been a good neighbor throughout the many years of operation. However they as a responsible corporation in the state of NC, should be held responsible for the existing conditions that have been allow by law or other entities to collect and contaminate the lake. If I (NC Citizen) were to contaminate the lake I am sure I would be held liable, arrested and or heavily fined and still held financially responsible for the clean up.

Duke should assume the full responsibility of cleaning up all of the grounds associated with the many years of operation. This would include removal of all structures, bricks and motor. As well as cleaning up the leaching seeping coal ash ponds that have been accumulating high metal content and PCB's over the years . Currently which without a sealed bottom to the ponds have been allowed to leach and seep into the lake. Not taking into account that the ponds are above the surface level of the lake and if allowed to deteriorate the dirt dam walls will continue to seep and breakdown into a major issue that would shut down the lake for any water usage for many years, including closing down Charlotte and local water municipalities.

Please note:

1. Capping the ponds will not stop the leaching and seeps for many many years to come
2. Removing the ash down to ground level would work

3. Removing the ash down to ground level and placing a double liner and putting the ash back in the lined pond then capping would also work.
4. Doing nothing but paying a minimal fine one time is not a solution
5. Doing nothing is not a good solution

Boy Scouts are thought to leave no trace take out what you take in plus what ever else you can find on the way out.

I have no easy out solution. DENR and duke Power must come to a well thought out plan and clean up this mess. Fines and waiting to accomplish additional studies only pushes up the risk factor 100 fold.

I live on the lake and work with one of the largest healthcare organizations in NC. This is not good business ethics and will over time only increase the cost of health care in NC. The law suite can be avoided if Duke Power would step up to the plate and make this right. It is the right thing to do.

Lisa please support an acceptable outcome from Duke Power or continue with the suite in all haste.

I would be happy to address all of my concern in a forum or by phone call / email.

Regards,

Chuck Myers

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Loren Hart [lorenhart25@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:02 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Lisa: Please hold Duke accountable.

Hi Lisa,

Please make Duke Energy clean up their messes.

I'm doing what I can. Please do what you can.

Thanks for all of your good work,
Loren

View this email in your browser

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Scott McClure [scott@mcclurefamily.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:01 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: diane@mcclurefamily.net
Subject: The future of Mountain Island Lake
Attachments: untitled-[2]

Importance: High

As a resident of the Mountain Island Lake Area, I'm very concerned about the proposed settlement between the NC DENR and Duke Power. I'm hoping the \$36k fine is just the beginning, as Duke has a responsibility to clean up the coal ash to protect our water supply.

I have relatives in Kingston, Tennessee and would hate to see a repeat.

Please don't let Duke follow the TVA in destroying an important natural resource.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bill Smith (CLT-UM) [Bill.Smith@globeexpress.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:54 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on Coal Ash at Mountain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I'd like to submit comments on the major Coal Ash problem at Mountain Island Lake (MIL). As a frequent recreational user of MIL (fisherman, kayak/canoeing, paddle board, swimming, boating), I am not pleased with Duke Energy's handling of the closing of Riverbend Station and lack of action in removing/cleaning up the coal ash ponds. Those ponds are unlined and a true threat to the City of Charlotte's drinking water. One needs to look no further than the environmental disaster in E. TN a few years ago, caused by coal ash.

I would like to see DENR:

- Call for a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
- To Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
- Take action and end the delays. Immediate action is needed to protect the water reservoir for 860,000 people.
- Require Duke to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Make sure the current major problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Thanks very much for your consideration.

Bill Smith
716 E. Park Avenue
Charlotte, NC 28203
704-343-4969
bill.smith@globeexpress.com

NOTE: This e-mail message contains PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL information and is intended only for the use of the specific individual or individuals to which it is addressed. If you are not an intended recipient of this e-mail, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized use, dissemination or copying of this e-mail or the information contained herein or attached hereto is strictly prohibited. If you receive this e-mail in error, notify the person named above by reply e-mail and please delete it. Thank you.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Alice Battle [avbattle@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:56 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-Duke settlement

Potable water is the most precious commodity of this century. Maximum regulation should be applied to water supplies. Coal ash storage in coal ash ponds do not belong on Mountain Island Lake, the water supply for Charlotte, Mt. Holly, Gastonia and all the other towns supplied by these cities.

This summer of flooding and erosion shows how fragile earthen dams are. So much shoreline has been eroded because of flooding between 102 and 104 for prolonged periods. Duke opened the flood gates on Lake Norman on May 7th. The volume of water was not the only problem. The velocity of the flooding did far more damage than any flooding that had occurred previously. The lake was full of sediment for a week. How close is the lake to a 100 year flood event? Duke cannot be trusted to do what is good for the water or the area.

Saying you are sorry does not ring true when an event could have been prevented. The only way to prevent coal ash contamination of lake and wells on Mountain Island Lake is to remove it and place it in a dry state in lined landfills.

The agreement between Duke and DENR does not address removal or containment. It only has a token fine and more studies, which could take years. Coal ash contains hazardous waste; that is known. It does not take large amounts of chemicals to affect bodily functions, cause disease and neurological problems. EPA standards have been exceeded.

Why is the state gambling with public safety it is established to protect? Why has there not been a public hearing on the disposition of coal ash ponds?

Alice Battle
Charlotte-Mecklenburg resident

Cell: 704-617-7186
Home: 704-392-5361

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kirchmer, Allison J. [Allison.J.Kirchmer@ole.tsa.dhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:48 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-DUKE COAL ASH SETTLEMENT

Ms. Palmer,

I am requesting that there be **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard!

- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**

I do not want the problems at Riverbend to become compounded over time.....they should be fixed NOW without delay!

Allison Kirchmer

4407 Mountain Cove Drive

Charlotte, NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Julia E Patterson [jezell8@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:46 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please Don't Let Duke Do This!

We are in Stonewater and don't want to see any more damage to our beautiful lake, not to mention this is Charlotte's drinking water?

Julia E. Patterson
Marketing
Keller Williams Real Estate
704.827.5321 Direct
610.574.3893 Cell
Jezell8@gmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Renea Crumbley [reneacrumbley@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:45 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash ponds

We believe that Duke Energy should have a time limit for cleaning up the coal ash ponds. It should be completed within the next year to protect the lake and the residents of the lake.

Thank you.

Renea and Tony Crumbley

1509 Mt. Isle Harbor Dr.

Charlotte, NC 28214

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mary Ellen [mcgee.maryellen@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:41 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Settlement on coal ash dumping

I am writing to express my feeling that the settlement reached with Duke Energy concerning coal ash dumping is inadequate. I would like to first have a well publicized public hearing on the proposal. I feel Duke should be required to cease dumping while the proposed study is being conducted. I would like to see something in the settlement that states how you plan to protect the waters around Charlotte, in particular the water that my children and grandchildren will be drinking now and in the future. The proposed settlement is inadequate in protecting the people who live in this area. It is a slap on the wrist to a major company that has knowingly broken the law and therefore I am asking you to reconsider accepting this proposal. Thank you. Mary Ellen McGee

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rick Roti [rickroti@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash settlement comments

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a Charlottean I am keenly aware of the valuable asset we have in the Catawba River and the lake impoundments, especially Mountain Island Lake.

Any settlement with Duke Power that fails to require immediate action to clean up the coal ash storage areas I believe is a violation of your mandate to protect NC surface waters.

I ask that you do not settle and that you proceed with legal action to require Duke to clean up the ash storage areas and properly dispose of this source of pollution and continued risk to our rivers and lakes.

Sincerely,

Richard Roti
7322 Versailles Lane
Charlotte NC 28277
704-957-8660

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Randy Kelley [jrandyk@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on Proposed Coal Ash Settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a resident of Lake Wateree and a customer of Duke Energy, I wish to express to DENR my concern over your proposed settlement with Duke.

The proposed settlement would be inadequate. As a downstream resident and consumer of water that flows through Mountain Island Lake, I and many of my Wateree neighbors want the pollution of Mountain Island Lake STOPPED. There should be a public hearing on this issue, in which case the legitimate concerns of the population throughout the river basin would be very obvious. Duke must be willing to follow SCE&G's recent action on its Wateree River site and move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state lined landfill.

Respectfully submitted,

Randy Kelley
Chairman, Lake Wateree Water Watch

Palmer, Lisa M

From: kevinaltizer@gmail.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:38 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean Drinking Water

I would like to see Duke Energy held accountable for what it has done to the drinking water in our area. They must do whatever it takes to clean this up! Thank you!

Kevin Altizer
3471 Belsouth Dr
Belmont, NC 28012
704-858-4672
CompTIA A+, Network+, & Security+

Palmer, Lisa M

From: bstevens@carolina.rr.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:38 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Catawba River Settlement - Concerns

Ms. Palmer:

As a concerned citizen, resident and Mountain Island Lake property owner I must express my significant disappointment in the DENR settlement with Duke Energy. Not only are Mountain Island Lake and the Catawba River Basin tremendous recreational assets to our surrounding communities, they are a central critical component of our shared ecosystem - vital to maintaining its health and balance now and ongoing.

Several elements of the settlement are insufficient given the magnitude of illegal pollution and lack of issue mitigation by Duke Energy. The low dollar value of the fine being assessed (\$36K) and the absence of any requirement for Duke Energy to further mitigate the risk of further pollution (primarily attributed to leakage from the coal ash ponds) or to finalize planning and begin the cleanup process is unacceptable and irresponsible.

Duke Energy has reaped record profits and recently was successful in pursuing a rate hike to ensure they are positioned to modernize their grid while maintaining their ability to safely, responsibly and efficiently produce energy and maintain their existing assets. In my view, the enhanced risk/issue mitigation and cleanup commencement of the Mountain Island Lake coal ash ponds should absolutely be in scope for Duke Energy's efforts and the state should be taking this opportunity to ensure they do so.

I would be happy to discuss this further in order to ensure a more responsible outcome.

Best regards and thank you for your service on behalf of North Carolina's citizenry!

Bryan Stevens

12524 Preservation Pointe Drive

Charlotte, NC 28216

704.516.5400

Palmer, Lisa M

From: ra shahid [rashahid@att.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:38 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash

It is imperative for our and our wildlife's future health to clean up the coal ash on the Catawba and French Broad Rivers.

Ann Shahid
171 Chrystal Lane
Ridgeville, SC 29472

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jack Lockwood [jack.lockwood1@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:34 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Sam@catawbariverkeeper.org
Subject: Duke-DENR Deal

Dear Lisa:

As a concerned citizen who utilizes the Catawba River Basin in many different ways, I urge you to hold a public hearing on the proposal that directly impacts the health of the Catawba River so that the public voice can be heard. I implore you to put an end to the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and to move Duke's coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and place the ash safely in dry storage in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir of 860,000 people.

It is well past the time to take action and end the delays. Let's take immediate action to protect one of North and South Carolina's most important assets, The Catawba River.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

John Lockwood

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Wendy Spanbauer [wspanbauer@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:32 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Duke/Riverbend Settlement

Ms. Palmer, I am writing to express my concern and disappointment regarding the proposed settlement amount of \$36,000 fine and continued study instead of clean up. The fine amount is so low as to be a complete non-event for a company the size of Duke Power - I'm willing to bet that they pay their lawyers more than this on a weekly basis. I'm not even sure what is the intended purpose/expected impact of such an inconsequential amount? It is obviously not a deterrent as there is no indication of any intent to cease pouring contaminated water into Mountain Island Lake and surrounding groundwater. The NC DENR's own published Principles of Enforcement provide that "regulated entities must be made aware of the conditions for compliance, made to feel the consequences of non-compliance, and provided an opportunity to demonstrate behavior beyond compliance. When enforcement is necessary, it should be fair, focused, visible, and timely." The proposed settlement is a clear, and fairly extreme, failure to follow your own standards. A minimal fine and no requirement for clean up does not in any way cause Duke to feel the consequences of non-compliance and far from demonstrating behavior beyond compliance, they are being given a free pass on complying at all. Not only is this 'enforcement' unfair to the 860,000 people who depend on Mountain Island Lake as their source of drinking water, it is hardly timely (Duke has known about this pollution for years and has done nothing to remedy it). Respectfully, it is very difficult to comprehend how the proposed settlement amounts to an enforcement action at all. It feels to this resident of MIL that Duke is being forgiven without penalty for years of documented illegal pollution and is also being given overt permission to continue to pollute the lake and the groundwater with impunity. The Duke-DENR "deal" (and it really does look and smell more like a collaboration between DENR and Duke than a serious and sincere enforcement action by DENR) leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities those systems serve. How can this possibly be considered progress with respect to this issue or fulfillment of the purpose for which DENR exists?! How can more study be necessary and productive? At a minimum there needs to be a public hearing and some explanation to the taxpayers of how/why a \$36,000 fine and no remediation requirement is the best that DENR can or will do against this multi-billion dollar company. Why isn't Duke being required to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill? Why isn't DENR taking immediate and meaningful action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people? Clean water really should not be in question in a first world country and in the largest city in the State. If this horrible precedent - essentially that Duke is not required to comply with environmental laws and regs - is set, how can we ever expect any other companies to comply? Duke should absolutely not be allowed to reap all of the profits, but not incur any of the costs associated with the process that generates this coal ash. I am required to have my household waste removed and to pay to do so. I fail to understand why Duke isn't subject to the same requirements, especially in light of the fact that Duke's waste has such obvious and extreme deleterious effect on so many others.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cathy Mozingo [cathy.mozingo@n2pub.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:32 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the Pollution

I would like to go on record as requesting a public hearing to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake. Duke Power should move its coal ash away from our Lake to help protect our lake and our drinking water. I want my family to be protected, enjoy clean drinking water and be able to use Mountain Island Lake as a spot for recreation. A public hearing could prevent future problems.

Cathy Mozingo

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Greene, Sonna [sgreene@hunton.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:27 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: SELC Comments to proposed Consent Order for coal-fired facilities

Good morning,

I understand the Southern Environmental Law Center submitted to NC DENR comments on behalf of the Catawba Riverkeeper Foundation, their proposed Consent Order related to the coal-fired facilities.

I did not see a copy of their comments posted on DENR's website. Could you point me to where this would be posted, or if you are able to forward a copy to me, it would be appreciated.

Thanks, and best regards.



Sonna Greene
Sr Paralegal
sgreene@hunton.com

Hunton & Williams LLP
421 Fayetteville Street
Suite 1400
Raleigh, NC 27601
Direct: 919.899.3048
Fax: 919.899.3261
www.hunton.com

This communication is confidential and is intended to be privileged pursuant to applicable law. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify Hunton & Williams LLP immediately by telephone (877-374-4937) and by electronic mail to: help_desk@hunton.com and then delete this message and all copies and backups thereof.



Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rebecca Dunne [rdunne00@email.cpsc.edu]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:18 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Inadequate Settlement!

Duke Energy needs to clean up its coal ash! I find it ridiculous that so little is being done to make our drinking water clean. I cannot believe this is even an argument. I believe in the Riverkeepers and want what they do:

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Please change this settlement!
Rebecca Dunne

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Brenda DeYoe [clubdeyoe@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Coal Ash @ Riverbend

Dear Lisa,

I live in Stonewater just outside of the Riverbend Steam station. I am worried about coal ash problems because Duke will not clean up its property. As you know it has been documented that it is contaminating the ground and river. Please help to stop the pollution on Mountain Island Lake. Its important to do what is right before its too late!

Thank you, Brenda DeYoe

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Peter Santos [peter@pas-law.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comment on Propsoed Settlement with Duke Energy

I am writing to comment on the proposed settlement between North Carolina and Duke Energy ("Duke") in connection with the contamination from the coal ash pond on Mountain Island Lake. I believe the settlement is detrimental to the interests of the citizens of the State of North Carolina for various reasons. Perhaps most obviously, the accusation is that Duke is contaminating the drinking water supply of the largest city in the state yet the only requirement under the proposed settlement is that they study the cause. Instead of giving Duke the opportunity to conduct a study, at the very least Duke should be required to begin removing the cause of the contamination and relocating the coal ash pond without delay. A study can be conducted by them at the same time. In addition, damage of this magnitude should start with a significant fine. At the very least a public hearing on this proposed settlement should be held.

Peter Santos
12619 Preservation Pointe
Charlotte, NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michael P. Jones [mjones3244@att.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:07 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Ms. Palmer:

My wife and I oppose the nominal settlement with Duke to allow for further procrastination by “studying” rather than fixing the coal ash threat to drinking water and recreational facilities on Mountain Island Lake. Do we have to wait until citizens using drinking water from three downstream outlets become sick before responsible corrective action is ordered? Utilities in South Carolina have chosen to spend their resources cleaning up their coal ash pits and protecting their neighbors. Duke prefers to spend their money on lawyers. Please require Duke’s coal ash pits to be removed and the former sites cleaned up and monitored for residual environmental damage. Also strengthen controls over the Marshall Steam Station on Hwy 150.

Thank you for receiving our comments.

Michael P. Jones

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jeff Colyer [jlcjkc@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 11:04 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the pollution in Mountain Island Lake

Please help us in taking action to stop the pollution in Mt. Island lake. Please help organize a public hearing. It is time to hold those responsible for the past and any continuing pollution to be held accountable. I think imposing fines and warnings is not the appropriate step. The time for further studies is long past. Please help make Duke remove the coal ash near Mt. Island lake. Please help ensure that years of pollution of our drinking water ends.

Thank you for your help.

Sincerely,

Jen and Jeff Colyer

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Clark, Paul [paul.clark@ncdenr.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:52 AM
To: NCDENR.DENR.DWR
Cc: Goodwin, Bethany; Young, Sarah
Subject: [DENR.DWR] DENR Sustainability Team July Meeting highlights
Attachments: 2013 July highlights.doc; ATT00001.c; ATT00002.c; ATT00003.c; ATT00006.c

Please find attached highlights from the July 2013 DENR Sustainability Team meeting. Should you want more detail or add'l information, please contact me. Thanks.

Paul
One of the DWR DENR Sustainability Team Representatives

Paul B. Clark
Environmental Program Consultant
Basinwide Unit
Planning Section
Division of Water Resources
(919) 807-6443

"E-mail correspondence to and from this address may be subject to the North Carolina Public Records Law and may be disclosed to third parties"



Before printing this email, please consider your budget and the environment.
If you must print, please print only what you need and save ink with the free [Eco-Font](#).

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Casper, Kimberly [kimberly.casper@twcable.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:50 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Concerned Resident on Mountain Island Lake

Good morning,

I am emailing you with the following concerns in regards to your Duke settlement:

Your deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater and it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake the and groundwater. It leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly. Not immediate action is being taken to clean up the lake, rather the agreement is just calls for more "studies". We need action and we need to stop wasting time as both DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it. The \$36,000 imposed on Duke fine is laughable considering the amount of damage and added potential harm this pollution is causing.

The residents on and around Mountain Island Lake are asking for the following requests to be considered:

- A public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be hear
- Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake
- Take action, end the delays and clean up Dukes mess.
- Move the coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill
- Take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people

Kindly,

Concerned parent and resident on Mountain Island Lake

Kimberly Casper
Partnership Marketing, National



7910 Crescent Executive Drive
Charlotte, NC 28217
Tel (704) 206-6920
Cell (585) 350-9902

Go Green! Print this email only when necessary.
Thank you for helping Time Warner Cable be environmentally responsible.

mail, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying, or action taken in relation to the contents of and attachments to this E-mail is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this E-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately and permanently delete the original and any copy of this E-mail and any printout.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jmlindsey57@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:40 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Duke-DENR Coal Ash Settlement

Ms Palmer,

I am a 23-year resident of North Carolina, living on the Catawba River in Mooresville, North Carolina. I am writing to convey my opposition to the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources.

The proposed settlement over North Carolina's lawsuit against Duke Enrgy for mismanagement of the Riverbend coal ash ponds is insufficient and inappropriate for protecting water quality in the Catawba River. While I believe that the proposed fines represent an inadequate - and I dare say biased - penalty for years of willful mismanagement by Duke Energy, I am most concerned that the proposed settlement does nothing to require removal of the coal ash ponds permanently. The idea that a study is needed to assess the coal ash ponds is irresponsible.

Any settlement with Duke Energy should include a clean-up of the riverbend coal ash ponds.

I would appreciate it very much if my concerns were included in the public records.

Please let me know if there is anything I need to do to make my opinion known and part of the public record.

I appreciate your attention to this and all your efforts in protecting our natural resources.

Regards,

Michael Lindsey

173 Trollingwood Lane

Mooresville, NC 28117

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Price [roosterlp@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:36 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Our Lake....

Hi Lisa –

I am emailing to share my love for Mountain Island Lake and my disappointment with the proposed settlement.

While the fine is not-even-in-the-ballpark that isn't my concern. My concern is that Duke is going to be allowed off the hook.

Similar to my children they need to be held to reasonable standards and those are to clean up your mess. We live, swim, paddle board, boat, drink, enjoy this lake and have for seven years.

When Exxon dumped their oil, they were forced to clean it up – or be the responsible party and have it cleaned.

Duke is still able to contaminate the lake and the groundwater – how can that be acceptable?

For lack of better words they have buried their heads in the ash ponds and never done anything to clean them up.

2.7 million tons of coal ash are leaking into the lakes and groundwater!! Almost a million people drink this water.

What was ok in 1960 is not ok today.

A public hearing need be held – to hold Duke responsible.

We ask each other and our children to do this, we ask that reasonable standards of care be given to each other and our world – why can't we ask Duke the same?

With hope,

Robert Price
Overlook Resident
Lake Lover & Parent.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: sean gay [seanlgay@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 10:27 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M; Gay, Ryan
Subject: coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly

DENR and DUKE Need to finish the job, we have to **clean up there mess.**

We Need **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.

Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake NOW....

It is time to **take action and end the delays.**

Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**

sean gay 4203 overlook cove rd charlotte nc 28216 704.400.8893

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Chandra Taylor [taylor.rachel@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:59 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Request for Public Hearing on coal ash clean up at Mountain Island Lake

Ms. Palmer,

I'm writing you to ask request **a public hearing regarding coal ash clean up at Mountain Island Lake. I want a public hearing on the current proposal. I think** Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people. The state and Duke should act to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake, and Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill

Thank you for your consideration of my comments.

Chandra T. Taylor

919 801 5592

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jack Raker [jackraker@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:56 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake

To Whom It Concerns at DENR and DUKE:

Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.

I want a public hearing on the proposal between DENR and Duke Power concerning coal ash storage so the public's voice can be heard.

Take action and end the silence.

Take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 600,000 people and make sure the problems at Riverhead don't happen for generations to come.

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and all lakes and rivers it calls in a dry state in a land fill.

Thank you,

Jack M. Raker
27 Mountain Rd.
Mountain, NC 28752

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joan Weesies [jweesies@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:56 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Sam@CatawbaRiverkeeper.org
Subject: Riverbed Coal Ash Pond

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a resident of Mountain Island Lake, I am appalled at the deal reached between Duke and DENR regarding the coal ash ponds at Riverbend Steam Station. It is utterly unacceptable, not to mention irresponsible and dangerous, to consider this deal as a "remedy" for the coal ash waste Duke has generated, and allows to remain at that facility. It is well documented that there are seeps into MIL, and the threat of coal ash contaminating the lake is frightening.

It is time to stop delays and take action. More studies, and added water into the ponds are not needed; what is needed is removal of the coal ash ponds entirely. Duke has benefitted greatly from the use of Mountain Island Lake, and it is time to require Duke to take responsibility for the safe disposal of the resulting, toxic waste.

The \$36,000 fine is pocket change to Duke, and more time is NOT needed to study the problem; it has been thoroughly documented that the coal ash toxins are seeping into our lake, and will continue to do so for as long as the ponds are allowed to remain.

Please take the necessary steps to require Duke to safely remove the coal ash permanently from our lake. I am requesting a public hearing so that my voice, and the voices of the 860,000 citizens who rely on MIL for drinking water and recreation can be heard.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Joan D. Weesies

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Chandra Taylor [taylor.rachel@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:55 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M

Ms. Palmer,

You want **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.

- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: John Cottingham [johncottingham96@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:43 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Reform

It is my opinion that the NCDNR is inappropriately addressing the coal ash issue concerning the Catawba River. The goal of NCDNR should be to protect the resources that are all ours with greater fines and more stringent regulation. The idea that NCDNR are in bed together is unexceptable and ridiculous! The idea is to prevent, not remediate upon polluting. Step up and protect our resources, not allow them to slowly be negatively impacted! Do your job NCDNR!

John L Cottingham

4848 Samuel Pinckney Dr

Belmont, NC 28012

Fax: (843)886-5520

Cell: (843)817-8158

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mary Austin [mphaustin@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:41 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash

Please note that I am against coal ash

Plants, ponds, scrubber stacks , all of which contaminate our water, air, sky, And soil. I do follow the reports and am aware that emissions are below state & federal guidelines. I however, feel that any emissions not naturally present In the environment are a violation. I find It shocking, that coal ash ponds would be placed on a drinking water river basin....Unlined....with surrounding private water wells, all present on a small Peninsula in Belmont. Reckless, Criminal behavior with our water, soil, Private wells, and skyline.

Sincerely,

Mary Austin

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rick Huffman [earthdesignrick@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:37 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Pollution

Hi Mrs. Palmer, I strongly urge you to implement measures to get Duke Energy to comply and clean up it's mess. We know the facts of what they are doing to our air and water. We need strong leadership, not another study. Regards, Rick Huffman

Sent from my Windows Phone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Connie Marcantel [mchinarose1948@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:36 AM
To: lisa.palmer@ncdenr.gov.
Subject: Duke Power

Since what they do will not only impact NC but also SC please make them clean up it coal ash pollution. This is just ethical and should be done. The fact that it is trying to be avoided is smelly to say the least.

Connie Marcantel

mchinarose1948@aol.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Russ Leopard [russleopard@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:31 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Ponds

There should be a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.

- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.
- Thanks for your consideration.
- Russ Leopard

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne Yonke [ayonke@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:26 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Re: Duke Energy and DENR settlement

Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake!!!

The Duke Energy and DENR settlement is doing nothing for the health, safety and welfare of our citizens.

We want **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.

It is time to **take action and end the delays.**

Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**

We enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Regards,

Anne Yonke
1214 Salem Drive
Charlotte, NC 28209

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Katie Hicks [katie@cwfn.org]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:20 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Hope Taylor; Grant Mincy
Subject: Comments: Proposed Settlement Between DENR and Duke Energy Progress
Attachments: CWFNC Settlement Comments.pdf

Ms. Palmer,

Please find attached an official comment letter on behalf of Clean Water for North Carolina regarding the proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy Progress.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment,

Katie Hicks
Clean Water for North Carolina
katie@cwfn.org
(828) 251-1291
<http://www.facebook.com/CWFNC>

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Decker Campbell [decker@streamwerx.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:19 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke & Mountain Island Lake

Link

Please do all that you can to get Duke Energy to clean up its coal ash problem. Standing fire and good enough when it is affecting drinking water. Please put a stop to the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater.

Thank you for your assistance in this important health matter.

Decker Campbell

STREAMWERX
Nationwide Aerial Photography/Cinematography
Feature & Documentary Production

(704) 421-3595
www.StreamWerx.com

Like StreamWerx On Facebook
www.Facebook.com/StreamWerx

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Tim Stephens [tstephensrace@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:15 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement MIL

RE: Duke-DENR Proposed Settlement; Public Response

As residents near Mountain Island Lake, avid lake visitors, and lake-supplied drinking water consumers, we are extremely concerned for our health safety and the health of the lake environment if the proposed Duke-DENR settlement is passed. We request a public hearing on the proposal allowing our community's voices to be heard. The technology and capital investment is more than available to Duke Energy to properly remove the coal ash pollution in a timely manor, yet the proposed settlement requires no immediate action to do so. To allow documented pollution into the drinking water source for 800,000 people is beyond unacceptable. The time has come to end delays and to take action. We want our drinking and recreation water source to be clean and void of unnecessary contaminants.

Thank you for your time and consideration of our comments,

Tim Stephens and Rebecca Schell

6204 Pamela St.

Huntersville, NC 28078

TStephensRace@gmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Betsy Dalton [betsydalton7@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:06 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: ash ponds

Duke needs to clean this up. We need all clean drinking water as possible
Sent from Yahoo! Mail on Android

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mark Huguley [mark.huguley@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:05 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M

Dear Ms. Palmer,

This is to register my objection to any agreement between Duke Energy and North Carolina that does not require Duke to clean up its coal ash pollution of the Catawba River near Charlotte and the French Broad in Asheville.

While the sites requiring action are in your beautiful state, it directly influences the environmental health of these waters as enjoyed by your neighbors to the south. Please insist Duke do the right thing for North and South Carolina.

Sincerely,

**Mark Huguley, Commissioner
Richland Soil and Water Conservation District
Richland County, SC**

--

Mark W. Huguley
6740 N. Trenholm Rd.
Columbia, SC 29206
803-360-9729

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lindsey.Triplett@wellsfargo.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 9:02 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: STOP THE POLUTION OF MOUNTAIN ISLAND LAKE

There are so many people that are at risk because of Duke's coal ash dumping. Please allow for a public hearing on the proposal to research the pollution. Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. This isn't a few people trying to make an example of a big company; we are all on the same team.

Lindsey Raggio

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Wendy Kobylarz-Chouvarda [simkha@riseup.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:29 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Must Be Responsible

Dear Ms Palmer:

As a NC citizen and unwitting Duke customer who values my health and the health of the planet, particularly of water and animals, I am appalled by NC's lack of response to the ongoing dangerous pollution by this energy corporation.

Duke must be held responsible for its contamination of our public -- and of personal, private -- lands.

It must not be allowed to delay cleanups, or only be fined a slap on the wrist.

We need a real solution to this company's ceaseless destruction of our natural resources. This solution must include stopping the ongoing pollution of groundwater and it MUST include ending delays, moving dangerous coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and storing it safely in a dry lined landfill.

I also respectfully urge a public hearing on this issue immediately. The public have not only a right to know, but a right to voice our concerns. I am sick that I have to pay a company that is destroying us for my electricity.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Wendy Kobylarz-Chouvarda

Candler, NC 28715

--

"Animals are individuals with a biography, not just a biology." -- Jonathan Balcombe

Palmer, Lisa M

From: StevePath1@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:32 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend Coal Ash Ponds

To Whom It May Concern:

The proposed settlement between North Carolina DENR and Duke Energy regarding the coal ash ponds at the Riverbend Steam Plant in Gaston County is unacceptable. This does nothing to clean up the toxic waste at these unlined coal ash ponds. Duke University and Mecklenburg County have already documented that there is an arsenic problem in Mountain Island Lake and there is no doubt that the source of this arsenic is the seepage into the lake from the coal ash ponds at Riverbend Steam Plant. Allowing Duke Energy to continue to store this waste, which is already leaking into Mountain Island Lake, the drinking water source for 860,000 people, on site is insanity. Recent flood waters this year can only have weakened the earthen berms holding back 2.7 million tons of coal ash from destroying this irreplaceable drinking water source. There is no other backup water source, if these berms fail.

The people of Mecklenburg, Gaston and Lincoln Counties deserve a public hearing, which must be held locally. The pollution from these waste ponds must stop. Duke Energy must relocate the coal ash into a lined landfill and store it in a dry state. This must be done without further delay to protect the health and welfare of a growing human population. I enjoy clean water and Mountain Island Lake must remain undefiled for generations to come.

Respectively submitted,

Steven L. Tracy, MD
1118 Heatherloch Dr.
Gastonia, NC 28054
704-834-2851

Palmer, Lisa M

From: JAMES CHILDRESS [jameschildress371@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 11:57 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Contamination of French Broad River

Under the New rules for Duke Power Co. it is not IF but WHEN the holding ponds will start the inevitable leakage into the French Broad River.

Any New Business that is intested in relocating here is surely doing their due diligence and is aware of this. For Asheville to grow, a pristine water source would be necessary. Not only would Asheville not grow but we would lose some of the businesses we have now Which in turn Asheville would lose a number of residents. So obviously there would be a customer loss for Duke.

The real tragedy would of course be our whole Ecco System and all the life it supports. We must not let this happen.

Sincerely

James H. Childress

10 Mountainview Dr

Weaverville, NC 28787.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: tkbell@earthlink.net
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 11:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Water Reservoir

DENR and DUKE:

08-13-13

- 1.Public hearing is needed on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
- 2.Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
- 3.It is time to take action and end the delays.
- 4.Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- 5.Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Respectfully, T.K. Bell

Palmer, Lisa M

From: JD_Vicci [JD@Vicci.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 10:58 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: PLEASE make DUKE CLEAN UP RIVERBEND COAL ASH

TO: NC DENR

RE: Riverbend Coal Ash pond clean-up

This letter is to request the sincere help of NC DENR to pursue a more socially- responsible and LEGAL settlement with Duke Power in regards to the clean up (ie: contamination removal) from the Riverbend coal ash ponds.

As a resident within 400 steps of Mt. Island Lake, and father of a 1year old son that I hope can enjoy these waters for many years to come, I'm very concerned with the current (paltry) settlement of only a \$36,000 fine...with no plan of action for clean-up of the current, out-dated and very dangerous coal-ash ponds that continue to contaminate the drinking water source for the city of Charlotte. From my research, this seems to be the same type of dam/pond construction that devastated rural communities following the 2008 TVA disaster. Just imagine the media melee' that would occur if this same set of circumstances occurred in the Charlotte drinking water source. This would be a media nightmare not only for Duke—but also NC DENR--for the lack of effort and foresight warranted to prevent such a terrible situation.

I have a boat, so I have easy access to the backside of the coal ash ponds. I have seen the seepage coming down the hill from the coal ash ponds. I have seen the orange-tinted (iron) laden vegetation in these streams coming down the hill from the dam-wall of the ponds. I have paddleboarded down the river channel on the north end of the coal-ash ponds and witnessed water flowing---not after heavy rains, but during hot...and dry days (even after there had been no rain for days—so it wasn't storm run-off—it's SEEPAGE, and not in the area's they have noted as 'seepage/drainage' areas)....I have noticed red/rashy area's on my skin/ankles after walking in the sand in the area below the coal ash ponds. The problem is real.

DUKE NEEDS TO DO THE RIGHT THING AND CLEAN-UP/REMOVE THIS COAL ASH, and eliminate the potential for further contamination. Even since the plant has closed April 11th, the coal ash piles remain—even OUTSIDE the barriers of the ponds. Just piles sitting there, washing into the groundwater with all the heavy rains we've had lately.

- PLEASE PUSH for a PUBLIC HEARING so my, and my neighbors voices can be heard.
- PLEASE TAKE ACTION and push DUKE to DO THE RIGHT THING AND CLEAN UP THEIR MESS...REMOVE THE COAL ASH AND STORE IT IN A PROPER/LINED LANDFILL (and not as wet ash...DRY ash).
- PLEASE PROTECT MY FAMILIES, MY NEIGHBORS AND MY CITIES DRINKING WATER
- PLEASE PROTECT MY SON FROM ACCIDENTALLY INGESTING CONTAMINATED WATER WHILE SWIMMING IN MT.ISLAND LAKE—by REMOVING the THREAT!

This can be a minor cost to Duke to clean up now—or a major cost to Duke, our tax dollars, and the health and safety of our community—and perhaps the cost of lives--if we do not DEMAND they do the right thing and clean up their mess.

With hope that you have concern for the citizens of NC's well-being...

Jeffrey D. Kramer
Overlook Cove Rd
Charlotte, NC 28216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dee Ellis [dee.ellis6@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 10:11 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Steam Plant Settlement -NO

I find it extremely discouraging that Duke is not cleaning up the ashponds at their closed steam plant in Mount Holly. The "proposed settlement" shows a lack of concern for what actually needs to be done. Duke must be held accountable for safely cleaning up the mess at the closed steam plant (not just letting it go on contaminating our water).

I can hardly believe all of the stuff Duke has gotten away with... (e.g., unreported "french drains", false statements about the quality of the water, etc.).

Please add my support for fully rejecting the proposed settlement.

Thank you,

Sally Dee Ellis

104 Cove Pointe

Mount Holly, NC 28120

Palmer, Lisa M

From: John Stephens [jlsiii8548@aol.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:56 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Public Comments on Mt. Island Ash Seepage Issue

To all concerned,

I wish to express my support for moving forward with cleanup measures to the well documented ash seepage issue at Mt. Island Lake.

Key points I'd like to make include:

- What are the minimum standards that would be required in the permitting process if this were a new installation?
- Compare this industrial operation to the stringent requirements that residential construction is subject to on the lake, including septic requirements, runoff and building setback.
- A known source of toxic waste is not a good idea for a public water source.

On the basis of these simple yet straightforward points I am concerned that the pond containment issues would be allowed to continue for any extended period and that proper cleanup measures are not being addressed. I would request that a ruling be reached based on information to date without further project studies.

Sincerely,

John Stephens
1615 Gray Fox Rd.
Iron Station, NC 28080

(704) 740 3309

Former Mountain Island Lake resident an current lake user.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michael Justice [mgjdds@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution

I am incensed at the proposed settlement regarding the continued pollution of ground water and the French Broad River due to leakage from unlined coal ash lagoons. As a student in the early 1970's I first saw and questioned what those huge dump sites were. We were studying the effects of thermal discharge on a fresh water pond/lake as to the biological changes to flora and aquatic life. The first ever National Science Foundation Grant to UNC-Asheville. This storage has only increased and the contamination has grown for some 40 years. How can you ignore the environmental damage, the danger to mankind, in the name of further study? This habit of ignoring the obvious only delays correction and increases the cost of clean-up making even less acceptable. Ignoring the cancer risks of smoking did little to alleviate the reality of the disease. It is time the government held polluters feet to the fire and actually protected the public who elect them! Please schedule a public hearing on this issue and listen to the people.

Sincerely,

Michael G. Justice, DDS

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Shirley Moder [shirley.moder27@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed DENR-DUKE Settlement

Lisa,

I live in the Stonewater community on Mountain Island Lake and I'm writing to express my concerns about the proposed settlement between DENR-Duke. I am deeply concerned about a number of issues. First, I believe it is Duke's responsibility to clean up the coal ash ponds. They created them and it's their responsibility to clean them up. It's the right thing to do. Also, I believe they need to stop the pollution along the Catawba River/Mountain Island Lake, specifically, the unauthorized and unmonitored seepage along the River/Lake from the French tile drains that were installed without permits. Finally, I believe a public hearing on the proposed settlement should be held to allow the community a voice in dealing with this situation.

Thank you.

Shirley Moder

117 Willow Tree Lane

Mount Holly, NC 28120

937.672.4183

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Katherine Marbois-Segall [kmsegall@live.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 8:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M; Katherine Marbois-Segall
Subject: Coal Ash lawsuit

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a resident and citizen of NC, I am appalled at the failure of the state government to uphold existing laws and ignore recorded official data by allowing Duke Energy (formerly Progress Energy) to continue to pollute our French Board River and cause further unknown, possibly irreparable damage to adjacent water wells.

I am sure if individual citizens violated the extant laws, they would not be able to avoid consequences as well as mammoth, lobbying companies do. Who are the politicians protecting? Why are our elected officials failing to carry out the law of the land? Why aren't there appropriate regulations to protect the health of innocent humanity instead of the interests of for-profit businesses?

The government should stop wasting taxpayers money and stop ignoring the health and well-being of the people and the natural resources of this state. Stop allowng Duke Energy (and any business) from destroying our environment, resources and general health.

Sincerely,
Katherine M. Segall

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rob [rlaing@nc.rr.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 7:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the pollution

1. I want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
2. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
3. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
4. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: cpjustice@charter.net
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 7:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pond in French Broad watershed

We are asking for a public meeting to discuss why there has been no action taken to stop the poisoning of the river and surrounding ground water. This ash needs to be in a secure dry landfill with no further ash added to the mess we already have here. We do not need more studies...they already proved what we knew. The heavy metals and carcinogens are leaking into surrounding areas.

We count on this agency to align itself with truth and protection of our environment, of which water is the most precious. I am sure you have to walk a fine line in your position, but please do not forget the taxpayers who depend on you.

Most sincerely,

Dr. and Mrs. Michael Justice

21 Park Rd

Asheville, NC 28803

Palmer, Lisa M

From: kknightline@aol.com
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 7:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Oppose proposed coal ash settlement

The proposed coal ash settlement is inadequate. Please modify the settlement to include cleanup and steps to prevent continuing leaking. Allowing Duke Power to only investigate the leakage is only allowing contamination to continue.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Terry and Laura Knight
PO Box 351
Penrose, NC 28766-0351

828.577.5389

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert E. Rutkowski [r_e_rutkowski@att.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 7:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Cleanup Duke Energy's Coal Ash Pollution at Mountain Island Lake

To: N.C. Department of the Environment and Natural Resources, Division of Water Quality, Attn: Lisa Palmer, 1617 Mail Service Center, Raleigh NC 27699-1617
lisa.palmer@ncdenr.gov

Re: Cleanup Duke Energy's Coal Ash Pollution at Mountain Island Lake

The Southern Environmental Law Center today submitted comments to showing that the proposed settlement of illegal pollution by Duke Energy at Mountain Island Lake does not clean up the pollution, violates the law, and fails to deter illegal pollution by Duke Energy and others. The proposed settlement should be revised to require cleanup of the pollution and comply with laws protecting groundwater and drinking water reservoirs.

This proposed settlement does not stop Duke's illegal pollution or clean it up. The settlement violates North Carolina and federal law. And it sends a signal to big polluters that they can violate the law without serious consequences.

Mountain Island Lake on the Catawba River in Gaston County is the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people living in Mecklenburg County, Charlotte, Gastonia, and Mount Holly. At its Riverbend plant on the banks of the lake, Duke Energy stores 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined lagoons that discharge pollutants into the groundwater and that leak into the lake. Testing by the Catawba Riverkeeper has found arsenic, cobalt, iron, and manganese in the illegal discharges.

The suit that is the subject of the proposed settlement began when the Southern Environmental Law Center sent a required notice under the Clean Water Act to Duke and DENR informing them that it would bring an enforcement action within 60 days for Duke's illegal pollution. Right before the 60-day period expired, DENR brought an enforcement action in state court, the first time it had brought such an action against Duke for its Mountain Island Lake pollution. DENR and Duke proposed a settlement after the Southern Environmental Law Center moved to intervene in the state's enforcement suit. On Friday, the court granted the motion to intervene and made the Catawba Riverkeeper a party in the suit.

Protect the Catawba River and the region's drinking water. Government and the polluter must do the right thing. The illegal pollution must be stopped and cleaned up, to protect the river and the drinking water reservoir.

Thank you for the opportunity to bring these remarks to your attention.

Yours sincerely,
Robert E. Rutkowski

cc: House Minority Leadership

2527 Faxon Court
Topeka, Kansas 66605-2086
P/F: 1 785 379-9671
E-mail: r_e_rutkowski@att.net

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Monica Embrey [monica.embrey@greenpeace.org]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 6:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Petitions on Duke Energy's Coal Ash Pollution
Attachments: Division of Water Quality Petition.xlsx

Dear Ms. Palmer,

In addition to the letter sent earlier today on behalf of Greenpeace, I wanted to send along 360 petition signatures from people who are concerned about Duke's pollution from toxic coal ash from the Riverbend and Asheville Steam Plants.

Please find the language of the petition below and the signatures attached.

Thanks again for your consideration in this matter.

Monica Embrey

Title: Tell Division of Water Quality to make Duke Clean Up Their Mess!

To: The Division of Water Quality of the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Duke Energy should be required to clean up the ash ponds at the Riverbend coal plant in Charlotte, NC and the Asheville coal plant in Asheville, NC. The proposed fine of \$99,000 is not good enough for North Carolinians and it does not go far enough in protecting our drinking water and our beautiful waterways.

We demand:

1. A public hearing on the proposed settlement for the public to make their voices heard.
2. That the Division of Water Quality make Duke Energy stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater and violations of Clean Water Act.
3. That the Division of Water Quality make Duke find a long-term solution for disposing coal ash that doesn't pollute the groundwater, the French Broad River, and Mountain Island Lake.

Now is time to take action and end the delays!

--

Monica Embrey
Greenpeace Field Organizer

First they ignore you, then they laugh at you, then they fight you, then you win.” ~Gandhi

Greenpeace NC

516 E. 15th Street Suite 6
Charlotte, NC 28206

membrey@greenpeace.org

office: 919-324-6508

cell: 773-419-0963

skype: monica.embrey

twitter: [@NCGreenpeace](#) [@monicaembrey](#)

Facebook [Page](#) and [Group](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: George & Suzy Johnson [gandsjohnson@frontier.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 5:15 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Public Comment on Proposed DENR-Duke Coal Ash Settlement

NCDENR's primary mission is "to protect North Carolina's environment and natural resources" which includes regulating "the impoundment and disposal of coal ash to protect public health". Against these criteria we find the proposed Coal Ash settlement with Duke Energy to be seriously deficient for the following reasons:

- Documented, active risk to public health: There are nearly 3 million tons of coal ash in large unlined lagoons on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people in the Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The coal ash is separated from the lake only by earthen berms that leak hundreds of thousands of gallons of polluted water into the Lake and groundwater. Based on years of data documenting these problems, DENR stated in its filing that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State."
- Does not require action now: The proposed settlement asks for more assessments of the seeps and groundwater contamination at Duke's Riverbend coal ash lagoons at Mountain Island Lake, but these problems are already well documented and have been known for years. DENR has already said under oath that this pollution is illegal and a threat to public health and our water supplies. The law requires action **now** to **stop** the coal ash pollution.
- Requires a minimal (meaningless) fine for documented, persistent disregard of coal ash regulations, including unpermitted seeps into Mt. Island Lake and nearby groundwater. This fine is below the amount required to disclose to shareholders.

This proposed settlement looks really bad to thoughtful citizens who are aware of the good that DENR and Duke Energy have done in this region. At the very least it looks misguided. At the worst it looks like collusion to hide or undervalue a known and documented public risk in which those responsible for regulation and those responsible for generating power safely are not doing their jobs. And those who should be protected are bearing the costs of preventable pollution.

We strongly request that

- A public hearing be held on the proposed settlement
- The proposed settlement be strengthened to
 - Immediately stop the unpermitted coal ash seeps into Mountain Island Lake and additional absorption into groundwater
 - Require Duke to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill
 - Take all necessary actions to protect the drinking water of those who depend on Mountain Island Lake as their supply source

- Impose a significant financial penalty worthy of the ongoing infractions that have occurred

The results of failing to act responsibly now could be catastrophic in the future (e.g., coal ash pond collapse in Tennessee). The costs of prevention are far less than the costs of disaster which include serious health consequences, big fines, cleanup expenses, damage to reputations and large loss of public confidence.

George and Suzanne Johnson
233 Magnolia Drive
Nebo, NC 28761
Catawba River Basin

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Claire Tiernan [tiernanclaire@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 5:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution in Asheville

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I have read several articles and letters to the editor in the Asheville Citizen Times about the settlement agreement our state has come to with Duke Energy Progress over their leaky coal ash ponds in Asheville. This agreement is an outrage!! Not only is Duke Energy producing tons of foul energy with coal burning, it's doing nothing to secure the unlined ponds that hold tons of toxic, wet coal ash. As you well know, these ponds lie near residential homes, businesses and the French Broad River. The ponds have a "high hazard" rating, leak harmful toxins into groundwater in violation of state law, and harm streams and rivers with a million gallons a day of polluted water from the bottom of the coal dam in violation of the Clean Water Act.

Duke Energy executives and lawyers could care less about the harm their coal operation and ash ponds cause to the environment and citizens who live and work in the area. They don't live there so they can just go on polluting. The ash ponds are a disaster that have been harming the environment for decades. But Duke Energy with its powerful lobbyists in Raleigh get away with it. It's immoral and irresponsible.

I understand that the settlement agreement is not final. The agreement needs some teeth to force Duke Energy to clean up and secure its ash ponds not only in Asheville but in other cities as well.

Sincerely,
Claire Tiernan
North Carolina Resident

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Linda Smathers [lindasmathers@hotmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 5:05 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy's Coal Ash Pollution

We need a comprehensive solution for Duke Energy's continued pollution of groundwater. They must stop delaying and begin moving the toxic coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake to a safe storage area within a dry lined landfill.

I strongly urge you to set up public hearings on this important issue.

Thank you.

Linda Smathers
14 Trevor's Trail
Asheville, NC 28806

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lynn Lewis [lynnelewis77@att.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 4:56 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: draft settlement agreement-Duke Energy

Hi,
I am a resident of Asheville and Buncombe county. I am writing concerning the draft settlement agreement between the state of North Carolina and Duke Energy Progress. I do not support this settlement agreement, because it does not stop the continuing contamination of the French Broad river by the coal-burning power plant. The financial penalty involved with this agreement is so small that it is ridiculous. Please force Duke to clean up the ground-water and the river.
Thank you.
Lynn E. Lewis
lynnelewis77@att.net

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sidney Bach [smbach@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 4:45 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comment ref. proposed settlement with Duke Energy

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Please accept this as a "public comment" under the applicable law pertaining to the State of North Carolina's proposed settlement with Duke Energy Corp. in the current litigation ref. the defendant power company's failure to comply with applicable Federal and/or State water quality laws and regulations.

For many years, the acts and omissions of the defendant company and its corporate predecessor been and remain notorious and egregious in nature. The facts necessary to support the State's case are already documented and/or can be established by competent and vigorous pre-trial discovery. This case should be pursued to judgment with appropriate enforceable judicial relief, not only in the interest of current public health and safety but also for the obvious benefit of future generations.

There is no justifiable reason at this time to allow the defendant company to perpetuate its unlawful activities (e.g. continuing to dump coal ash into unlined holding ponds located adjacent to the French Broad River while it conducts more "studies" of the problem. This equates to an indefinite "free-pass" for on-going illegal activity without any time constraints imposed as to when compliance begins.

The proposed settlement is either a "cop-out" by those in your department who are responsible for the vigorous enforcement of the applicable law on this subject or the proposed settlement reflects suspect "political influence" by certain State officials whose pressures those responsible in your department are fearful of ignoring lest their careers be put at risk should they attempt to resist such pressures.

Please place this comment of record regarding the proposed settlement and feel free to share it with your colleagues in NCDENR as well as with the Department's Secretary.

Sincerely,

Sidney M. Bach
425 Kimberly Avenue
Asheville, NC 28804

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sam Speciale [sgspeciale@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 3:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pond contamination

We need real solutions to this dangerous and unhealthy situation of toxin leaking coal ash ponds across the state. At least make them lined to reduce adjacent contamination and untoward health impacts.

- Stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater
- End delays, moving dangerous coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and storing it safely in a dry lined landfill
- Please call for public hearings to expose the many problems associated with living near these ponds

Thank you
for your response to my
letter of 7/25/2013

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Karen Bearden [chickadeebirders@earthlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 3:26 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: We need a REAL solution to coal ash pollution!!!!

Howdy!

DENR recently announced a proposal that does **not** stop groundwater and surface water pollution from the coal ash.

There needs to be a real solution that stops the ongoing pollution of groundwater and ends delays. Dangerous coal ash needs to be moved away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and storing it safely in a dry lined landfill.

There also needs to be a public hearing on this very critical issue!

Peace and love for our beautiful Earth,
Karen Bearden

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lib Hutchby [libhutchby@earthlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 3:03 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash ponds

Importance: High

Ms. Palmer,

As you know, North Carolina suffers from having more coal ash ponds than any other state. Surely you are also aware that groundwater is essential to life.

Delays in moving the dangerous coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake for safer storage is like delaying surgery for cancer til the cancer spreads and the human dies. Our rivers are dying and those who drink the water of polluted streams and wells are already sick. Does anyone doubt how Jerry Ensinger's child died? She drank the water at Camp LeJune, as did her mother.

Please use all your influence to protect the public from ongoing pollution of groundwater. At this particular time, I hope you are giving your full attention to the coal ash pond issues and cleaning up the French Broad River.

Thank you,
Lib Hutchby

Mother and grandmother of humans whose source of drinking water in Asheville is the French Broad River.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lib Hutchby [libhutchby@earthlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 3:03 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: P.S. When will the public hearings be held?

P.S. When will the public hearings be held?

I also have family in Mooresville, and one grandson with asthma. If Duke/Progress Energy had to pay all the medical bills for those who have breathed the air they've polluted, what then?

Lib Hutchby
Cary, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Monica Embrey [monica.embrey@greenpeace.org]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 2:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Coal Ash Settlement Between DENR and Duke Energy Carolinas
Attachments: Greenpeace Letter to Ms Lisa Palmer DENR DWQ.pdf

Dear Ms Lisa Palmer,

Please find attached comments on the Draft Consent Order noticed for public comments by the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources, Division of Water Quality as it relates to the action filed against Duke Energy regarding the illegal ground water contamination and unpermitted seeps from the Riverbend and Asheville Steam Stations' coal ash lagoons.

If you have any questions or comments on the above comment, please feel free to reach me at the number or email below.

Thank you,
Monica Embrey

--

Monica Embrey
Greenpeace Field Organizer

First they ignore you, then they laugh at you, then they fight you, then you win.” ~Gandhi

Greenpeace NC
516 E. 15th Street Suite 6
Charlotte, NC 28206

membrey@greenpeace.org

office: 919-324-6508

cell: 773-419-0963

skype: monica.embrey

twitter: [@NCGreenpeace](https://twitter.com/NCGreenpeace) [@monicaembrey](https://twitter.com/monicaembrey)

Facebook [Page](#) and [Group](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Howarth [robflow@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 2:02 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash from Duke Energy Progress

I concur whole-heartily with Hartwell Carson's commentary published in the Asheville Citizen-Times, P. 11, 8/11/13. To me NCDENR's kowtowing to Duke Energy Progress is lamentable, sad, and a dis-service to we citizens of North Carolina. To continue to permit violations of NC State and the U.S. Clean Water Act further endangers the health and well-being of our citizens and our ecology. You can't have healthy citizens on a sick Earth!

This situation has parallels to those from the second hand cigarette smoke saga and the atmospheric pollution from TVA generation saga - both having consumed years of litigation to finally end in "common sense" decisions that do respect and safeguard the health of citizens and ecology. Why do you at NCDENR delay, postpone, shrink from doing your jobs?

With hope for better, I remain -

Robert F. Howarth, M.S.E.,

Member, WNC Physicians for Social Responsibility.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: EILEEN SCHNEIDER [ens172001@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 1:45 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up Duke's Coal Ash Pollution of our rivers and lakes!

Ms Palmer,

Please suggest scheduling a public hearing on the proposal to the public's voice can be heard.
Stop the pollution of Mountians Island Lake and the French Broad River.
It is time to take action and end the delays.
Dates should move its coast away from Mountians Island Lake and shore it safely in a dry state in a forest setting.
Date and DNR should show time-to-date action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 800,000 people.
Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Elaine Schneider

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Marcy Lucas [timarsamon@aol.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 1:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy is polluting the lakes and rivers

Dear Ms Palmer,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
1326
1327
1328
1329
1330
1331
1332
1333
1334
1335
1336
1337
1338
1339
1340
1341
1342
1343
1344
1345
1346
1347
1348
1349
1350
1351
1352
1353
1354
1355
1356
1357
1358
1359
1360
1361
1362
1363
1364
1365
1366
1367
1368
1369
1370
1371
1372
1373
1374
1375
1376
1377
1378
1379
1380
1381
1382
1383
1384
1385
1386
1387
1388
1389
1390
1391
1392
1393
1394
1395
1396
1397
1398
1399
1400
1401
1402
1403
1404
1405
1406
1407
1408
1409
1410
1411
1412
1413
1414
1415
1416
1417
1418
1419
1420
1421
1422
1423
1424
1425
1426
1427
1428
1429
1430
1431
1432
1433
1434
1435
1436
1437
1438
1439
1440
1441
1442
1443
1444
1445
1446
1447
1448
1449
1450
1451
1452
1453
1454
1455
1456
1457
1458
1459
1460
1461
1462
1463
1464
1465
1466
1467
1468
1469
1470
1471
1472
1473
1474
1475
1476
1477
1478
1479
1480
1481
1482
1483
1484
1485
1486
1487
1488
1489
1490
1491
1492
1493
1494
1495
1496
1497
1498
1499
1500
1501
1502
1503
1504
1505
1506
1507
1508
1509
1510
1511
1512
1513
1514
1515
1516
1517
1518
1519
1520
1521
1522
1523
1524
1525
1526
1527
1528
1529
1530
1531
1532
1533
1534
1535
1536
1537
1538
1539
1540
1541
1542
1543
1544
1545
1546
1547
1548
1549
1550
1551
1552
1553
1554
1555
1556
1557
1558
1559
1560
1561
1562
1563
1564
1565
1566
1567
1568
1569
1570
1571
1572
1573
1574
1575
1576
1577
1578
1579
1580
1581
1582
1583
1584
1585
1586
1587
1588
1589
1590
1591
1592
1593
1594
1595
1596
1597
1598
1599
1600
1601
1602
1603
1604
1605
1606
1607
1608
1609
1610
1611
1612
1613
1614
1615
1616
1617
1618
1619
1620
1621
1622
1623
1624
1625
1626
1627
1628
1629
1630
1631
1632
1633
1634
1635
1636
1637
1638
1639
1640
1641
1642
1643
1644
1645
1646
1647
1648
1649
1650
1651
1652
1653
1654
1655
1656
1657
1658
1659
1660
1661
1662
1663
1664
1665
1666
1667
1668
1669
1670
1671
1672
1673
1674
1675
1676
1677
1678
1679
1680
1681
1682
1683
1684
1685
1686
1687
1688
1689
1690
1691
1692
1693
1694
1695
1696
1697
1698
1699
1700
1701
1702
1703
1704
1705
1706
1707
1708
1709
1710
1711
1712
1713
1714
1715
1716
1717
1718
1719
1720
1721
1722
1723
1724
1725
1726
1727
1728
1729
1730
1731
1732
1733
1734
1735
1736
1737
1738
1739
1740
1741
1742
1743
1744
1745
1746
1747
1748
1749
1750
1751
1752
1753
1754
1755
1756
1757
1758
1759
1760
1761
1762
1763
1764
1765
1766
1767
1768
1769
1770
1771
1772
1773
1774
1775
1776
1777
1778
1779
1780
1781
1782
1783
1784
1785
1786
1787
1788
1789
1790
1791
1792
1793
1794
1795
1796
1797
1798
1799
1800
1801
1802
1803
1804
1805
1806
1807
1808
1809
1810
1811
1812
1813
1814
1815
1816
1817
1818
1819
1820
1821
1822
1823
1824
1825
1826
1827
1828
1829
1830
1831
1832
1833
1834
1835
1836
1837
1838
1839
1840
1841
1842
1843
1844
1845
1846
1847
1848
1849
1850
1851
1852
1853
1854
1855
1856
1857
1858
1859
1860
1861
1862
1863
1864
1865
1866
1867
1868
1869
1870
1871
1872
1873
1874
1875
1876
1877
1878
1879
1880
1881
1882
1883
1884
1885
1886
1887
1888
1889
1890
1891
1892
1893
1894
1895
1896
1897
1898
1899
1900
1901
1902
1903
1904
1905
1906
1907
1908
1909
1910
1911
1912
1913
1914
1915
1916
1917
1918
1919
1920
1921
1922
1923
1924
1925
1926
1927
1928
1929
1930
1931
1932
1933
1934
1935
1936
1937
1938
1939
1940
1941
1942
1943
1944
1945
1946
1947
1948
1949
1950
1951
1952
1953
1954
1955
1956
1957
1958
1959
1960
1961
1962
1963
1964
1965
1966
1967
1968
1969
1970
1971
1972
1973
1974
1975
1976
1977
1978
1979
1980
1981
1982
1983
1984
1985
1986
1987
1988
1989
1990
1991
1992
1993
1994
1995
1996
1997
1998
1999
2000
2001
2002
2003
2004
2005
2006
2007
2008
2009
2010
2011
2012
2013
2014
2015
2016
2017
2018
2019
2020
2021
2022
2023
2024
2025
2026
2027
2028
2029
2030
2031
2032
2033
2034
2035
2036
2037
2038
2039
2040
2041
2042
2043
2044
2045
2046
2047
2048
2049
2050
2051
2052
2053
2054
2055
2056
2057
2058
2059
2060
2061
2062
2063
2064
2065
2066
2067
2068
2069
2070
2071
2072
2073
2074
2075
2076
2077
2078
2079
2080
2081
2082
2083
2084
2085
2086
2087
2088
2089
2090
2091
2092
2093
2094
2095
2096
2097
2098
2099
2100
2101
2102
2103
2104
2105
2106
2107
2108
2109
2110
2111
2112
2113
2114
2115
2116
2117
2118
2119
2120
2121
2122
2123
2124
2125
2126
2127
2128
2129
2130
2131
2132
2133
2134
2135
2136
2137
2138
2139
2140
2141
2142
2143
2144
2145
2146
2147
2148
2149
2150
2151
2152
2153
2154
2155
2156
2157
2158
2159
2160
2161
2162
2163
2164
2165
2166
2167
2168
2169
2170
2171
2172
2173
2174
2175
2176
2177
2178
2179
2180
2181
2182
2183
2184
2185
2186
2187
2188
2189
2190
2191
2192
2193
2194
2195
2196
2197
2198
2199
2200
2201
2202
2203
2204
2205
2206
2207
2208
2209
2210
2211
2212
2213
2214
22

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Pat Dunlop [pdunlop@selcnc.org]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 1:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: 'rcooper@ncdoj.gov'
Subject: Draft Consent Order, State of North Carolina ex rel. N.C. DENR, Division of Water Quality v. Duke Energy, 13 CVS 4061 (Wake Co.) and 13 CVS 9352 (Mecklenburg Co.)
Attachments: 08-13-13 Settlement Comments w-Attachments.pdf

Attached is a comment letter on behalf of the Catawba River Foundation in the above-referenced matter. A hard copy will follow via US Mail. Please contact me if you have any questions.

Pat Dunlop on behalf of Frank Holleman
Administrative Legal Assistant
Southern Environmental Law Center
601 West Rosemary Street, Suite 220
Chapel Hill, NC 27516
(919) 967-1450
(919) 929-9421 (fax)
pdunlop@selcnc.org
www.southernenvironment.org

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Louis Parrish [phydeauxlp@hotmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 1:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: The Duke "Cleanup"

Hi Lisa,

This is to say very directly and urgently that I hope the Department of Energy will insist on Duke's promised cleanup of the coal ash sites in N.C. The agreement in place now is surely inadequate, but it's the best we've got for now! With other groups joining in, as the Judge has approved, I hope the requirements can be made more adequate along the way! As a longtime resident of Buncombe County, I am very concerned at how Duke is polluting the French Broad River! I fully am aware of the political pressure your department is under! (And regret it very much!)

Louis Parrish
Swannanoa, N.C.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Butch Turk [butch@wildrockies.org]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 1:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash settlement

Duke Energy/Progress has dumped millions of tons of toxic coal ash into large unlined lagoons along the French Broad River and right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake - a drinking water source for over 800,000 people! These toxic coal ash lagoons have been leaking polluted water into the waterways and groundwater for years.

The DENR's proposed settlement with Duke Energy regarding this dangerous problem:

Does not stop groundwater and surface water pollution.

Lets the utility keep adding new coal ash to unlined ponds.

Lets Duke perpetually delay cleanup.

Includes only a token fine that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar corporation.

We need a real solution that:

Stops the ongoing pollution of groundwater.

Ends delays, moving dangerous coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and storing it safely in a dry lined landfill.

Includes public hearings on this critical issue.

Sincerely,

Larry Turk, RN

PO Box 203

Hendersonville, NC

USA 28793

butch@wildrockies.org

Give anonymously and at no cost to you to hunger, homeless and hungry veterans, autism, child health, diabetes, rainforest, etc. causes just by clicking daily:

<http://www.thehungersite.com/clickToGive/home.faces?siteId=1>

Give anonymously to the nonprofit of your choice at no cost to you every time you search:

<http://www.goodsearch.com/>

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dswansong@aol.com
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 12:54 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please stand up for a real solution to coal ash pollution

Dear Ms. Palmer:

We need a real solution to the coal ash pollution of our groundwater, rivers, streams, and lakes, and we need it now. It is not right for Duke Power to be making money while they continue to pollute our environment and create problems that will last for years and affect us and our children.

Duke Power has the ability and the resources to correct the problem and do it right. They need to be held accountable for the problems they have caused in the past and continue to cause.

Please end the delays and make sure that the clean up and prevention of future pollution is done properly and done right away. The coal ash storage needs to be in a dry lined landfill and it needs to be moved away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake.

Also, please set up public hearings so those affected by this have the ability to learn more about it and to voice their opinions.

Sincerely,
Deborah Swanson

Deborah Swanson, The Caring Realtor
Broker since 1983, WNC resident since 1992
Member, Asheville Board of Realtors & MLS
Phone & Fax: 828-628-4878
Cell: 828-778-4878
dswansong@aol.com

Remember, I appreciate your business & referrals

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Duke Shipman [theshipman@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 12:54 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy

How about lets get real about the dangerous mess that Duke Energy has been allowed to pond along side I40 at the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake. They can be made to clean it up. A large number of people are watching how this will be handled.

--

Life is good

theshipman

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kathie Burton [kburton240@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 11:16 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up Duke's Coal Ash Pollution of our rivers and lakes!

Ms Palmer,

Please support environmental public hearing for the proposed Duke power's siting plan for the
relocation of the Duke power's coal ash storage piles.
It is a hearing that will be held on August 14th and 15th at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles.
The hearing will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles and will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles.
The hearing will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles and will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles.
The hearing will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles and will be held at the Duke power's coal ash storage piles.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kenneth Roth [kenandanne@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 10:51 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash problem in Asheville

Ms. Palmer:

Should concern how personal Data Energy can continue to leak dangerous chemicals into not only the land they own but surrounding areas including the French Broad River; the people of Western NC will suffer avoidable illnesses. It is an all too familiar story of greed and corruption by the people we trust to protect us. That includes "big business" and our own government. Use the science, ethics, science and delay, delay, delay.

Stop it. Stop it now. If we don't and back the end down this road, the day will come when it is too late.
How many people have to go sick? How many people have to die? How much should be concerned as your health?

Respectfully submitted

Kenneth
Roth

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Marlys de Alba [mdala@mindspring.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:49 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke DENR settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer

There needs to be a public hearing on this proposal. Duke Energy and DENR's proposed settlement does nothing to clean up coal ash pollution at Mountain Island Lake. DENR itself has stated under oath that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and causes "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined lagoons on the banks of Mountain Island Lake which is the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The coal ash is separated from the lake only by earthen berms that leak hundreds of thousands of gallons of polluted water into the Lake and groundwater. Based on years' worth of extant data documenting these problems, action needs to be taken to protect this drinking water reservoir for the 860,000 people who utilize it. Further studies will only confirm what has already been proven and are a waste of time and money.

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it in a dry state in a properly lined landfill.

Sincerely,
Marlys de Alba

Palmer, Lisa M

From: LStoreyjr@aol.com
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:42 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash

I wish to add my voice to what I hope is thousands, to protest the acceptance of the danger to our water supply by the power plant in Skyland. Please consider the health of our river and our citizens who live around the plant. L. M. Storey Jr.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Tara Goulet [tara@birdsongbrewing.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 9:49 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke-DENR settlement

Lisa,

What's the point of western civilization without clean drinking water?

As shareholders of Duke Energy and as citizens of Mecklenburg county, we expect you to stop Duke from pouring contaminated water into the Lake and the groundwater that will eventually reach the Lake.

In addition, our business relies on clean water. We produce craft beer for Charlotte residents using Charlotte city water (unfiltered, because we believe that Charlotte has great drinking water), malt, yeast and hops. At Birdsong, we have more than 3,000 loyal customers who take great pride in supporting our hand-crafted, locally produced product.

What action do you propose to take?

Eagerly awaiting your response,

Christopher Goulet and Tara Switter Goulet

Principles, Birdsong Brewing Co. and Charlotte residents

2237 McClintock Rd

Charlotte, NC 28205

--

Tara Goulet
Birdsong Brewing Co.
Charlotte, North Carolina
www.BirdsongBrewing.com
tara@birdsongbrewing.com
office: 704-332-1810
mobile: 336-577-2232

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Eric Sifford [emsifford@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 7:39 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke

Duke has shown North Carolina it has no regard for our environment. Witness the dead lake at High Rock. Get rid of them and stop taking their bribes to make bad legislation. We need strong laws that keep all our utility companies regulated.

Eric Sifford

Palmer, Lisa M

From: patricia medlin [medlinpatricia@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 5:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: NC DENR RESPONSIBILITY

Patricia todd
20 Ascension Dr. Apt B
Asheville, NC 28806

Ms Palmer,

As you must know the residents of WNC and Asheville in particularly, are very much up in arms over reported pollution status of Asheville power plant, own by Duke, Inc. question.....Is there No one in this entire state, be an objective participant, to get this matter "off the fence" and do what needs to be done to remediate this dangerous on going leakage of the well know cold ash Ponds surrounding the plant. This means of process coal to electric is harmfully and seriously old and Known to cause all manner of environmental demise and unknown dangerous harm to wildlife, humans and this planet.

Now that we are aware of this scientific reality, do you not agree, everything humanly possible Be applied to immediately take action on the obvious dangers? How could argument, ligation, And delay be helpful to anyone, including your public image, and your heart when closing your eyes at night.

I demand that the State of NC STAND UP FOR PROVEN SCIENCE AND USE THIS SCIENCE TO ACT ON CLEANING, REMOVING OR INFORMING DUKE POWER TO TAKE CARE THEMSELVES AND CLEAN UP THEIR BACK YARD, FOR YOU ME CITIZENS AND FUTURE HUMAN POPULATION!

P.G Medlin
Native resident NC once proud

Sent from Yahoo! Mail for iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Polly Feitzinger [pollyfeitzinger@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 5:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash pond -

To whom it may concern,

My husband and I moved to Biltmore Town Square, a new urban village in South Asheville several years ago. Previously we had lived 5 miles East of Town Square.

The first winter we noticed that our cars were covered with a fine dust. This was not the case in the other location. We then became aware that we live only 1 mile from the Duke Energy plant and approximately 2 miles from the coal ash pond which Duke Energy has created.

In speaking with other residents, they also have experienced this dust on their cars and told us that in the winter Duke Energy is using coal.

We have noticed that we do not have this problem in the summer months and again we have been informed that this is when Duke uses natural gas.

I would welcome someone from the NC Department of Environmental and Natural Resources to test the dust which accumulates on our cars in the winter months to verify our supposition.

If indeed this is coal dust, we are also inhaling this whenever we take a walk in our neighborhood.

This is disturbing since I suffer from asthma.

I would hope that North Carolina would be pro-active in investigating the health effects of people exposed to coal dust and decide how to address this problem with Duke Energy.

Sincerely,

Polly Feitzinger and Lewis Herron

19 Town Square Blvd. #307

Asheville, NC 28803

828-676-0766

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Martha Boesel [b52martha@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 4:28 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Settlement Agreement

As an Asheville resident and N.C. voter, I urge that the settlement between Duke Energy Progress and the state require an immediate halt to the coal burning power plant's ongoing contamination of the water resources in violation of the Clean Water Act. I would also like to see a more appropriate penalty involved, well in excess of \$60,000 (more like a slap on the wrist than compensation for the damage done or a deterrent to future violations.)

Sincerely,
Martha D. Boesel

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Felice Nord [f_nord@msn.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 4:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash agreement

Just want to express that I agree with the many who believe the Duke Energy should be held accountable for the pollution they are leaking from their coal ash storage. It has been reported that the tests to prove this have already be done, so it doesn't make sense that Duke Energy still has to do nothing and more testing needs to be done. Also, the change to allow a business to pollute up to their property lines is completely senseless, e.g. let's let our businesses harm our environment until it affects the neighbor, is completely against the idea of keeping our water, air and soil clean from pollutants. And once something has been contaminated, it's very difficult to correct after the fact. So why are we choosing to wait until something happens, rather than prevent it. Duke Energy should be finding safer solutions, instead of prolonging the inevitable.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jan Garver [jan.garver@charter.net]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 4:06 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Draft Seetlement regarding Duke Energy and the state of NC

Dear Lisa,

I am disappointed to learn that the state of North Carolina is backing down on its suit against Duke Energy in regard to its coal ash ponds off of Long Shoales Road in Asheville. Collected data suggests that the leaking ponds pose a serious danger for citizens, ground water and the French Broad River. It is time to stop this contamination and not just plan to study it. The Clean Water Act suggests that we have a right to clean water both to drink and to enjoy in the river. The water cycle proves that water is recycled by nature. What happens to the water in the coal ash ponds is closely related to what happens to the rest of the area's water. Do your best to get Duke to clean up its Progress Energy pollution before there are dire consequences. Thank you.

Jan Garver

13 Saint Giles Place

Asheville, NC 28803

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Marvin K Ballard [bigman2x4x8@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 3:26 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: settlement with Duke Power

I live about a mile and a half from the Allen steam station in Belmont. Lake Wylie is my home and I see the seeping leakage at the fly ash pits every time I go by the pit. I have watched as our well have become contaminated by the fly ash as I have two friend who live next to the fly ash pond and have had to get new wells dug as there old well were contaminated. PLEASE DON'T let them fool youall into a study and not a CLEAN UP of all these flyash ponds. Being from the South Point area my whole life I have seen Cancer kill more and more of our neighbors here on the Point than other areas in the Belmont region. Class mates who have or have had cancer who grew up on South Point road near the Plant is unforgiveable. We want our water sources the stop having the pollution that is made from the chemicals that are found in the fly ash ponds to be cleaned up.

Thank You for your time and hope you can help the people in South Point Rd area of Belmont NC.

Sincerely Marvin K Ballard III "Chuck", 1520 South Point Rd is where I grew up.
335 Paradise Circle
Belmont, NC 28012
704-214-4551cel?704-825-3606Home

Palmer, Lisa M

From: dixiefisher@charter.net
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 2:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke's coal-fired power plant

Dear Ms. Lisa Palmer

I live a short distance from the Duke Plant and I would like to encourage your agency to withdraw the draft settlement agreement between Duke Power and the state which permits just further study of the coal ash pollution problem. I feel that the coal fired plant and its unlined lagoons are detriments to clean water supply not to mention the hazards of the dams breaking, etc., etc. The state has already sued Duke one time for Duke's violations.

I recently wrote your Director about a column he wrote for the Asheville Citizen-Times. He was in praise of Governor McCorry and believed in what he was trying to do for the state of North Carolina. He said that Governor McCorry said something like "Is it the right thing to do?" whenever your Director talked to the Governor.

I believe withdrawing the settlement agreement to do further study is "the right thing to do." I think the state ought to do more to safeguard our environment regarding Duke Power.

Thank you for your understanding our thinking on the matter.

Sincerely yours,

Dixie H. Fisher

1313 Appalachian Blvd.

Arden, NC 28704

828-687-7876

Palmer, Lisa M

From: julieyoungman@nc.rr.com
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 2:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I am writing in opposition to DENR's proposed settlement with Duke Energy regarding its coal ash lagoons. As I understand it, the proposed settlement is not nearly strong enough for the following reasons:

1. The Duke-DENR deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and neighboring groundwater - instead, it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake.
2. The Duke-DENR deal leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water supply for hundreds of thousands of people in Charlotte, Gastonia, and Mount Holly.
3. The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies instead of cleanup, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it. The deal should, instead, require actual, expedited clean up.
4. The Duke-DENR deal includes only a token fine that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company. The fine should be higher, and, again, Duke should have to actually clean up its mess, NOW.

Accordingly, I believe there should be a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard. I also believe that DENR should not accept any deal unless it involves an end to the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River. Finally, DENR should not accept any deal unless it requires Duke to move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Julie Youngman

Chapel Hill, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Gary & Kathy Harris [g17k14p@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 12:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Asheville plant settlement

I am concerned about the proposed settlement with Duke Energy over the operation of its Asheville power plant.

Under the agreement, Duke receives amnesty for its previous pollution, can continue leaching contaminants into the water, and gets years to further study the problems. In addition, the dollar amount of the imposed penalty is ridiculously low.

This smacks of government and corporate collusion to the detriment of the average citizen. Duke must step up and take responsibility for cleaning up its mess. The fines for current violations should be significantly increased and operation of the plant brought into compliance with law. The cost of all of this must come out of the company's profits and not its customers' pockets.

Sincerely,

Kathleen Harris

54 Dover Ln

Brevard, NC 28712

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Roepnack [bobreepnack@roepnack.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 12:01 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Leaking coal ash lagoon's

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I live in the Asheville area and look forward to the time that I am able to spend enjoying the French Broad River. The proposed settlement agreement that was negotiated between NCDENR and Duke Power should not be accepted. The agreement allows Duke to delay action to clean up the coal ash lagoons that are leaking pollution into the ground water and the French Broad River. Coal Ash is a harmful by product of burning coal and should be dealt with in a proper fashion that protects ground water adjacent river and properties from pollution now and in the future. The added cost to the utilities to treat and dispose of the waste in a manner that protects the environment from any damage should be added to the expense of using coal as a resource for powering the grid.

It is time to develop a long term solution to the issues that are created by burning coal for our energy needs. Please reject the proposed settlement agreement and follow through on the steps that have been initiated by the Western North Carolina Alliance and others to force Duke Power to step up and begin cleaning up the leaking coal ash lagoons now.

Sincerely

Robert Roepnack
Roepnack Structures Inc.
PO Box 18504
Asheville NC, 28814
(828) 545-5363
bobreepnack@roepnack.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carol Aspinwall [onepearl87@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 11:56 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean and Safe Water

Aug 12, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Carol Aspinwall

5430 Nc Highway 87 N

Pittsboro, NC 27312-7284

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Christopher Ammon [rangerammon@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 11:28 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake pollution

Lisa Palmer,

I am writing in opposition to the Duke Energy/NC Department of Environment and Natural Resources proposal concerning the coal ash pollution of Mountain Lake Island. Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash in large unlined lagoons right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The coal ash is separated from the lake only by earthen berms that have and are currently leaking thousands of gallons of polluted water into the lake and groundwater. Based on years' worth of data documenting these problems (see <http://www.catawbariverkeeper.org/our-work/covekeepers/mountain-island-lake/mountain-island-lake-sampling-results>), DENR has stated under oath that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

Here's what's wrong with the proposed settlement:

- The Duke-DENR deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the lake.
 - The Duke-DENR deal leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte, Gastonia, and Mount Holly.
 - The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies instead of cleanup when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have not stopped it.
 - The Duke-DENR deal includes only a token fine of less than \$40,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by Duke, a multi-billion dollar company.
 - • I think there needs to be a public hearing concerning the latest proposal, so the public's voice can be heard. A period of written comments does not go far enough. Furthermore, the pollution needs to be stopped immediately and clean-up needs to get underway. Now is the time to take action. Stop the delays! Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
 - • Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.
- Thank you for your time and consideration of this important issue.

Christopher Ammon
815 Woodside Park Lane
Durham, NC 27704
(919) 943-7340

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Matthew Starr [matthew@neuseriver.org]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 11:26 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Time to act is NOW!

Aug 12, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Matthew Starr

19 W Hargett St

Ste 208

Raleigh, NC 27601-1350

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Pat Stolz [pat.stolz@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 11:17 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop the delays and collusion

Each day I become more and more concerned with the tactics used by our state government on behalf of business rather than its residents, environment and long term solutions. I urge you to reconsider the extended time given to Duke Energy for more studies. It has already been proven that they are polluting the French Broad River delay just allows for more pollution.

Get our of bed with big business and get in bed the what is right!

Bob

828-273-7948

bobstolz@me.com

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: winnie BARRETT [winkiebai@charter.net]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 10:56 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy and the clean water act

What Duke Energy is getting away with is criminal.

How can you continue to allow them to endanger our citizens? this is outrageous. A slap on the wrist will not reduce the damage they are doing.

As a citizen, my health is at risk.

Hold Duke Energy accountable, and stop watering it down.

Winnie Barrett, Asheville voter

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne Connolly [anne625@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 10:03 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to inform you of the deadline this week to express my concerns over Duke Energy's lack of action regarding their destruction of our environment here in North Carolina.

Duke Energy must accept complete responsibility for cleaning up after itself. Immediately. Many of us here in North Carolina joined the lawsuit against Duke Energy for leaking toxic chemicals and heavy metals from their coal ash ponds into our soil, groundwater, and the French Broad River. It does seem to have only been a ploy to get the federal on the lawsuit already being proposed by several environmental groups.

The "agreement" reached between the state and Duke Energy calls for yet more study, although the evidence is already clear that pollution is ongoing. This is simply government and corporate collusion, creating a form of procrastination that can have devastating effects on our citizens' health, our natural environment, and the value of the homes we live.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Anne Connolly

Palmer, Lisa M

From: John Mikkonen [jmikkonen@morrisbb.net]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 9:46 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Ponds

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I have been following the new articles on Duke's coal ash ponds in south Asheville for some time. I find it incomprehensible that the NC and Federal Regulatory Agencies have allowed this leaking of toxic chemicals and heavy metals into the soil, groundwater, and the French Broad River.

This new "agreement" reached between the state and Duke Energy calls for yet more study, although the evidence from past testing is indisputably clear that pollution is ongoing.

What in the world has to happen in NC and this country before we wake up to the realization that this 'spaceship Earth' is our only home. When will federal, state, and local officials wake up to the fact that appeasing big business while harming our planet and the people who reside on it is NOT the right thing to do.

I would love to take my kayak or canoe over to Lake Julian and enjoy a nice paddling experience, but with the monstrosity of the Duke energy plant looming over the lake with all of its polluting effects I can't be sure whether I'd be getting a healthy workout. This is a sad commentary.

I believe that coal-burning power plants will continue to lead us down a climate change path that will eventually have catastrophic results for all of us.

Please DO THE RIGHT THING, instead of the financially-driven thing. Rich power companies won't mean a thing when this planet is no longer inhabitable for people because of pollution and climate change effects.

Sincerely,

John Mikkonen

22 Augusta Ct.

Etowah, NC 28729

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Patrice German [pgerman@comporium.net]
Sent: Monday, August 12, 2013 6:43 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Dukes Coal Ash

Good Morning -

I am writing as a concerned citizen to admonish NCDENR to DEMAND that Duke Energy clean up their coal ash waste NOW and store it safely, not behind an earthen berm that leaks harmful chemicals into a major drinking water reservoir. The settlement which is seeking a study of these problems is nothing but yet another delay on taking action for this environmental hazard which affects thousands of people.

Patrice H. German

Fort Mill, SC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Art Smoker [ansmoker@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 9:57 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

According to DENR's own statements, Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State". Duke should be required to stop the ongoing coal ash pollution as soon as possible and move the coal ash to lined, dry landfills away from the river, as is being done by SCE&G at the Wateree Power Station near Columbia, SC.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

Art Smoker

284 Arrowood Corner Rd.

0

Mars Hill, NC 28754

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jody McClung [odessawellness@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 9:23 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: North Carolinians need solutions that work for coal ash, not more study.

I oppose the proposed consent order for coal ash disposal facilities at Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend Power Stations and request that DENR require Duke to stop polluting North Carolina's groundwater, the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake.

At a time when communities are investing more in protecting and capitalizing on water resources, it seems backwards that DENR would accept this type of toxic water pollution for any length of time. The French Broad has become vitally important to the recreation and outdoor economy in Western North Carolina, and the Riverbend plant's pollution threatens higher water treatment costs for local communities.

Please require Duke to find a long-term solution for coal ash disposal that doesn't pollute public waters, such as dry storage in a lined landfill away from rivers, lakes or streams.

I also ask that DENR provide more opportunities for the public to weigh in on how coal ash is handled in our state. Please hold public hearings near each site to give communities a chance to have their voices heard.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter and your work protecting the waters we all rely on for drinking, fishing and recreation.

Jody McClung

103 Waters Edge Drive

Weaverville, NC 28787

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Diane Amos [dianeamos1@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:45 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Our French Broad river

Please protect our French Broad river here in Asheville, NC with sensible, enforcement of the clean water act. Duke Power and it's awful coal ash has polluted the river, and if nothing else, it's a good business case to enforce this. We have 2 national breweries building here now who are depending on CLEAN and PURE water. Don't settle with Duke Power, - make them clean up their mess!

Diane Amos

46 Courseview Drive
Weaverville, NC 28787

828-645-0359
336-587-1039 (cell)
dianeamos1@yahoo.com

"I choose to be too large for worry, too noble for anger, too strong for fear, and too happy to permit the presence of trouble". From The Optimist Creed.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rosie Eisenberg [rosie.eisenberg.re@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:28 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: French Broad River and coal

Dear Ms. Palmer, How is it possible that Duke Energy is able to dump millions of gallons of polluted water into the French Broad and also pollute our ground water? How are they able to disenfranchise themselves from the Clean Water Act. Is there going to be a catastrophe first before something is done? Duke keeps getting slaps on the hand. PLEASE do something that will make a difference in their unconscionable ethics. FINE THEM BIG BUCKS INSTEAD OF POCKET CHANGE! How can you sleep at night? Sincerely, Rosie Eisenberg.
Asheville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Irene Stoll [stoll.irene@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:03 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Asheville Coal Ash Pollution

I urge you to share my comments with all members of the NC Department of Environmental and Natural Resources as well as members of the NC Government that decide on this issue: the coal-fired power plant in Asheville that is operated by Duke Energy is in violation of the State's Clean Water Act. I urge you to make Duke Energy clean up the coal ash pond and stop polluting the French Broad River.

Thank you,
Irene Stoll
Asheville

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Becca Morris Pullease [bmorrispullease@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:02 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution, Duke Energy Progress Plant near Asheville, NC

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I read the op/ed (aka Guest Commentary) piece in the ACT today and was moved to send my comments as directed by the writer to your attention.

I know this situation is complicated and residents of affected areas always feel...not in my back yard, as it were. That said, I live relatively near the Duke Energy Progress plant and I am deeply concerned that this draft settlement agreement does not stop the contamination caused by the operation of said plant.

So add my name to the list of people who think this agreement needs to be revisited and revised for the better. In other words, I am urging you and your colleagues to do what is right for the health of the French Broad River and clean water resources for the area.

I am sincerely,

Becca Morris Pullease

818-326-9836 Cell

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rick Merrill [merrillr@beverly-hanks.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 5:56 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Asheville

The plan on the table is not a plan of remediation, but rather a plan to plan after yet more study. The key issue is well known and more study is just polluting more French Broad River water. We need Duke to own its problem and fix it. Stop the toxins from going into the public waters. They have no right to pollute and your job is to enforce our right to clean water. If NC cannot do the job, then it may be time to bring in the feds. \

R

--

Rick Merrill

Accredited Land Consultant, Certified Residential Specialist

Beverly-Hanks & Associates

(828) 329-5565 cell (828) 697-3365 desk

Marketing WNC Real Estate since 1971 NC License # 28953, SC License # 72892

View my [profile](#)

Read about [agency](#)

"E-mails sent or received shall neither constitute acceptance of conducting transactions via electronic means nor create a binding contract until and unless a written contract is signed by the parties."

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jan Sochalski [ski04@aol.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 5:30 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy

Regarding Duke energy:

1. I want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
2. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
3. It is time to take action and end the delays.
4. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
5. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Please stop polluting the waters.

Jan Sochalski
Stella,nc

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Douglas Toltzman [doug@oakstreetsoftware.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 5:20 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy's Coal Ash Pollution

Regarding the dumping and storage of coal ash pollution in unlined pits on the banks of the Mountain Island Lake on the Catawba river by Duke Energy: The proposed settlement that would let Duke off with a small fine is not adequate to protect the drinking water of hundreds of thousands of our residents.

At the very least, we need to have a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

It is also imperative that we stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely where it cannot leach into the environment. Immediate action is required to protect our drinking water. A \$99,000 fine is not going to fix anything or protect anyone. In fact, it sets a dangerous precedent.

Thank you, for your time and consideration.

Douglas Toltzman

Oak Street Software, Inc.

doug@oakstreetsoftware.com

phone: (910) 526-5938

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Suzanna Watkins [suzanna.watkins@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 5:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Settlement

Dear Mr. Palmer:

The proposed settlement with Duke Energy, which includes funding additional coal and natural gas power plants in North Carolina, is a public hearing on the proposed settlement for the public to voice their views.

There needs to be

Additional funding needs to be provided for the proposed settlement. The settlement includes funding for the proposed settlement for the public to voice their views.

Duke Energy needs to provide the people and resources of North Carolina. It is time to take action on the settlement.

Sincerely,

Suzanna Watkins

603 Kingsley Drive

Wilmington, NC 27403

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Caroline Ribelin [trailnc@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 4:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power "Settlement" a joke!

How can anyone truly believe that more "study" is needed when 10 years of data already proves that toxins are flowing out of the unlined holding basins at Lake Julian???? The data has shown the toxic plumes advancing for years, the plume does not "know" where a boundary is, it just seeps with the path of least resistance, right into the French Broad River. Good Grief!! You can't legislate a boundary that says the toxin stops here. Environmental protection is being ignored, and this settlement should NOT go forward!!!!

On another note about Duke: In the financial world, there are articles easily obtained about Duke's failed attempt at nuclear power plant construction on the Pee Dee River (I believe) in SC. They lost over 70 Million dollars in this fiasco. To no one's surprise, and the point of the situation is that Duke raised rates for the customers to regain its losses. Corporate greed, most certainly.

At this point, I'm saving up to get off the grid by having solar panels. Less Duke energy is less pollution and coal ash toxins.... gee, pretty simple, right?

Caroline Ribelin

Arden, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Barbara Good [barb_579@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 4:02 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash ponds

I am so outraged that the State of North Carolina has reached a so-called "agreement" with Duke Power to further "study" problems with ongoing pollution in the French Broad River, groundwater and soil by their coal ash ponds. That in spite of all the evidence already available that major pollution is happening. It is vital that Duke take responsibility for and steps toward cleaning up this major threat to the health of Asheville citizens.

Barbara Good
138 Springside Road, #238
Asheville, NC 28803

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Louttit [smilinrobert@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 3:46 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Pollution

Dear Ms. Palmer;

It is hard for me to imagine how the state has let Duke Energy escape the legal requirement that they stop the pollution of the French Broad River and local ground water from their Long Shoals power plant. This problem has already been studied thoroughly, and their coal ash ponds found at fault. Further study seems a clear, and illegal, dodge to let them go on operating without devoting any effort to cleanup.

Please correct this problem.

Thank you.

Robert L. Louttit
21 Pennock Place East
Candler, NC 28715

Palmer, Lisa M

From: dixiespal@aol.com
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 2:43 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pollution

Thank you for allowing me to comment on the recent draft settlement, between Duke Power/Progress Energy and the State, that calls for several more years of 'study' of the problem of coal ash unlined ponds. Do we need any more evidence of the damage when one of these unlined pits fails than the disastrous spillover in Tennessee a few years ago?

I am dumbfounded that years of documentation and data that showed that the dams are rated as "high-hazard" would be discounted in favor of this draft settlement. What would more years of study accomplish other than to stall accountability? The problem is now.

Your organization, the Department of Environment and Natural Resources, was established to be a reasonable bridge between businesses and the citizens for the protection of our environment and natural resources. Business can survive regulations that protect their families as well as ours; citizens count on you to be the line of defense for us.

Barbara Coulson

1001 Reems Cove Rd., Marshall, NC 28753

828-683-9354

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jfhubbard@preferredprop.com
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 2:36 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power and pollution

The state of N.C. has sold us out to Duke Progress Energy which seemingly now has permission to foul our waters and endanger the health and lives of our citizens. Big business cares nothing for the

health and welfare of our people and everything for another dollar!

Shame on our state lawmakers!

Yours truly,

Joan F. Hubbard

26 Lorraine Avenue

Asheville, N.C. 28804

Agency Disclosure: North Carolina REQUIRES that a real estate licensee must provide Agency Disclosure before providing property information. These are consumer protection laws that require us to provide you with a Working with Real Estate Agents brochure, review it with you, and determine how you would like to be represented by your agent in your real estate transaction. Please see the link for additional information:

<http://www.preferredprop.com/workingWith.php>

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Phyllis Zak [phylzie1@yahoo.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 1:58 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pollution

We are writing to voice our concerns about the ongoing practices of Duke Energy in regard to the French Broad River. It appears that the state of North Carolina has given a pass to Duke to keep high hazard dams (which barely hold back coal ash lagoons)and to unlawfully continue spewing dangerous pollutants into the river. Eventually, something will go wrong and it will be an environmental disaster, that will affect NC citizens for decades. I know that the recent agreement with Duke was a pretend hand slap, and that much money and political influence went into it. Perhaps in any dialogue involving Duke, state officials could suggest to Duke Energy that they speak with their counterparts who are dealing with the BP oil spill (or any of the other industrialists who have carelessly presided over environmental catastrophes), and find out if it's worth it to take the risk. I believe it would cost much more than \$60,000. There are moral issues here, as well. To harm North Carolinians for the sake of profit is not only criminal, it's sinful. And State officials share the responsibility for anything that happens.

Sincerely,

John and Phyllis Zak
Waynesville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Doug [gdoug67@aol.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 1:56 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution

As an adult educated person I have learned over the years that when I feel my person or my lifestyle is in danger from something or someone I attempt to mitigate the threat. Some of my alternatives might be insurance, modified behavior or study alternatives processes.

Duke Energy is in the electric generating business and as a by product accumulates horrendous amounts of toxic coal ash which it stores in unlined high hazard ponds which threaten the well being not to mention the existence of the French Broad River. The potential for loss is so great to the river, the City of Asheville, The Biltmore Estate, tourism, fresh water and on and on. The loss is incalculable.

I believe Duke Energy should seek more alternative sources of energy and less efforts at distorting legislation in its favor.

Bottom line , Asheville is a successful economic and cultural engine which could easily be destroyed if the coal ash dam on the French Broad River were to fail.

Douglas McDowell

Asheville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Penny Sandonato [pennysandonato@charter.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 1:49 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power

Please hold Duke Power to the responsibility of cleaning up their coal ash ponds.

The thought that an agency designed to help the environment would reduce standards making the environment –and the citizens- less healthy is not acceptable.

Let's not cave in to Big Business money. Do the right thing and make Duke Power take responsibility for cleaning up after themselves!!

*Penny Sandonato
Weaverville, NC*

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Shinesign@aol.com
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 12:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: French Broad River

Duke/Progress Energy deserves more than a slap on the wrist for the toxic brew they're putting into our local French Broad River.

Please protect the health of these mountains and our people by forcing Duke to clean up its act.

It is sad to have a river that warrants concerns when I think about recreational opportunities.

I appreciate you taking the time to read this.
Shiner Antiorio
50 Dunnwood Rd
Asheville, NC 28804

"Whatever you are not changing, you are choosing." ~ Laurie Buchanan

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Susan Bird [birdsusanmn@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 12:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Toxic Coal Ash in the French Broad

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Duke/Progress Energy deserves more than the equivalent of a parking ticket for the toxic brew they're putting into our local French Broad River.

Please protect the health of these mountains and our people by forcing Duke to clean up its act. For the sake of all of us currently living in the area, and generations to come, the health of our water and air is vital.

We know many who enjoy swimming and kayaking in the river, but there is concern about the toxicity.

Thank you,

Susan Bird

North Asheville

[Reply](#) [Reply all](#) [Forward](#) [Print](#) [Print page](#) [Share](#) [Share this page](#)

[Privacy Policy](#) [Terms of Service](#) [Feedback](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Charlotte Moore [moolew@att.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 11:58 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: This has to stop!!!

Importance: High

The draft settlement agreement between Duke/Progress Energy and the state of NC needs not to happen!! There is absolutely no justification for such a ludicrous and unfair settlement for such a monumentally damaging situation!! How can anyone who has any concern for the environment or for the citizens of NC think that this settlement is ok?? Please do all that you can to assure that this settlement does not happen and let us know what we can do to support those who actually want to do something to make the coal ash problem stop NOW!!!

Charlotte R. Moore

Well-being flows with joy, peace, and abundance!

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Susan Taylor [staylor13150@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 11:40 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: toxic coal ash from Duke/Progress Energy

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I've just read two articles about the pollution that Duke/Progress Energy are still dumping. Here's a quote:

"Both the Asheville Steam Electric Generating Plant and the Riverbend Steam Station are coal-fired electric generating facilities. Both facilities have state-issued National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permits that address discharges to surface waters. In addition, both facilities are required to monitor groundwater. The Asheville plant discharges wastewater to the French Broad River, Lake Julian and an unnamed tributary of Powell Creek in the French Broad River basin. The Riverbend facility discharges wastewater to Mountain Island Lake.

At both facilities, monitoring of groundwater at each plant's compliance boundary revealed levels of chemical constituents that exceed requirements for groundwater protection. Also, state water quality inspectors believe that seeps, or releases of liquids not authorized as part of the permitted discharges, have occurred at both plants."

By Caitlin Byrd on 07/16/2013 in Mountain Express

Please add my name to the list of people demanding that our environment be protected from giant monopolies that can buy their own laws. It is time to control them and do the right thing for our planet. We only have one.

Susan Taylor

Weaverville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Adrienne Hollifield [adrienne.hollifield@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 11:18 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution Settlement for Duke Energy

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to ask that the settlement with Duke Energy Progress include some requirement for stopping the continuing pollution of the groundwater and rivers of Asheville and Western North Carolina. A mere \$60,000 penalty is a laughable settlement for a large corporation. Why did the state sue the power company if the settlement was to be insignificant? Please put some teeth in this settlement. Require Duke to clean up the pollution within a certain time period and prevent more of the same, and fine them a serious amount of money to see that they think twice before doing it again. The state can use that money to do some clean-up, as well. Please, do NOT forsake the people of North Carolina on this issue.

Sincerely,

Adrienne Hollifield

--

Adrienne Hollifield, NBCT, CJE
Charles D. Owen High School
99 Lake Eden Road
Black Mountain, NC 28711
(828) 686-3852 (school)
(828) 686-8442 (fax)
(828) 669-6821 (home)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Randee Goodstadt-Evans [rgoodstadt@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 11:05 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Toxic Coal Ash in the French Broad

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Duke/Progress Energy deserves more than a slap on the wrist for the toxic brew they're putting into our local French Broad River.

Please protect the health of these mountains and our people by forcing Duke to clean up its act.

My husband and I like to kayak in the river, but I admit worry about the toxicity is always in the back of my mind.

Thank you for reading this.

Randee Goodstadt-Evans

West Asheville

Palmer, Lisa M

From: lffurr@charter.net
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 10:52 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: NC Deparment of Environmental and Natural Resourcest

Duke Energy should be good stewards of our enviroment . They are drinking the same water and breathing the same air as their children and our children. Stop acting like the tobacco industry that has been responsible for our higher health care cost and killing of our citizens. The former CEO of RJR was a good friend and neighbor. I missed them both when they died at an earlier age than they should have while letting there Co. lawyers protect the companys bottom Line. I would not let them smoke in my house. Linda Furr

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Gwendolyn Perry [gweninncc@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 10:30 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy's coal ash ponds

Please reconsider the deal NC is making with Duke Energy Progress. I live in south Asheville near the power plant and the coal ash ponds as do thousands of others. There are single and multi-family homes, daycares, retirement homes, businesses and four schools very close to the toxic waste as well. Weakening the present laws and allowing Duke to continue this illegal pollution is unfair, unjust, and immoral. Our state needs to protect all its citizens and rein in big energy.

Thank you for your consideration,

Gwendolyn Perry
Arden, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne Higgins [AnneHiggins@Charter.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Protect the French Broad River

Please use all powers and will to fight for the environmental health of one of most treasured resources in WNC against coal ash and toxic waste. Legislation being enacted on August 14 should protect this valuable resource.

Thank you in advance for your service, Annie Higgins Asheville, NC 28806 Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Patricia Tousignant [twosno@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 8:23 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke is stalling and people are in danger because of it - re: Coal Ash--

Aug 11, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Patricia Tousignant

121 Cypress Pt

Hendersonville, NC 28739-7803

(828) 694-0388

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Art [artkiser6@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 7:13 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash ponds

I would like to add my voice to those standing up for the health and safety of the French broad river. duke energy should be made to begin immediate action to remediate this problem before it results in an environmental disaster or loss of life. Please do not allow further delay and direct the company to be a good citizen and clean up their mess. Arthur kiser , 377 Vanderbilt rd , Asheville, nc,28803

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mary Fite [mhfite@charter.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 11, 2013 7:10 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Ponds

It's outrageous that Duke can get away with threatening the health and the very lives of people. They're breaking the law and the State of North Carolina is complicit in this.

I hope there's another chance for environmental groups to put forth another law suit - not only against Duke, but also against the State for allowing them to break the law.

Thank you for allowing me to express my concerns.

Mary Fite

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Amanda Kincaid [amanda_kincaid@hotmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 10, 2013 7:53 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: North Carolinians need solutions that work for coal ash, not more study.

I oppose the proposed consent order for coal ash disposal facilities at Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend Power Stations and request that DENR require Duke to stop polluting North Carolina's groundwater, the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake.

At a time when communities are investing more in protecting and capitalizing on water resources, it seems backwards that DENR would accept this type of toxic water pollution for any length of time. The French Broad has become vitally important to the recreation and outdoor economy in Western North Carolina, and the Riverbend plant's pollution threatens higher water treatment costs for local communities.

Please require Duke to find a long-term solution for coal ash disposal that doesn't pollute public waters, such as dry storage in a lined landfill away from rivers, lakes or streams.

I also ask that DENR provide more opportunities for the public to weigh in on how coal ash is handled in our state. Please hold public hearings near each site to give communities a chance to have their voices heard.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter and your work protecting the waters we all rely on for drinking, fishing and recreation.

Amanda Kincaid

20 Austin Ave #3

Asheville, NC 28801

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michael Morgan [bigdog0002000@hotmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 10, 2013 7:14 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

According to DENR's own statements, Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State". Duke should be required to stop the ongoing coal ash pollution as soon as possible and move the coal ash to lined, dry landfills away from the river, as is being done by SCE&G at the Wateree Power Station near Columbia, SC.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

Michael Morgan

501 Dennis Street

Swannanoa, NC 28778

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Harold Brewer [tilbrewer@aol.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 10, 2013 5:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Looking to the future

1
2
3
4
5
6
You want a public meeting on the proposed site plan? It's not a public hearing.
The public hearing will be held on August 10, 2013 at 5:00 PM in the Board Room.
It is a public hearing and not a public meeting.
The public hearing will be held on August 10, 2013 at 5:00 PM in the Board Room.
The public hearing will be held on August 10, 2013 at 5:00 PM in the Board Room.

Harold M. Brewer
tilbrewer@aol.com
919 451-6058 Mobile
Success, Every Child, Every Day

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Brian Plemmons [bkplmmns@gmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 10, 2013 1:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop Coal Ash Pollution

Dear Ms. Lisa Palmer:

I would like a public hearing on the proposed settlement. Please stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake. It is time to take action and to end the delays. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people. I enjoy clean water and I want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Sincerely,

Brian K. Plemmons

435 Haw Creek Mews Drive

Asheville, North Carolina 28805

828.559.1645

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bob Lassiter [rhlassiter@gmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 10, 2013 8:44 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Duke-DENR

Dear Ms Palmer:

Regarding the proposed Duke Power-DENR agreement regarding Coal Ash Ponds -
I want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice
can be heard:

- * Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad
River.
- * It is time to take action and end the delays.
- * Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and
store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- * Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking
water reservoir for 860,000 people.

I consider the Coal Ash ponds a serious environmental hazard, as well as a precedent for future coal ash
dumping, that has been created by Duke power. Therefore, for the natural resource legacy that we leave future
North Carolinians, Duke Power needs to remove & remediate the hazard it has created.

Respectfully,

Robert Lassiter

Winston-Salem, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: michael mcleod [anitamikemcleod@aol.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 11:17 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 9, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Dr. michael mcleod

4007 Deep Wood Cir

Durham, NC 27707-3519

(919) 489-2028

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lori Bright [britespirit1@yahoo.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 11:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 9, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Now is the time to act! Studying the illegal pollution won't clean it up, nor will it stop putting communities at risk.

It is my wish that you require Duke Energy stop polluting our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke must be held accountable and needs to begin the clean up of the mess that has already been made.

Furthermore, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the people's voice can be heard.

Please take action now and end the delays. I thank you.

Sincerely,

Lori Bright

22 Independence Blvd

Apt 3

Asheville, NC 28805-9723

Palmer, Lisa M

From: David Perkins [davyperkins@yahoo.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 10:12 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

According to DENR's own statements, Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State". Duke should be required to stop the ongoing coal ash pollution as soon as possible and move the coal ash to lined, dry landfills away from the river, as is being done by SCE&G at the Wateree Power Station near Columbia, SC.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

David Perkins

643 Resthome Rd

Wilkesboro, NC 28697

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bobbie Murray [marilynlov5@yahoo.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 4:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

According to DENR's own statements, Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State". Duke should be required to stop the ongoing coal ash pollution as soon as possible and move the coal ash to lined, dry landfills away from the river, as is being done by SCE&G at the Wateree Power Station near Columbia, SC.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

Bobbie Murray

5014 Millstone Dr

Durham, NC 27713

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jerry Rogers [jlrofb@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 2:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke and DENR

Aug 9, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Jerry Rogers

203 Eastwood Ave

Swannanoa, NC 28778-2609

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carole Larivee [larivee@aol.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 12:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

According to DENR's own statements, Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State". Duke should be required to stop the ongoing coal ash pollution as soon as possible and move the coal ash to lined, dry landfills away from the river, as is being done by SCE&G at the Wateree Power Station near Columbia, SC.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

Carole Larivee

126 Liberty Church Road

Waynesville, NC 28785

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Doris Whitfield [doris.whitfield@att.net]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 12:16 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: I oppose the proposed consent order for Duke's Asheville and Riverbend facilities.

I am writing to express my concern and objection with the proposed consent order for Duke Energy's Asheville and Riverbend facilities. The proposed settlement fails to protect North Carolinians and our valuable water resources from toxic coal ash pollution.

I urge DENR to stop delaying and require definitive action to stop Duke's pollution. DENR should also hold at least one public hearing on the proposal so that the public's voice can be heard on this important matter.

Thank you.

Doris Whitfield

109 Renwick Ct.

Raleigh, NC 27615

Palmer, Lisa M

From: V. Munei [vmunei@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 09, 2013 12:01 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-DUKE COAL ASH SETTLEMENT

Dear Ms. Palmer:

As a past Catawba Riverkeeper Board Member and a North Carolina resident who now lives downstream from another leaking coal ash pond on the French Broad River, I am very concerned about the proposed coal ash settlement between N.C. Department of Environment and Natural Resources and Duke Energy. Only a study? There are already years worth of data documenting these leaks.

What we need now is immediate action to protect the drinking water for hundreds of thousands of North Carolina residents and the recreational economies of at least three North Carolina counties. Duke Energy must move quickly to safely dispose and store coal ash from these unlined ponds, clean up the toxic waste that's already entered Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad, and develop long-term safe solutions for disposing of coal ash.

We also need transparency in these processes. This pollution problem affects hundreds of thousands of stakeholders and their input on proposals that affect essential aspects of their lives should be solicited through convenient, local public hearings.

Please think of the best interests and health of the people of North Carolina and uphold the laws that protect us.

With appreciation,
Valerie Munei
3811 Little Pine Road
Marshall, NC 28753

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Catherine Eades [ceadesnc@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 8:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke & DENR coal ash dump settlement

I don't understand why this matter needs continued study instead of immediate action. Please take first consideration for drinking water over Duke Energy's cheap & inadequate methods of "disposing" of their coal ash pollution. If Duke Energy needs to raise their rates to deal with this problem, I am one citizen who would be glad to pay rather than put arsenic in the drinking water of the citizens of my state.

Since I cannot say it as concisely as others have:

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

Catherine Melvin

800 Redwood Ct.

Winston Salem, NC 27103

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michelle Handler [Michelle@ashecountyrealestate.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 6:22 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend's Coal Ash Ponds and DENR agreement with Duke

Ms. Palmer,

Please register our request that you require Duke Energy to clean up Riverbend's coal ash ponds. We are very unhappy, as part-time residents of Charlotte, to learn that our drinking water is not to be protected by your department. Knowing that you are there to protect us and help us lead safer, healthier lives is important to us. We are counting on you.

Michelle Handler & Jack Apple
West Jefferson, NC & Charlotte, NC

Michelle Handler & Jack Apple

Ashe High Country Realty

800-729-0735

828-406-6229 cell Michelle

828-406-6225 cell Jack

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Billiejean Mallison [billiejean.e.mallison@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 5:14 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Public Hearing Requested Duke Coal Ash Pollution, 2013
Attachments: DukeCoalAshPollution2013.docx

To Ms. Palmer, Please see attached.

Thank you.

Billie Mallison

Washington, NC 27889

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Doug Wells [d.wells2011@live.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 3:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke needs to clean up coal ash pollution now - please help

Hello Ms Palmer

We live at Mt Island Lake in NW Mecklenburg county and we are extremely disappointed and concerned about the mess that Duke Power has left behind at their old Riverbend facility.

I have seen how close the toxic ash pond is to the lake and it is totally unacceptable, frightening and frustrating.

I am asking that our drinking water be protected from this potential disaster, and that means Duke must pay for the removal of their coal ash which is currently seeping toxins into the lake. This must be cleaned up by Duke Power as soon as possible!

Please use all authority you have to help make this happen.

Sincerely,

Doug Wells

Ph: 704-651-7074

Palmer, Lisa M

From: mk austin [maus511994@outlook.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 2:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Kotch, Jonathan B
Subject: Legal issue ... pollution re: Yadkin Riverkeeper

Hi Lisa, Re: coal ash dumping by Duke Energy adjacent to Catawba River/French Broad R.
Notify- A. Stanley(Stan) Meiburg, EPA Region 4, (404)562-8357

It seems that The Clean Water Act of 1972 requires the EPA and NCDENR to file suit against Duke Energy's active and continued poisoning of the drinking water in NC (coal ash dumping). It is their statutory responsibility.

My understanding is that DENR testified under oath more than a year ago, that this active pollution was recognized as a threat to the health of our citizens, and that known safer alternatives have been available for some time. This is not new information.

Pollutants disproportionately impact the development of children - both born and unborn. Willfully damaging children is a criminal act.

This is beyond public debate. Filing suit on behalf of the children and citizens of NC for clean water is consistent with The Clean Water Act of 1972 ... EPA and NCDENR call your attys. NOW...

Respectfully submitted,

MK Austin, PA, MPH

Palmer, Lisa M

From: WEST [west@johnwestphoto.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 1:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke's Coal Ash Pollution

Lisa Palmer,

•

You are currently viewing the page in the public version of the tool.

- ***Stop the pollution*** of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
- It is time to ***take action*** and end the delays.
- Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and ***store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill***.
- Duke and DENR should take ***immediate action*** to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

--

~West

John West Photography LLC / West Documentaries

President of ASMP/NC

Photojournalist | Educator | Documentary Filmmaker

919.673.5882

Website: westdocumentaries.com

Blog: <http://westdocs.tumblr.com/>

Vimeo: <https://vimeo.com/westdocs>

*The information contained in this message and any attachment is proprietary, confidential, and privileged or subject to the work product doctrine and thus protected from disclosure. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or an employee or agent responsible for delivering this message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by replying to this message and deleting it and all copies and backups thereof.

COPYRIGHT NOTICE: Copyright by John West Photography LLC / West Documentaries, All Rights Reserved by John West Photography LLC / West Documentaries. This notice applies to this electronic message, all attachments thereto and all documents referred to therein. This electronic message, any attachments thereto and all documents referred to therein are the proprietary property of John West Photography LLC / West Documentaries. This electronic message, any attachments thereto and all documents referred to therein are provided for the recipient's information only, and no rights are transferred by the transmission of this electronic message by John West Photography LLC / West Documentaries or receipt of this message by the recipient or any other party.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Tim Malone [tlmalone0@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 9:59 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Problem In Asheville

Ms. Palmer:

I live on a tributary of the French Broad near Marshall. I visit Marshall often and attend many functions there. I also fought a concrete plant that was to be erected within 100 ft. of the river, which was luckily moved further away. That had to do with coal ash running into the river.

At the Lake Julian power plant, the same problem, except more massive, exists. We need to fix this.

1. We need a public hearing on the proposed settlement being worked on
 2. We need the continuing Pollution To Stop. This is your job.
 3. Start the clean up immediately
 4. Find a long term solution for disposal so the French Broad, groundwater and the people downstream won't be effected.
 5. I realize this situation is complicated, but we need a Solution Now, and we need Action Now.
- People in power have known about this problem for quite some time, especially since Kingston, TN. It is time to do something effective. We have other choices for electricity that don't present these problems.

With All Due Respect,

Tim Malone

Copyright © 2013
All rights reserved.
This document is the property of
Tim Malone and is not to be
distributed without his permission.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rep. Nathan Ramsey [Nathan.Ramsey@ncleg.net]
Sent: Thursday, August 08, 2013 9:28 AM
To: <rrh@robylawfirm.com>
Cc: Palmer, Lisa M; Rep. Nathan Ramsey; Lisa Baldwin
Subject: Re: Duke Energy Progress Plant-Buncombe County

Mr Roby -

It's my understanding that Duke, NC DEHNR, and SELC have entered into a settlement on these matters. Wouldn't think DEHNR and SELC would do so if they did not believe this addresses the immediate problem with coal ash storage.

I still have many concerns about the long term issue of coal ash storage and wish the General Assembly would publicly study the matter. That way it would be open for all in the public to view and make public comments.

Best wishes,

Nathan

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 5, 2013, at 5:24 PM, "Ronald Roby, Esq." <rrh@robylawfirm.com> wrote:

> It is my understanding that pending litigation involving Duke Energy Progress is to be settled with additional study of the problem created by the coal ash pits at the plant in Arden. In my estimation there is enough information already available to establish a clear and present danger to the environment and specifically to the French Broad River. What are we waiting for a breach of the dams preventing an environmental disaster from happening to occur before we require the power company to correct the problem?

>

> Are there not tests available which establish that chemicals harmful to the river are leaking into the underground surrounding the pits and then showing up in the river? Will not continuing studies do nothing but allow the power company to continue to pollute the river. If I am misinformed, please correct the information to which I am privy or stop the nonsense and do something about this looming disaster.

>

- > Ronald H. Roby, Esquire
- > 680 Fairview Forest Drive
- > Fairview, North Carolina 28730

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Curtis [curtis28618@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 9:06 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Denr duke deal

Please add my name to those opposing the proposed duke denr deal. It's time we be honest with ourselves about the long term costs of energy creation.

Curtis Johnson

183 Buckshot ridge

Deep Gap, NC 28618.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jason Hall [wfgrad@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 7:31 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please Reject the Duke Energy Proposal for Yadkin River

Ms. Palmer,

As a lifelong resident of the Yadkin River Valley I do not agree with the request from Duke Energy to deregulate its activities and relieve oversight for a simple fee structure. Polluting our waterways steals from the tax base much more than reparations will ever secure our children's future. Please consider a more comprehensive approach when dealing with corporate entities at the negotiating table on behalf of the Citizens and future Citizens of this great state. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Jason Hall

170 Linbrook Dr

Winston-Salem, NC 27106

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jean White [jmwhite33@earthlink.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 6:50 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: ExcusingDuke

Duke must be made to stop its pollution of Mt. Island Lake. The public needs to be heard. End delays for Duke. DENR should not be pushed around by that big bully.

Jean M . White 3323 Baugh St. Raleigh, NC 27604 919 876 7957

Palmer, Lisa M

From: mk austin [maus511994@outlook.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 5:16 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy coal ash ... illegal pollution

Thanks for your hard work ... legally, can't Duke be sued via the Clean Water Act?
I'll keep reading.

All the best,
Mary

MK Austin, PA, MPH

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Nancy Shepherd [nancy@shepherdresearch.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 4:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Please hold a public hearing on the proposed settlement for Duke-DENR. I'd like to see the pollution of Mountain Island Lake stopped, and it's time for Duke to move its coal ash away from the lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Action is needed immediately to protect the drinking water reservoir.

Thank for your help with this matter,

Nancy Shepherd 108.17.100
108.17.100
108.17.100

Linkedin: [Nancy Shepherd](#)

Twitter: [@nshepherd](#)

Link: [Nancy Shepherd 108.17.100](#)
[@nshepherd](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Denton Melvin [denton.melvin@greensboro.edu]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 3:50 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DUKE ENERGY AND DENR Settlement

It is atrocious negligence that a dept labeled as being responsible for the environment and natural resources is letting a company whose quarter

2 profits were 339m and who has upped dividends for the sixth consecutive year get away with blatant disregard for public resources.

There is no doubt Duke is violating environmental law. Grow a spine and do the job your department is tasked with. Make them clean up their mess.

--

Denton Melvin

Greensboro College Infotech

(336) 272-7102 ext. 300

Support@greensboro.edu

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Diane Bauman [leeverb@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 3:14 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Powers dumping of ash

I am a concerned citizen who wants to be heard concerning the agreement by the DENR and Duke Power to continue dumping ash from their plants. I would like the people who need to drink the water being contaminated to have a voice in this decision. Please schedule a public hearing and consider the people of NC and not the Duke Power Company as your employer!

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sandie Barrie Blackley [sbblackley@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 1:55 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy / DENR settlement proposal

Dear Ms. Palmer:

As a citizen of North Carolina living in a river town, I am alarmed that the proposed Duke Energy / DENR settlement does nothing to stop ___ of one of North Carolina's major river systems. I respectfully request that DENR act now to protect the water resources for North Carolina citizens.

The Catawba River is the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people in the Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region, and permitting the dumping of coal ash in unlined lagoons on the edge of this water system is irresponsible. This coal ash needs to be stored safely in a dry state, in a lined landfill.

Please schedule a public hearing on this proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Thank you,

Sandie Barrie Blackley
Elkin, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: mary holmes [rathwood@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 1:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke DENR deal

CONFIDENTIAL
This e-mail contains confidential information.
If you are not the named addressee, you should not disseminate, distribute or copy this e-mail.
Please notify the sender immediately by e-mail if you have received this e-mail by mistake and delete this e-mail from your system. If you are not the named addressee you should not disseminate, distribute or copy this e-mail.

1. I am a public hearing on the proposed to the public's access to the beach.
2. The public hearing is scheduled for August 14, 2013 at 10:00 AM in the beach house.
3. A public hearing will be held on the beach house.
4. The public hearing will be held on the beach house.
5. The public hearing will be held on the beach house.
6. The public hearing will be held on the beach house.

Thank you.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Hedrick, Nora [NHedrick@bbandt.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Help stop the Duke and NCDENR DEAL

Lisa – I would like to add my voice to this very important issue. Please TELL DUKE ENERGY AND DENR TO CLEAN

UP DUKE'S COAL ASH POLLUTION OF OUR RIVERS AND LAKES!

1. I want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.
2. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
3. It is time to take action and end the delays.
4. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
5. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Thank you!

Nora S. Hedrick, CPA

Vice President

BB&T Corporate Compliance - Trust | Retirement & Institutional Services

7823 National Service Road | Greensboro | NC 27409

PO Box 14967 (27415)

336-291-1132 Ph | 336-291-1123 Fax

nshedrick@bbandt.com

527-82-01-00

The information in this transmission may contain proprietary and non-public information of BB&T or its affiliates and may be subject to protection under the law. The message is intended for the sole use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, you are notified that any use, distribution or copying of the message is strictly prohibited. If you received this message in error, please delete the material from your system without reading the content and notify the sender immediately of the inadvertent transmission.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Betty & Gene [anderbg@surry.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 1:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash dumpiing, info per Yadkin Riverkeeper

Ms.Palmer: You have our support in opposing unstudied, unregulated, uncontrolled coal ash dumping along the French Broad River or any waterway.

Please feel free to put us on an e-mailing list for updates etc.

Betty McGurk

Dobson, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Katherine Foster [fosterhome18@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:43 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: yrk@yadkinriverkeeper.org
Subject: COAL ASH POLLUTION

Dear Ms. Palmer, I am concerned about the 2.7 million tons of coal ash that Duke has dumped in large unlined lagoons right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake on the Catawba River, the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The DENR has stated under oath that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

As a citizen I want a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard. I want Duke to stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

It is time to take action and end the delays.

Sincerely, Katherine Foster

Palmer, Lisa M

From: barb [barbcu1@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:32 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pollution

Please work to get Duke Energy to stop dumping coal ash near our waters. Barbara Cullen

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne Safrit [asafrt@wakehealth.edu]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:29 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop Duke and NCDENR Deal

Ms. Palmer,

I believe the pollution of water sources by Duke Energy's dumping of millions of tons of toxic coal ash poses a great and dangerous health hazard to the citizens of North Carolina. As a very concerned citizen I would ask that there be a public hearing on the proposals below:

1. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.
2. It is time to take action and end the delays.
3. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
4. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

All residents of North Carolina should have access to safe drinking water and safe consumable fish resources. The degradation of such important public resources for the sake of corporate profit must not be tolerated.

Anne Safrit

Please make note of institution-wide email domain (wakehealth.edu) name change:

Anne Wylie Safrit
Division of Public Health Sciences
Wake Forest School of Medicine
Medical Center Blvd.
Winston-Salem, NC 27157
Phone: (336)716-3906
asafrt@wakehealth.edu

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carleta Prevette [jprevett@centurylink.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:08 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DUKE ENERGY and DENR

Dear Ms. Palmer:

- 1.
2. Concerned residents of North Carolina are requesting a public hearing on the Duke-DENR proposal so the public's voice can be heard regarding the dumping of **toxic coal ash** into unlined lagoons along the French Broad River and on the banks of Mountain Island Lake. Duke Energy should move its coal ash away from the rivers and lakes and store it safely in a dry state within a lined landfill.
3. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people!
4. Please help stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River!

Thank you in advance for your help!

I am a concerned citizen of North Carolina!

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dean and Nancy Lettenstrom [dancyway@att.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 12:01 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy plant

Dear DENR:

Please think of the welfare of WNC citizens and our natural environment and support immediate clean-up and repair of leaking coal ash ponds at Duke Energy. We do not need further study. The evidence has been provided that our groundwater and the French Broad River are being subjected to illegal dumping of toxins. The longer remedial action is postponed, the greater the harm and expense.

Sincerely,

Nancy and Dean Lettenstrom

Arden

Palmer, Lisa M

From: john baker [johnbaker4818@att.net]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 9:36 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Asheville power plant

Dear Ms. Palmer:

I am writing to you to express my extreme dissatisfaction with the Duke -NC DENR proposed settlement which calls for further study of the coal ash dumps on the sight of the Duke power plant in Asheville.

I am calling for a hearing of the Asheville citizenry on this topic. The time for more study is past. We need action taken now to clean up this sight in order to prevent further pollution of the groundwater and French Broad River. After witnessing what the tragic consequences of coal ash dumps can do as referenced by the eastern Tennessee coal ash dump collapse a few years ago, I do not wish to see that happening in Asheville.

We need a constructive discussion on how to phase out this plant in favor of more environmentally sound alternatives.

Thank you for listening to my request. I hope that this letter will lead to a better future for Asheville and North Carolina.

Sincerely,

John Baker
251 Wiltshire Circle
Fletcher, NC 28732

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Darley [darley@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 9:27 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend's toxic coal ash ponds

Dear Ms. Palmer,

A recent Duke University study found arsenic 25 times higher than the EPA's drinking water standard building up in the sediment of Mt. Island Lake just downstream from Riverbend's coal ash ponds and just upstream from Charlotte's water intake. It is way past time for Duke Energy to clean up its Riverbend toxic coal ash ponds. This adversely affects NC's largest city's water source! No wonder most of us are afraid to even bathe in it. Duke Energy must clean up its toxic mess. NOW!

Sincerely,

Darley Adare
2625 Bucknell Ave.
Charlotte, NC 28207

Palmer, Lisa M

From: david@davidmarkseidel.com
Sent: Wednesday, August 07, 2013 8:58 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend coal ash ponds

Hello Lisa,

We request that the state require Duke power to clean up the Riverbend coal ash ponds and do it this year.

Our cities and our people are threatened and we must act. We appreciate all that you do.

Peace,
David Mark Seidel

Charlotte, NC



David Mark Seidel
President, Seidel Family Services, Inc.
Author, [Peace Butter & Jelly :Tales of Nourishment](#)
www.davidmarkseidel.com
704-526-7284 cell
704-643-3102 office
[Like Us on Facebook](#)
 [Facebook](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: BMorgan [bobbie.morgan018@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 10:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke and DENR - NO to pollution

Dear Ms. Palmer,

We are writing to voice our opposition to the pollution of Mountain Lake Island. We would like a public hearing on this important matter as we feel that the drinking water should be protected!

Sincerely,

Graham and Barbara Morgan

Morganton, NC 28655

Palmer, Lisa M

From: brenda bergeron [bearravendeer@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 10:47 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean water

Please keep the rivers running through our lives clean. They are not laboratories, they are our life's blood. Life does not have time for your scientific studies, only for you application.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ruel Tyer [tyer@greenvillenc.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 9:26 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Coal Ash Hearing

I think that NCDENR should have a public hearing on the Duke/NCDENR settlement proposal. I am opposed to what has currently been structured to be approved for Duke Power. Harvey Tyer, 4030 Tyer Farm Lane, Fountain, NC 27829

Palmer, Lisa M

From: charles froelich [frodaddy125@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 6:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash lagoons

To whom it may concern-

Coal ash ponds are polluting western North Carolina. These ponds present a danger to our water supply and our citizens.

The settlement between **Duke Energy Progress and the N.C. Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR)** would be a severe blow to the French Broad river and WNC's water. I'm looking for:

- A public hearing in Asheville on the proposed settlement.
- Much larger fines for Duke Energy's long term pollution of our area.
- Stop the ongoing pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad river and clean up the existing pollution.
- A long term solution for disposing coal ash that does not pollute the French Broad and groundwater.

This is an important and dangerous situation that needs to be addressed NOW!

Sincerely,

Charlie Froelich

PO Box 366

Marshall NC 28753

Palmer, Lisa M

From: John and Kathy Schermerhorn [schermsfarm@earthlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 6:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: duke and the coal ash disaster.

Big industry/business obviously feels that it is OK to dump their waste (without regard) in such a fashion that it poses a threat to millions of citizens. What's worse is that the County, State and Federal Governments also think it's OK. This is such a marketing disaster for Duke (in this case). Additionally, costly for all of it's customers and stock holders. It seems to be such a bad business plan and when they're done and gone who cleans up their mess? Do you pee in someone else's well?? Do you mind if they pee in yours?? Simple question. Simple answer. Why is it so difficult to properly convey and regulate these issues?

As we all know, we are 97% water. Our food and crops that feed us require water. Other States seem to understand (due to circumstances way beyond their control) that water quality is a finite resource and protection of it will come in handy someday as a commodity. Commodity = Money = Power = what every politician wants.

It appears that this is how We need to sell them on this issue.

OK enough BLA, BLA, BLA.

An excellent read: What Has Nature Ever Done For Us - expertly and optimistically written by Tony Juniper
It is practically like Gospel with cause, effect and intellectual sway points to guide all to a better way of living.
Regards.

John Schermerhorn
schermsfarm@earthlink.net
252-964-3222

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Clemie [clemieg@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 4:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution of French Broad River

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to request a public hearing in Asheville regarding the proposed settlement to start cleaning up the existing pollution of the French Broad River. The existing leaking of the coal ash lagoons above the river are unacceptable and a long-time solution of the problem is desperately needed.

Sincerely,

Clementine Gregory

1092 Hendersonville Road

Asheville, NC 28803

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Terry Dugan [jacktuge@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 4:15 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Ponds on Mountain Island Lake

I am very concerned about the current status of the coal ash ponds. The actual leakage and potential of catastrophic failure of the pond are real issues that need to be addressed. I am requesting that Duke stop the delay tactics and take immediate action to resolve and remove the coal ash away from any waterway.

I am requesting that Duke and the DENR take action to protect the drinking water for the citizens of Charlotte and surrounding area.

Terry Dugan

150 Fawn Lane

Mooresville, NC 28117

248.388.8119

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Pam Dykstra [pameladykstra@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 3:15 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke DENR settlement

Duke and DENR,

We need a settlement that ensures Duke cleans up its pollution, not a settlement that asks for a study of it. DENR has documented the pollution and stated in its filing that Duke's pollution is a "serious danger to the health, safety, and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State."

The proposed Duke-DENR settlement is inadequate because it:

- * Lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the groundwater that will eventually reach the Lake
- * Leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities those systems serve.
- * Postpones action by asking for studies instead of cleanup, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it.
- * Includes only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company.

We need instead to ensure

- * that Duke moves its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill
- * that Duke and DENR take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Clean water is a basic need of all people. We need to stop the pollution now.

Pamela Dykstra

430 Windward Drive

Davidson, NC 28036

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Betsy Kane [oldurbanist@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 3:15 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: NO to proposed settlement on Duke coal ash pile

Ms. Palmer:

I wish to express my most vigorous opposition to the proposed settlement of Duke Energy's unlawful, toxic pollution of Mountain Island Lake.

It is outrageous that Duke could impose this pollution on the people of North Carolina and escape with minimal responsibility.

There needs to be a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

No more delays -- Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River.

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Duke needs to have a LARGE fine against it for YEARS of documented, illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company.

Enforce the laws! Clean up Mountain Island Lake!

Thank you,

Betsy Kane

Raleigh and Greenville

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robin Woods [rwoods@poyners.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 3:12 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 6, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

Does anyone see what is wrong with this picture???

The proposed settlement between you, the DENR, and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study (really?)

the illegal pollution won't clean it up (duh) and continues to put communities at risk. Do you not get your water from the same place, so you don't care that drinking water is being polluted? What is up?

I strongly urge you to require and demand that Duke Energy immediately STOP the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte, pay a hefty fine to make them realize they can't do that anymore and then lastly, immediately start cleaning up the mess that they have already made. This is truly an outrage. What are you studying the contamination for? It's poison, it's pollution. Is someone's pocket getting greased so that eases your conscious about letting them get by with this?

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, TAKE ACTION NOW. STOP THIS NONSENSE.

Sincerely,

Robin Woods

13639 Quixley Ln

Charlotte, NC 28273-6772

(704) 499-8271

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Peggy Broadway [pbway@suddenlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 2:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 6, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays. When you consider that water is a closed system. Considering that no one can produce more water and many countries through out the world do not have clean or adequate water supplies, it is inconceivable that DENR would allow a multi-billion dollar industry to continue pouring coal ash into the lakes and ponds that supply citizens of North Carolina. Surely Duke Power can hold off on some of the bonuses and obscene salaries paid CEOs and find a solution for storing coal ash without dumping it into the water supply. Please DENR do your job and protect this life giving resource for all North Carolina Citizens.

Sincerely,

Peggy Broadway

214 Change St

New Bern, NC 28560-4907

(252) 637-6989

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Suzy Lawrence [suzyln@mindspring.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 9:53 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution of Mountain Island Lake & Groundwater

Hi, Action needs to be taken to prevent future pollution & huge problems regarding the pollution of groundwater & a public water supply at Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte.

Here's what's wrong with the proposed settlement:

- The Duke-DENR deal does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake
 - The Duke-DENR deal leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte, Gastonia, and Mount Holly
 - The Duke-DENR deal only requires more studies instead of cleanup, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it.
 - The Duke-DENR deal includes only a token fine of less than \$40,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution by this multi-billion dollar company.
-
1. A public hearing should be held on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard
 2. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
 3. It is time to take action and end the delays.
 4. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
 5. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Sincerely, Suzy Lawrence, Chapel Hill, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bower, Virginia [VBOWER@MHU.EDU]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 9:03 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: real solutions to polution!!

Please listen to the people of WNC who do NOT want to see Duke Energy continue to destroy our lovely mountain area by leaking coal ash into the lagoon. This is what the people want from Duke Energy:

1. A public hearing in Asheville on the proposed settlement.
2. To stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater and the French Broad River.
3. To start cleaning up the existing pollution
4. To find a long-term solution for disposing coal ash that doesn't pollute the groundwater and the French Broad.
5. Acknowledgment hat it is time to take action and end the delays.

Thank you for taking the RIGHT action!
Virginia Bower
AVL, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: AD Anderson [greybeardtraveller@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 06, 2013 7:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: French Broad River contamination

Dear Ms. Palmer -

I am frankly shocked by the response of NCDENR to the ongoing coal ash issue at Duke's Lake Julien plant. So many of us were pleased that your agency was going to finally demand an appropriate response from Duke, and now we're appalled by the current "arrangement". I'm sad to admit that I have to assume this lack of response is due to the business-bought legislative priorities in Raleigh. I'd hoped you would be able to hold your head a little higher and do what you know is needed, but alas, I guess I was wrong.

So pitiful to watch this debacle. I only hope we don't suffer a catastrophe like in other states. How would you be able to sleep at night?

It's not too late. Please stand up to Duke and set the example we all expected in the first place.

Sincerely,

David Anderson

Life-long Tarheel

40-year resident of Buncombe County

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Burt Aycock [ebaycock@embarqmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:59 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Deal

Lisa,

Please do not make that bad deal!

It's not about us; it is about grandchildren and theirs and

Thank you,

Burt Aycock

Palmer, Lisa M

From: paul frehe [pfrehe@main.nc.us]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Asheville power plant coal ash lagoons

Dear Ms. Palmer,

We need real action that protects the environment and people from the illegal coal ash lagoons at the Asheville Power Plant.

1. We want a public hearing in Asheville on the proposed settlement.
2. To stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater and the French Broad River.
3. To start cleaning up the existing pollution
4. To find a long-term solution for disposing coal ash that doesn't pollute the groundwater and the French Broad.
5. That it is time to take action and end the delays

Please take action now and don't pamper big corporate interests.

Sincerely,
Paul Frehe
Asheville, NC

pfrehe@main.nc.us

Palmer, Lisa M

From: NANCY WILLIAMS [leapyeargirl@me.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 8:47 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: French Broad River coal ash pollution

1. **I want a public hearing in Asheville on the proposed settlement.**
2. **To stop the ongoing pollution of groundwater and the French Broad River.**
3. **To start cleaning up the existing pollution**
4. **To find a long-term solution for disposing coal ash that doesn't pollute the groundwater and the French Broad.**
5. **That it is time to take action and end the delays.**

Sent from my iPad

Palmer, Lisa M

From: K.W. Nicholson [nnicholson66@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 7:54 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: the coal ash problem

Dear Lisa:

If I have a bad muffler on my car that causes it to spew loud smelly noxious fumes all over the city, I'd get a ticket.

Never mind that i'm on my way to a college where I'm a brilliant teacher producing multitudes of desperately needed engineers. I'm going to get a ticket. Counting mental stress, travel, court costs and fines, it's going to cost me nearly half a months pay. It doesn't matter that my ten kids are going to go hungry either, i'm going to have to pay a fine.

The reason it's that way is because I don't have a large enough income to hire politicians and government employees to let me get away with it. That's it finish. You can well but and well it's complicated, and it's in the public interest, all you want, but that's really all there is to it.

Corporations are not people. They are monsters that will do what ever they can get away with to increase profits as rapidly as possible. That is the nature of the beast.

The purpose of government is to watch out for the public good, not for the corporate good. If it causes electricity prices to go up, so be it. But history seems to show a very consistent trend: Corporate entities don't like change, but when forced to get more environmentally safe, they generally also become more efficient and therefore profitable.

So do your job and stop being just another bribe mongering leach on society.

thank you for your time, kwn

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joy Jenkins [jjenkens@embarqmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 7:43 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash

It has come to my attention that Duke Energy has been dumping coal ash very close to Mountain Island Lake, without protecting the lake. Please be advised that clean drinking water is crucial to all of us. Please stop polluting, and move the coal ash to someplace safer. I'm just one North Carolinian, but if you want to know how many others are angry with this lack of action, hold a public hearing. Protect our drinking water instead of polluting it.

Thank you very much. Joy Jenkins, Holly Springs, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Betsy Ryherd [ryherd1@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 7:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean water

Please take immediate action to ensure that asheville issues related to coal ash are solved!

No more studies are needed!

Betsy ryherd 14 holland st

28801

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Stephen Eidson [eidsonsj@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 5:48 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash

I want the lagoons removed, damage remediated and Duke Power fined a significant amount. When did the citizens of this state cede control to Duke Power?

Stephen Eidson

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ann McMartin [annmcmartin@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 5:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Progress

Duke Energy needs to be held responsible for polluting the French Broad River and other waterways in Western North Carolina. Maybe we would see less cancer and other diseases in this area if coal ash was removed from the environment. It's time the Duke Executives get a conscience and stop worrying about the stockholders and Duke Executives large salaries and start thinking about the people.

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ronald Roby, Esq. [rhr@robylawfirm.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 5:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: Rep. Nathan Ramsey; Lisa Baldwin
Subject: Duke Energy Progress Plant-Buncombe County

It is my understanding that pending litigation involving Duke Energy Progress is to be settled with additional study of the problem created by the coal ash pits at the plant in Arden. In my estimation there is enough information already available to establish a clear and present danger to the environment and specifically to the French Broad River.

What are we waiting for a breach of the dams preventing an environmental disaster from happening to occur before we require the power company to correct the problem?

Are there not tests available which establish that chemicals harmful to the river are leaking into the underground surrounding the pits and then showing up in the river? Will not continuing studies do nothing but allow the power company to continue to pollute the river. If I am misinformed, please correct the information to which I am privy or stop the nonsense and do something about this looming disaster.

Ronald H. Roby, Esquire

680 Fairview Forest Drive

Fairview, North Carolina 28730

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carol Hale [carolkhale@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 3:40 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Concerns

To Whom it May Concern:---as it greatly concerns us!

1. I request a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard
2. Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.
3. It is time to take action and end the delays.
4. Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
5. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

The land and waters belong to the entire world---not to just a few.

Respectfully,
David and Carol Hale
Residents of the Neuse River
New Bern, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: J Shay [jshay68@earthlink.net]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 3:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake

Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash in large unlined lagoons right on the banks of Mountain Island Lake, the drinking water reservoir for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Mount Holly region. The coal ash is separated from the lake only by earthen berms that leak hundreds of thousands of gallons of polluted water into the Lake and groundwater. Based on years' worth of data documenting these problems, DENR has stated under oath that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "**serious harm to the water resources of the State.**"

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

It is time to take action and end the delays. There should be a public hearing on this proposal.

Thanks for listening.

Judy Shay
6807 Towles Road
Wilmington, NC 28409
910-7997-7562
[Jshay68@earthlink.net](mailto:jshay68@earthlink.net)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mr James Shelton [james_shelton32@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 3:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash

Duke has dumped 2.7 million tons of coal ash in a large unlined impoundment on the banks of the Roanoke River, threatening water intended for the entire Charlotte-Gastonia-Metrolina region. The coal ash is expected to contaminate only the water supply for the Lake and groundwater. Based on current levels of ash, discharging these problems, DCHN has issued orders that that State's unlined impoundment is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

The State DCHN has issued orders that the pollution of the Roanoke River and groundwater is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

The State DCHN has issued orders that the pollution of the Roanoke River and groundwater is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

The State DCHN has issued orders that the pollution of the Roanoke River and groundwater is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

The State DCHN has issued orders that the pollution of the Roanoke River and groundwater is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

I would like to know more about this.

The State DCHN has issued orders that the pollution of the Roanoke River and groundwater is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and "serious harm to the water resources of the State".

James Shelton

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bill Hines [lbhines@centurylink.net]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 2:49 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash

Lisa,

Duke Energy needs to clean up it's coal ash now!

Bill Hines
Duke Energy Customer and down river from their problem.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lauren Halbkat [lfh40@mac.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Stop poisoning our water!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Please clean this up right away!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Lauren Halbkat

310 Hogback Mountain Rd

Tryon, NC 28782-2953

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Anne Flannery [anneflannery@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: pollution

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Anne Flannery

87 Whispering Pines Mhp

Chapel Hill, NC 27517-7659

(919) 444-3472

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dane Bowen [dbowen5@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the polluted mess!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

They want to double and triple our rates, they need to show they can be trusted before anything else.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Dane Bowen

8740 Blair Rd

Mint Hill, NC 28227-7640

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Whit Scott [whinnfjord@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Needs to Clean Up Toxic Coal Ash Lagoon Pollution

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Whit Scott

301 Pebble Springs Rd

Chapel Hill, NC 27514-5226

Palmer, Lisa M

From: James Thomas [jmichaelthomas2001@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. James Thomas

5900 Hathaway Ln

Chapel Hill, NC 27514-9618

(919) 949-4314

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lawrence East [rstyeast@aol.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean Up the Toxic Coal Ash Lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Lawrence East

316 Richlands Ave

Apt 5

Jacksonville, NC 28540-5547

(910) 333-8848

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Susan Howell [susanhowell2@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please make clean up of toxic coal ash lagoons a top priority

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Susan Howell

1920 Quail Ridge Rd Apt K

Greenville, NC 27858-5595

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Hudson Oliver [hudson_oliver@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Hudson Oliver

6716 Woodmere Dr

Raleigh, NC 27612-6807

(919) 560-7084

Palmer, Lisa M

From: ERIC EVERETT [nyla10580@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: If you have any morals at all, stop hurting people and yourselves!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. ERIC EVERETT

14 Forest Ridge Dr

Arden, NC 28704-2638

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jan Tate [jan.tate@gulfsoft.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up our water

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Jan Tate

7709 Appamattox Rd

Apex, NC 27539-7432

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bernadette Chasteen [bernadette.chasteen@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean Water is pretty basic

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Bernadette Chasteen

1405 Tyler Ct

Durham, NC 27701-1200

(919) 682-8455

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Christina Dickson [christy@surfnetusa.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:11 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please reject proposed Duke Energy/DENR settlement

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Christina Dickson

109 Tabernacle Rd

Black Mountain, NC 28711-2528

(828) 664-0116

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carlos Quagliaroli [cquag@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:10 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Carlos Quagliaroli

Somewhere

Cary, NC 27519-2861

(252) 451-8366

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jessica Rowe [jrowe@amerizon.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:10 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: CLEAN IT UP!!!!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Jessica Rowe

4996 Indiana Ave

Winston Salem, NC 27106-2823

(336) 991-6266

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Adrienne Gardner [briannamackenzie@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 11:10 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: It's time to clean up the pollution

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Adrienne Gardner

154 Ridgeview Dr

Mount Airy, NC 27030-9297

(000) 000-0000

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jennifer Poindexter [uncjenn81@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Settlement

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ms. Jennifer Poindexter

2340 W English Rd

High Point, NC 27262-8056

(336) 953-1022

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Austin Norfleet [anorfleet@hotmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: clean up your mess, please

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Austin Norfleet

2017 Battlewood Rd

Apex, NC 27523-5149

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Tolly Boatwright [tboat@duke.edu]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: We Need Clean Water!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Dr. Tolly Boatwright

2040 Englewood Ave

Durham, NC 27705-4113

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Alan Katzer [katzer.alan@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Alan Katzer

2700 Reynolda Rd

Apt 1202

Winston Salem, NC 27106-3847

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michael Felmet [mfelmet@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:39 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Michael Felmet

140 Jefferson Forest Ct

Winston Salem, NC 27106-4787

(336) 462-8795

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Matthew Rubino [matt_rubino@ncsu.edu]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Matthew Rubino

214 D. Clark Labs

NC State Univ. Dept. of Applied Ecology

Raleigh, NC 27695-0001

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Doug West [dwest@compassion.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Take responsible action to clean up coal ash!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Doug West

2703 Colton Dr

Oak Ridge, NC 27310-9518

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Fred Chauncey [chauncey@nc.rr.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Fred Chauncey

1416 Whittington Dr

Raleigh, NC 27614-8755

(919) 847-6936

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Thomas Boyd [31tomboyd@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean Up

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Thomas Boyd

105 Colora Ct

Cary, NC 27513-2834

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Stephen Beets [beets@wfu.edu]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: No more coal ash lagoons!

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Dr. Stephen Beets

327 Caudle Rd

Pinnacle, NC 27043-9383

(336) 325-2984

Palmer, Lisa M

From: William Radke [wjrake@juno.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. William Radke

7524 Fairlawn Dr

Apt 204

Raleigh, NC 27615-7706

(919) 844-4439

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Susan Dameron [susan.l.dameron@wellsfargo.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Environment

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Susan Dameron

1245 N Hill Dr

Lincolnton, NC 28092-9656

(704) 732-9380

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Michael Turner [mtp54@frontier.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy clean up

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Michael Turner

903 Westridge Rd

Greensboro, NC 27410-4505

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ashley Moore [amoore@acthms.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 10:09 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Clean up the toxic coal ash lagoons

Aug 5, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Miss Ashley Moore

7125 Thurgood Rd

Wilmington, NC 28411-6186

Palmer, Lisa M

From: arthur kiser [artkiser6@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, August 05, 2013 8:27 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M

i am a resident of asheville and am very concerned about the storage of toxic waste in unlined ponds so close to the french broad river. heavy metals are known to be leeching into the river from the two duke energy ponds. this fact is known by the utility company and the state. now is not the time for further studies and delays. it is time to remediate the prblem.

i am requesting that a public hearing be held in asheville and all interested parties be invited to attend. duke energy should stop adding to the pollutionand immediately begin actual cleanup. a long term solution is needed.

please do not go forward with a settlement without including all of the above in that agreement.

arthur kiser

377 vanderbilt rd

asheville nc 28803

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Skip Hudspeth [skip@perigee.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 04, 2013 8:36 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-Duke Energy Proposed Rivebend Settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to share my concerns about the proposed Duke Energy/DENR settlement regarding the Riverbend Coal Ash ponds on Mountain Island Lake. I live on Mountain Island Lake within two miles of the coal ash ponds.

In my view the proposed settlement fails to address several key issues:

1. The level of fine proposed for Duke's illegal pollution is much too low.

DENR found that Duke has been illegally polluting the lake and that this pollution "pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State." **The proposed \$36,000 is inappropriately low for the illegal discharge of toxic materials threatening our state's water resources.**

2. Duke is not required to stop polluting the lake.

The proposed settlement does not require that Duke stop polluting the lake, only that they conduct further studies. Duke stopped operating the Riverbend Generating Station earlier this year. There is no longer a need to for the unlined coal ash ponds to remain next to and pollute the water supply for over 800,000 people. Also, while the risk of failure of the coal ash pond dams may be low, the consequence of such a failure would be catastrophic. **The settlement should require that Duke remove the coal ash and store it in a lined facility.**

3. There is no provision for a public hearing on the proposed settlement.

Given the large impact of the coal ash pond pollution, a public hearing should be held so that the public's voice can be heard on this issue.

Thank you for your consideration on this important issue.

Sincerely,

John Hudspeth
11130 Johnson Davis Road
Huntersville NC 28078

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Nancy Neely [neelyn@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Sunday, August 04, 2013 3:50 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR/Duke Coal Ash Settlement

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am writing to express my concern about the proposed Duke-DENR settlement regarding Coal Ash pollution on Mountain Island Lake. It is my understanding that there is nothing in the settlement which requires Duke to stop polluting Mountain Island lake, rather that the proposed settlement merely requires Duke to do further studies. I am also disturbed to learn that the proposed settlement will require Duke to pay merely \$36,000 in fines for years of illegal documented pollution of Mountain Island Lake.

Please know that as a homeowner on Mountain Island Lake, I am worried that the groundwater that feeds my well and the water in which we enjoy swimming and boating is polluted, and I believe that this is primarily because of the negligence of Duke.

Given the magnitude of this problem, and the wide spread implications of the coal ash pond on Mountain Island lake, I believe that there should be a public hearing on the proposed settlement. A Duke-DENR settlement should require Duke to remove the coal ash from it's storage pond on Mountain Island Lake and store it in a lined landfill, and Duke should be fined in the millions of dollars - not receive a slap on the hand.

DENR stated in its filings that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina" and poses "serious harm to the water resources of the State." I do not feel that the proposed settlement is in alignment with the statement of DENR.

Thank you for your attention to this important issue.

Sincerely,

Nancy E. Neely
11130 Johnson Davis Rd.
Huntersville, NC 28018

Palmer, Lisa M

From: K Bolick Jackson [kbolickjackson@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 04, 2013 1:09 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake Cleanup

Duke Energy needs to clean up what they have done to Mountain Island Lake, and to the source of drinking water for many of us!

Kay Bolick Jackson

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Megan Smirnov [megsmirnov@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, August 04, 2013 1:36 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Hello Ms. Palmer,

I think a public hearing is called for, in regards to Duke Energy's coal ash waste dumping near Mountain Island Lake. It needs to be stopped and they need to be held responsible for this gross abuse of our beautiful state's natural resources.

Duke Energy should be responsible for moving their leaking coal ash storage away from Mountain Island Lake and putting it, in a dry state, in a lined landfill.

We need to stop letting them beat around the bush. *We must protect our drinking water!*

Thank you for taking the time to consider my request.

Sincerely,

Megan Smirnov

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Matthews [robert.matthews@gmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 03, 2013 10:05 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy and DENR

Aug 3, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Robert Matthews

2508 Brighton Pt

Sanford, NC 27330-9390

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jamie Reed [jlreed@ncsu.edu]
Sent: Saturday, August 03, 2013 4:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Please clean up the coal ash lagoons in our beautiful state!

Aug 3, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Please do the job you were elected to do: protect the citizens of North Carolina.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Miss Jamie Reed

8620 Glendale Dr

Apex, NC 27539-9001

(919) 616-4333

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carroll Kerr [mtnhermit@hotmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 03, 2013 4:04 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: CLEAN UP THE POLLUTION NOT STUDY IT Make DUKE CLEAN UP THEIR MESS

Aug 3, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. Carroll Kerr

2891 Zion Hill Rd

Marion, NC 28752-9686

(828) 738-3283

Palmer, Lisa M

From: mary kerr [vmebkerr@aol.com]
Sent: Saturday, August 03, 2013 12:53 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend/Mountain Island Lake

Ms. Palmer,
I have been following the proposed settlement with Duke Energy related to the pollution at Mountain Lake. The coal ash that is being poured into the lake and the effects on the groundwater and the drinking water for thousands of citizens in Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly and other municipalities is illegal as well as being morally reprehensible.

Due to the impact on the area and on so many inhabitants, it is imperative that there be a public hearing on this matter. The fine that was assessed for Duke Energy was absolutely ludicrous and, in effect, makes DENR complicit in this documented illegal pollution.

Cleanup of this site will be costly and time consuming, but without those efforts the effects from the Riverbend pollution will linger for years to come.

Please give this matter your earliest and complete attention.

Thank you,
Mary Ann Kerr

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sister Therese Galligan [tgalligan@mercysc.org]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 9:02 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Urging you to take action to protect our citizens

Aug 2, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Sister Therese Galligan

100 Mercy Dr

Belmont, NC 28012-4805

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jill Lynn [sunshinedaydreamranch@yahoo.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 5:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

TAKE ACTION NOW. DUKE MUST STOP THE CONTAMINATION OF OUR WATER, OF OUR ENVIRONMENT, OF OUR BEAUTIFUL LAND.

NO MORE DELAYS!

Sincerely,

Jill Lynn

Sunshine Daydream Ranch

Lake Way Drive

Bostic, NC 28018

Palmer, Lisa M

From: marie kadan [mamakadan@hotmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 5:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Coal Ash Pond Clean Up - NO MORE TALK - WE WANT ACTION!

Hi Ms. Palmer:

My family and I live on Lake Wateree and have a well. This is our only source of drinking water. If a coal ash spill happens on the Catawba River it will affect my family and all my neighbors here on Lake Wateree. This would affect our drinking water supply! We don't need a coal ash spill as they have had in other rivers. We don't need your constant seepage in our Catawba River to effect the water table and drinking water supply of all living near this river!

DENR has already said under oath that this pollution is illegal and a threat to public health and our water supplies. The law requires ACTION NOW to stop this coal ash pollution.

You would think that since Mountain Island Lake is far upstream from us that the effect of a coal ash pond not being cleaned up would not matter to me. Lake Wateree is lovingly referred to as the toilet bowl of the 11 lakes in the Catawba River chain. Anything that makes it into the other 10 lakes does make it's way down to us. The first flood event we had this year, Mountain Island Lake had no warning and they received 8' of water flooding the properties. That water had to move somewhere, and it eventually made it to Lake Wateree. If there was a problem with the flooding and the coal ash pond at that flood event, we would have suffered the consequences. Isn't it convenient how you have to keep Lake Norman and Lake Wylie under full pond. Wish we had some Duke executives living on our Lake Wateree.

If an individual or company had contaminated soil from oil, for example, and they wanted to sell the property, it would have to be cleaned up. In Beaufort SC there is a superfund because the military base there contaminated the water system.

I would like to see this situation resolved BEFORE there is a problem. Let's clean it up now and not wait until the coal ash and it's pollutant chemicals make it down stream.

There is NO NEED for a STUDY. We KNOW it is a VERY bad situation to have coal ash ponds, especially on a river! Be a responsible company and think of your actions, not your bottom line. The time to act is now, enough

of the talking. Having Duke pay a fine does nothing, in my opinion based on past experiences.

Thank you,
Marie Karlan

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cynthia Gallion [cynrg77@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 4:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Studying the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess it's already made.

Furthermore, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end all delays.

Sincerely,

Cynthia Gallion

1020 W South St

Raleigh, NC 27603-2162

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sara C Carter [saracarternc@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 1:19 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy doesn't come close to justice and fairness. They must be responsible. They are making millions of dollars and not being accountable for the health of the

peoples. You, YOU can interrupt that. Please do so.

Sincerely,

Sara Carter 2707 Shenandoah Avenue

Durham, NC 27704

Sincerely,

Sara C Carter

2707 Shenandoah Ave

Durham, NC 27704-4217

(919) 220-3336

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dale Weston [majortest@earthlink.net]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 9:27 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

Do your job.

\$\$\$ in various pockets and accounts do not count.

Stop the pollution.

Stop it now.

Sincerely,

Dale Weston

611 Crissy Dr

Jacksonville, NC 28540-9181

(910) 455-9916

Palmer, Lisa M

From: neul [neuland@comporium.net]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 6:38 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake pollution

Ms. Palmer--

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't draw out for generations to come.
- Sincerely,
- Neuland Collier

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Keith Allen [allnwood@msn.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 6:10 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

This is absolutely obscene, and monumentally corrupt! The McCrory

administration is giving Duke Energy a slap on the wrist, and "just forgetting about" the poisons that Duke has ALREADY dumped into our water supplies. Do you think a fine is, somehow, going to CLEAN UP the toxic chemicals that Duke has recklessly, AND

PREDICTABLY, leaked? That's absurd! Where are the requirements that

Duke change its ways? Will paltry fines just become another "business expense" for Duke? What's next, a rate hike to make THE PUBLIC pay for DUKE'S NEGLIGENCE???

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Keith Allen

PO Box 11

Cedar Grove, NC 27231-0011

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dale & Kathleen Weston [majortest@earthlink.net]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 6:06 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

Please enjoy the orange water and the eternal gratitude of Duke. . .

In the meantime, just for a millisecond, consider the actual meaning of swearing to support and defend our Constitution. The ethics???

I am so glad that cigarettes are healthy and useful. That play book worked for years even though 'cancer sticks' was in common usage.

Corporate \$\$\$ or actual public health issues.

You were not hired to referee a race to the bottom. Stop known neurotoxins or roll over and play dead to corporate \$\$\$boys???

Please don't shame our state any more. Don't pollute our water.

Sincerely,

Dale & Kathleen Weston

611 Crissy Dr

Jacksonville, NC 28540-9181

(910) 455-9916

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Naddina Lacorte [gardinsprite13@aol.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 6:06 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Naddina Lacorte

229 Airport Rd

7-252

Arden, NC 28704-6402

(828) 348-4216

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Nick Davis [nickdavis80@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 6:04 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Nick Davis

240 Shady Grove Rd

Pittsboro, NC 27312-5304

(919) 548-3463

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Matilda Phillips [matphil25@yahoo.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 5:57 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

Please take steps to stop polluting our water and air. They are bad for us. Thank you!
Matilda Phillips

Sincerely,

Matilda Phillips

185 Driftwood Ln

Winston Salem, NC 27104-3452

(336) 448-0786

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Robert Lypka [blypka@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 5:57 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

Many in our state have been bought off by corporations in order to silence them and I would not like to think that this is what has happened here. GMO labeling is another issue that has corporate stooges in government positions to deflect the regulatory blow to these violators. Don't let it happen in North Carolina.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Robert Lypka

3055 Bonbrook Dr

Winston Salem, NC 27106-3019

(336) 703-7883

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ann Deupree [anndeupree@alumni.duke.edu]
Sent: Friday, August 02, 2013 5:57 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 2, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays. Our water resources must be protected. If Duke Energy is fined significantly, they will have an incentive to use alternative energy sources.

Sincerely,

Ann Deupree

41 Citation Dr

Durham, NC 27713-9158

(919) 493-2915

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Furaha Youngblood [furaha3@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 8:30 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

What is it going to take to save this beautiful state from the polluters who apparently care about nothing except obscene profits?

What kind of legacy are we leaving for our children and their children?

This is the only planet we've got to live on, and it seems that we're allowing immoral, unscrupulous, and greedy scoundrels like Duke Energy to get in bed with agencies meant to protect our resources to cut deals that only benefit themselves.

You must act in the interest of all North Carolinians, not the puppetmasters like Duke Energy.

Ms. F. Youngblood

Sincerely,

Furaha Youngblood

1005 Grant St

Durham, NC 27701-4415

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joella Vanderdoes [jvanderdoes@triad.rr.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 8:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Duke Energy can afford to invest in clean up and protection to ensure its customers - those of us who are the originators of its profits deserve that much.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard. Please provide the time to allow public input. Our state is too beautiful and our health and environment too important to push ahead without hearing from the primary segment of key stakeholders - the citizens of NC.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Joella Vanderdoes

5969 Kenville Green Cir

Kernersville, NC 27284-7128

(336) 996-1401

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ann Danzi [ajdanzi@earthlink.net]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 5:55 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend Coal Ash

Ms. Palmer

I live across the road from the Riverbend Steam plant in the Stonewater development. Several years ago we watched as Duke drained one of the ash ponds and moved the resultant black ash into an area on their property alongside Horseshoe Bend Beach Rd which runs between the plant and this development. They formed a mound approximately 100 feet long and about 10 feet high with this ash. This process took over a week and as black ash flew over cars and houses, people here were afraid to let their children and pets to be outside for any length of time. Duke ignored our calls. Finally, their "solution" was to hose it down and plant grass. Meanwhile, blew ash over our development until the grass grew, but neither Duke nor DENR seemed the least concerned.

This mound does not have a liner and after rain, rivulets are clearly visible all over the hill. I could not believe that this ash was not settling into the ground water. Now we know through independent testing, that this site has the highest concentration of pollution on the lake. Still Duke ignores this crucial information.

Duke's testing over years consistently finds nothing wrong, while independent testing shows very different results. To now allow Duke to be the responsible party for assessments of the seeps at the ponds and groundwater contamination, after DENR has testified that this pollution is illegal and a threat to public health and our water supply is like having a coyote oversee the hen house.

We must have a settlement that **requires** Duke to **clean up** this pollution, not just assess it. They will not do their public duty unless they are forced to through government direction.

This area is a peninsular and other than our development, everyone else relies on wells. They will be the first effected, but the million others who rely on this reservoir should not left to clean this up with tax payer money down the road, when Duke has walked away scot free.

We are relying on you to bring justice to this frightening situation. Thank you.

Best Regards
Ann Danzi
513 Stonewater Bay Lane
Mt Holly, NC 28120
704-820-0891

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Beth Gregory [beth2.gregory@me.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 5:00 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

If the decision regarding the proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy is a only a fine of \$99,000, there will not be a remedy to stopping or cleaning up the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

Please show that you care about the future of our fresh water and the lives that depend on it. I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Beth Gregory

3812 Cloee Cir

Hillsborough, NC 27278-7916

(919) 643-2297

Palmer, Lisa M

From: John Kinsella [jkinsella@nc.rr.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 3:51 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Toxic Coal Ash

Aug 1, 2013

Ms. Lisa Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality

1617 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1617

Dear Ms. Palmer, N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality,

I am opposed to the Duke Energy and DENR settlement regarding the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the French Broad River from toxic coal ash lagoons. In DENR's filing against Duke Energy, it was noted that the unlawful pollution "poses a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state", yet the proposed settlement asks Duke Energy to simply study the pollution. We need a settlement that moves polluted coal ash away from the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake and stores it safely in a dry lined landfill. I urge DENR to hold a public hearing so that the public's voice can be heard on this critical issue.

It's time for Duke Energy and DENR to take immediate action to protect the French Broad River and Mountain Island Lake (drinking water reservoir for over 800,000 people) and stop delaying the clean up!

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mr. John Kinsella

6109 Hollow View Ct

Fuquay Varina, NC 27526-7255

(919) 552-4783

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Gregory Barley [gbbarley@msn.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 3:39 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend Ash Pond

Ms. Palmer,

I am a Duke Energy employee. I am also a resident of Stonewater Bay near the Riverbend Power Plant, which has been in the news due to the ash pond leakage concern.

Let me say that I do not trust the extreme views expressed by some of my neighbors and by the extreme environmentalists. I trust that the state of North Carolina will ensure that no harm comes to the ecosystem or the population. The fact that there may be some leakage going into Mountain Island Lake does not cause me concern. I simply expect the state to enforce the permits, which protect the public and the environment. I do not say this simply because I am a Duke Energy employee, but I am a Nuclear Chemist with significant background in environmental studies. In fact, I have supervised laboratories that analyze these waste streams. I know that the levels of metals are not of an immediate threat.

Most of the people living here moved here after the power plant was built. (Many were not even born yet!) They should not complain about the ash pond being an eyesore or an impediment to property values. No one forced them to move here. Instead, let's just focus on protecting the public.

Thank you.

Greg Barley
404 Brookridge Drive
Mt Holly, NC 28120

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Karen Meacham [kckidmuse@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:38 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Karen Meacham

7203 Saint Crispins Way

Summerfield, NC 27358-9371

(336) 209-1301

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Herbert Munt [rick.munt@grifols.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

No one will want to take a vacation in the mountains if there is pollution in the water. Is it too much to ask that people take care of their messes?

Sincerely,

Herbert Munt

2017 Valley Ct

Clayton, NC 27520-8804

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Diane Masters [diane.masters@duke.edu]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Diane Masters

2902 Quincemoor Rd

Durham, NC 27712-1039

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Sylvie Horvath [horvathwms@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:36 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Sylvie Horvath

1035 Columbine Rd

Asheville, NC 28803-1947

(828) 651-0102

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Barry Anderson [barry@gcp.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Barry Anderson

111 W Oregon Ave

Kill Devil Hills, NC 27948-9034

(252) 441-9401

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jeanne Martin [jeanne.martin@sas.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Jeanne Martin

276 Boothe Hill Rd

Chapel Hill, NC 27517-8876

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Chuck Lillie [guitarplayer@nc.rr.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 2:37 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Don't let Duke get away with more pollution from their coal ash waste

Aug 1, 2013

North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources

Dear Department of Environment and Natural Resources,

The proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy fails to stop the pollution from coal ash ponds. Continuing to study the illegal pollution won't clean it up and continues to put communities at risk.

I urge you to require that Duke Energy stop the pollution of our groundwater and the French Broad River near the Asheville Coal Plant and Mountain Island Lake near Charlotte. Duke needs to start cleaning up the mess that has already been made.

Further, I ask that you hold a public hearing on the proposal so the public's voice can be heard.

Finally, please take action now and end the delays.

Sincerely,

Chuck Lillie

824 Rainer Ct

Garner, NC 27529-8263

(919) 585-2601

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jack and Deanie Horowitz [deaniejack@hotmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 10:50 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake/Duke Ash pond removal request

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Our family of three moved to the Charlotte area in the late summer of 2004, we were immediately drawn to the beauty of Mountain Island Lake and were able to purchase a home near the lake. We enjoy the beauty, wildlife and recreational opportunities of the lake, and were quite happy to see some of the steps taken by the city of Charlotte to protect the area from overdevelopment to protect the city's drinking water source.

We were also quite happy that Duke had agreed to an early shutdown of it's antiquated Riverbend steam plant and were hopeful that Duke would take the proper steps to alleviate the dangers posed by it's ashpond storage of waste coal fuel. I was quite shocked to read recently of the lenient "settlement" agreed to by the DENR. I have read testimony that the DENR states the pollution caused by the leaking ash ponds is illegal and a threat to the drinking water supply of Charlotte and the surrounding areas.

I am advocating quite strongly that Duke be held accountable for the clean up of their pollution of the Catawba river for the safe being and wellness of the citizens in the area, as well as the protection of the public resource that is Mountian Island Lake.

Best Regards,

Jack Horowitz
12478 Preservation Pointe Dr.
Charlotte, NC 28216

Deanie Horowitz

Cole Horowitz

Palmer, Lisa M

From: klblacknc@aol.com
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 10:50 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash

Please help provide a public hearing as many have been aware of the coal ash situation from Duke. NO MORE STUDIES, DUKE MUST CLEAN UP ITS MESS OF ASH!!

Please protect our drinking water, Duke can well afford to help.

Lynn Black

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Matt Hamilton [matt.hamilton1@att.net]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 9:34 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-Duke Energy coal ash settlement on Mountain Island Lake

Ms. Palmer,

Now that Riverbend has been decommissioned, Duke should be required to completely clean up the coal ash ponds and make sure no toxins leach into Mountain Island Lake. I'm surprised this is even a subject of discussion. DENR's purpose is to protect the people and environment from pollution – not to protect Duke Energy from having to clean up their dangerous residue.

Don't be bullied by Duke Energy – do the right thing and require them to remove the ash and line the ponds!

Thanks for taking the time to read this,
The Hamilton Family
617 Watson St.
Davidson, NC 28036
704-651-2889

Palmer, Lisa M

From: madmax0007@aol.com
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 9:21 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power and water safety

Add my name to the list of those who think that Duke Energy's practice of coal ash dumping should be reviewed by those who have concern for public health and safety, distanced from the profit motives of big business.

John Gary Maxwell, MD, FACS, independent historian, Wilmington, NC.
Robert Newton Baskin and the Making of Modern Utah,
[is now available in fine book stores and on the web.](#)

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Linda Grattafiori [lindacg@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Thursday, August 01, 2013 1:04 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke's coal ash

Please let Duke know that I have young grandchildren in North Carolina, and that I expect Duke to behave responsibly like ethical adults, and move the coal ash to a dry state where it is placed in a lined landfill.

Thank you.

Linda Grattafiori

Palmer, Lisa M

From: BETTY BEAMGUARD [bewibe@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 7:32 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke's Coal Ash Piles

Please secure the coal ash now. Once its loose, there's no getting it back.

Betty B.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Scott Boatwright [scott_boatwright@hotmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 4:10 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: NCDENR v. Duke Energy Progress, Inc.
Attachments: NCDENR v. Duke Energy Progress Consent Order Objections 2013 07.docx

My comments on the Draft Consent Order in NCDENR v. Duke Energy Progress, Inc., 13-CVS-4061 (Wake County Superior Court) are attached.

Please confirm that you have received them.

Thanks.

Scott Boatwright
Asheville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Zachary Rudisin [zrudisin@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 3:47 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR and Duke Energy Settlement

524 *Pauline*

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and close it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill. Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir. Duke should have to pay for their actions and clean up areas they have contaminated.

Marquesbury, Md.

Zach Ruden
Wilmington, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: cgmaxwell@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 3:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke power

Please hold duke power accountable for the dumping of coal ash. Allow a public hearing for the people of North Carolina whose drinking water has been put at risk.

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Captain Ron @ My Lake Wateree [captain.ronkadan@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 2:29 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Coal Ash Pond Clean Up

Hi Ms. Palmer:

I live on Lake Wateree. You would think that since Mountain Island Lake is far upstream from us that the effect of a coal ash pond not being cleaned up would not matter to me. Lake Wateree is lovingly referred to as the toilet bowl of the 11 lakes in the Catawba River chain. Anything that makes it into the other 10 lakes does make it's way down to us. The first flood event we had this year, Mountain Island Lake had no warning and they received 8' of water flooding the properties. That water had to move somewhere, and it eventually made it to Lake Wateree. If there was a problem with the flooding and the coal ash pond at that flood event, we would have suffered the consequences.

If an individual or company had contaminated soil from oil, for example, and they wanted to sell the property, it would have to be cleaned up. In Beaufort SC there is a superfund because the military base there contaminated the water system.

I would like to see this situation resolved before there is a problem. Let's clean it up now and not wait until the coal ash and it's pollutant chemicals make it down stream.

There is no need for a study. We know it is a very bad situation to have coal ash ponds. The time to act is now. Having Duke pay a fine does nothing, in my opinion. Just look at pharmaceutical companies and other companies that do not tell the truth in their advertising. It is less expensive for them to pay a fine and continue to sell products falsely advertised.

Thank you,



Captain Ron Kadan

Lake Wateree Initiative Committee

Chairman of the Lake Wateree Association 2011

Lake Wateree Association Area 14 Representative

Lake Wateree Water Watch Advisory Committee Member

Lake Keeper for the Lake Wateree Covekeepers, part of the Catawba Riverkeeper® Foundation

Worrying does not take away tomorrow's troubles, it takes away today's peace.

Life, it is what it is...But it will become what you make it.

100% Dedicated and Focused on Selling Lake Wateree only!

Palmetto Elite Realty, LLC

Camden SC 29020

C: 803-288-2687

F: 803-273-0021

E: CaptainRon@MyLakeWateree.Com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ed Morse [dremorse@netscape.net]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 11:35 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: DENR-Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Ms. Palmer, I won't go into long explanations on this issue since I know you are fully aware of the issues and involved parties. I simply want to encourage DENR NOT to treat the coal ash concern as something that needs to be studied to death. It is important that public concerns be heard and that ACTION take place to stop the already documented pollution of Mountain Island Lake. Water, especially drinking water, is a critical resource to NC and the country. Please move this problem to an action phase involving cleanup and assurances of future prevention of coal ash pollution by Duke Energy and any other producer of coal ash. Thank you.

Ed Morse

Morganton, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: joanmathis1@juno.com
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 10:12 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M

We do not need any more sampling of the pollution we have from the coal ash deposits from Duke Powers Arden plant. Enough is enough .

Now we need cleanup. !!! We are concerned about our homes and families . Please HELP!!!!
Joan Mathis

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jackie Benfield [benfieldjp@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 9:22 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power and Mountain Island Lake

Any solution to this problem must include the removal of ash ponds and a complete cleanup of pollution.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dick heiser [rheiser@ec.rr.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 31, 2013 8:21 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountlain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer;

A public hearing is not really necessary.... Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake. It is time to take action and end the delays.

Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Duke and DENR should take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.

Sincerely,

Richard Heiser
3820 Worthdale Dr
Castle Hayne, NC 28429

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Peter Stoffel [PStoffel@Carolina.RR.Com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 9:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Riverbend Steam Station Coal Ash Pond Comments

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I have recently received word that the settlement for the Riverbend Coal Ash pond is open for comment and that you are the person to contact. If you are not the correct person I would appreciate you forwarding my message to the correct person.

In a nutshell, I am gravely disappointed by the current proposal. Leaving a leaking coal ash pond in place when over 850,000 people depend on Mountain Island Lake for their drinking water is "penny wise but pound foolish". This power plant has been serving Duke Energy for over 80 years. The company has earned a tremendous amount of money from this facility over those eight decades. I do not believe that it is unreasonable to expect them to clean up their mess when they are done using the power plant.

While I understand that there were not 860,000 people depending on this water supply when they built the plant, it only makes sense now to guarantee it is cleaned up based on today's realities. The heavy railway infrastructure is already in place and this is certainly not a cost prohibitive procedure. I am not naively claiming that it will be inexpensive, but that it can be done efficiently and cost effectively.

Please hold a public hearing on the proposal. Let's end the delays and get this settled, cleaned up, and resolved for good.

Sincerely,

~Peter Stoffel
213 Village Glen Way
Mount Holly, NC 28120
704-822-2425

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Clarke Harbold [charbold@hotmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 9:25 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Mountain Island Lake public hearing needed

Dear Ms Lisa Palmer,

I am a Charlotte NC resident concerned about your deal with Duke Energy regarding the coal ash slurry on Mountain Island Lake. After what happened in 2008 at the TVA Kingston facility I cannot believe you would not take resonable measures to protect my drinking water. DENR needs to make an effort effort to remedy the risk of the containment pond leaking into my drinking water. As a kayaker I have seen the leaking streams of pollution when the water is low. More studies is not what is needed but clean-up of the slurry.

The deal announced, a \$36,000 fine, no arrangement of any kind of remedy appears to have a conflict of interest with the public health. Let the citizens speak, hold a public hearing, let those affected have a say.

Thank you,

Clarke Harbold

Charlotte, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Charles collier [gatewood@att.net]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 7:35 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power / Progress - Polution of Mt. Island Lake by Riverbend Steam Station

Dear Ms. Palmer,

Duke Power's Riverbend Steam Station was placed online in 1929. For the many years that it was in operation, chemical pollution of our drinking water was something not many people thought about, not they they did not care, they simply did not have the knowledge or vision to understand the long term effects of the pollutants that the Riverbend Steam Plant was dumping into Mt. Island lake. For scores of years Duke reaped profits and never gave much consideration to what they were doing to the enviroment. Now, I feel, it is time for this corporate giant to take responsibility for the pollution caused by Riverbend and once and for all clean up the ash ponds and do everthing possible to mend the damage that has been done to this lake.

How precious is dringing water, I feel sure that you know that answer, more than gold because we can't live without it. I am a resident of Mt. Island lake. Can you imaging how disturbing to me it is to read factual articles that tell you not to eat fish caught in this lake because of pollution, yet the city of Charlotte sends thousand of gallons of this contaminated water to its water plant along with Gastonia and seveal others cities so that it can be consumed by its citizens.

Duke has done nothing but use stall tactics because they simple don't want to clean up their mess. I implore you to move forward on the following points:

- Require several **public hearings on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Thank you for your consideration on this matter.

Sincerely,

Charles Collier

God Bless America and America's Fighting Men and Women

Cell (704) 578-3558

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Gail Sondergaard [gsondergaard@aol.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 3:50 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Environmental action

A never-ending sampling plan with no cleanup plan is not a solution to the problem of our water being poisoned by leaking chemicals from coal ash ponds!

You are responsible for seeing that this doesn't happen. Please do your job and protect us from this contamination!

Sincerely,

Gail Sondergaard

Asheville

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mary McKeown [lucymars88@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 2:45 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash problem in Buncombe County, NC

Dear Ms Palmer,

Please halt all the years of "testing" for coal ash pollution and demand a solution to the river pollution problem from Duke Energy Progress NOW. The company is stalling and we all know it. Please do your job right now.

Thank you.

Mary M. McKeown

66 Blue Ridge Assembly Drive

Black Mountain, NC 28711

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Paul Burley, Sr. [paulsburl@att.net]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 11:35 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Power's Coal Ash Removal

Dear Ms. Palmer:

We have three generations of Burleys living in the Charlotte, Matthews and Lake Wylie, SC area, and we are all deeply concerned about what is going on with the Duke Energy coal ash debacle. We all get our water from the Catawba basin.

Duke Power/Energy created the coal ash problem up at Mountain Island Lake, and they need to clean it up, PERIOD! Further, the expense of the clean-up should be totally borne by Duke and its stockholders, not by raising rates (again) to defray the cost!

Are we our own worst enemies in "protecting" our most precious resource?

Thank you for listening.
Sincerely,
Paul S. Burley, Sr.
15 Ridgeway Rd.
Lake Wylie, SC 29710

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Russ Leopard [russleopard@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 10:55 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash pond seepage

There have been enough studies of the water pollution of Mountain Island Lake and the surrounding ground water. It is time to force Duke Power to move the coal ashe away from the lake to lined landfills in a dry state. We need a public hearing on this now so the public can be heard.

A \$36,000 slap on the wrist and more studies is unjust.

Thank you,

Russ Leopard

Nebo, NC

•

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kathy Jaeck [kejaeck@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 10:37 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke-DENR deal

Dear Ms. Palmer,

As a resident of Mountain Island Lake, I am appalled at the deal reached between Duke and DENR regarding the coal ash ponds at Riverbend Steam Station. It is utterly unacceptable, not to mention irresponsible and dangerous, to consider this deal as a "remedy" for the coal ash waste Duke has generated, and allows to remain at that facility. It is well documented that there are seeps into MIL, and the threat of coal ash contaminating the lake is frightening.

It is time to stop delays and take action. More studies, and added water into the ponds are **not** needed; what is needed is removal of the coal ash ponds entirely. Duke has created this problem, and known about it for years. The \$36,000 fine is a joke; DENR has fined individual polluters three times that amount.

I am requesting a public hearing so that my voice, and the voices of the 860,000 citizens who rely on MIL for drinking water and recreation can be heard.

Please take the necessary steps to right this wrong; work for the people of this state, not just the industries.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Kathleen E. Jaeck

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lmccaw4449@aol.com
Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 9:37 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash

We don't need more studies--leakage of coal ash ponds is well documented. Just make them clean it up. If rates must be raised to cover that, so be it. Charlotte has no choice of what to drink other than the water of Mountain Island Lake.
Linda Mccaw 15608 Chatfield Dr. CLT 28278

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carol R Fisher [fisher3960@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 9:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Responsibility

Dear Lisa,

Duke Power used to be a more responsive company and I don't know what has happened to them. I will no longer buy their stock even though power companies should be a part of my portfolio.

They need to know that the people of North and South Carolina no longer think highly of their judgment, and it will hurt them as well as the environment.

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and take care of the mess at Oconee.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill and fix the problems at Oconee before a dangerous situation arises.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.
- And they should do this without the need for billions more dollars from their customers. Perhaps they need fewer lawyers and more engineers.

Carol Rose Fisher
138 Faris Circle
Greenville, SC 29605
864-241-0815

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Lanny Reavis [lannyreavis@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 7:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution

The current proposal on this issue with Duke Power is pathetic. The problems have been well documented, we don't need more studies. We need to stop coal ash pollution now. We need a settlement that gets Duke to clean up the mess they created.

We need a public hearing on this. The public needs to be protected against pollution of our drinking water.

You are reminded to protect our water which belongs to all the people. Do not let Duke's political power stifle your department on this issue.
Thank you for your consideration,
Lanny

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Laura Weisner [bweisner@carolina.rr.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 7:39 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: relicensing

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am a stockholder of Duke Energy. I am, more importantly, a person dependent on drinking water from the Catawba chain. I have a home on Lake Wateree. This is a no brainer. We cannot keep poluting our resources.

The Duke-DENR deal **does not stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake and groundwater** – it lets Duke continue pouring contaminated water into the Lake the and groundwater that will eventually reach the Lake.

- The Duke-DENR deal **leaves 2.7 million tons of coal ash in unlined leaking lagoons on the banks of the drinking water reservoir for Charlotte-Mecklenburg, Gastonia, Mount Holly** and other municipalities those systems serve.
- The Duke-DENR deal **only requires more studies instead of cleanup**, when DENR and Duke have known about the pollution for years and have done nothing to stop it.
- The Duke-DENR deal includes **only a token fine of \$36,000 that forgives years of documented illegal pollution** by this multi-billion dollar company, Give me a break.

I want **a public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.

- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.** Clean it up now.
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.** Arsenic is deadly.
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- I enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Sincerely,

Brad Weisner, MD

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joyce Kill [Jarkill@aol.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 6:18 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Governor,

- We want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- **Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake.**
- It is time to **take action and end the delays.**
- Duke should **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- Duke and DENR should take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people.**
- You enjoy clean water and want to make sure the problems at Riverbend don't linger for generations to come.

Thank you,
Joyce Kill

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rick and Monica Laws [rmlaws@comporium.net]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 6:14 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke and DENR

Our family lives directly on Lake Wylie in Tega Cay, having moved from Maryland recently. It has been shocking to learn how much Duke Energy is allowed to pollute waters in the Carolinas. Please allow a public hearing so that public comments can be made. It is of huge concern to everyone that healthy water is available for drinking and for recreational activities and for enjoyment in general. How could Duke NOT show more respect for the people around them. We stay up-to-date with what is happening through the Catawba Riverkeeper Organization and through the new river keeper, Sean Perkins and are active members as well.

Please be proactive to protect all of your families, including yours.

Thank you!

Rick and Monica Laws
Tega Cay, SC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bill Cram [bcram@mbkahn.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 6:03 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy

Good afternoon, Ms. Palmer;

As a resident of Lake Wateree I am always concerned about water quality issues in the Catawba-Wateree system. Duke Energy is a key and essential player in insuring the quality of the river and lakes within the system. Of particular concern to me, especially in light of the recent exceptional rainfall, is Duke's continued failure to clean up their coal ash lagoons in the vicinity of Mountain Island Lake. Whether it be through Duke's own initiatives, DENR directives, or public hearings, it is imperative that Duke Energy takes steps immediately to remediate this environmental hazard instead of simply doing more studies. It's time for action, not delays!

Please let me know what I can do to assist in moving Duke and/or DENR to action on this critical water quality issue.

Thank you for taking time to read this email.

Bill Cram, Exec. V. P.

M. B. Kahn Construction Co., Inc.

101 Flintlake Road

Columbia, SC 29223

O 803-227-1239 / M 803-917-5333 / F 803-736-9501

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Leslie Stamey [leslie.stamey@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 5:35 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am deeply disheartened at the lack of action taken with regards to the coal ash lagoons on Mountain Island Lake. There should be no compromise with Duke Energy on this matter. As we all know, Mountain Island Lake supplies water to 860,000 people and the wildlife in the area. As one of the 860,000 consumers, I'm counting on you to help keep the water for my family clean and healthy. There is no need to allow Duke Energy to get away with this denial. There are innocent citizens that rely on institutions to be responsible and not think of the bottom line for a multi-billion dollar giant! Please do not let Duke Energy and the tainted, money driven legislators of this state to destroy our environment and our health.

Thank you for your consideration,

Leslie Stamey

Huntersville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Carrie Goodykoontz [indiabrowndog@aol.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 5:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke DENR

Ms. Palmer,

It is unbelievable that Duke is still trying to get one over on the people of the Charlotte Area. You must do everything you can to stop the pollution of our drinking water and water that people eat out of and play in.

There have been enough assessments, it's time to clean our river up and put in place fines that will hurt.

Have we not learned our lessons yet? It's all connected. healthy population= smart economic sense. It's proven, poor water and air quality hurts. Please do what you can within your scope of power to do the right thing.

Sincerely,

Carrie Goodykoontz

Palmer, Lisa M

From: jennifer shumaker [shumakerjen@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 4:54 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke coal ash ponds

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I am extremely concerned with the lack of restrictions on Duke Energy and the coal ash ponds along our river basin. As an 8th grade science teacher, I have discussed this issue with my students every year when we get into the hydrosphere curriculum, and have therefore followed the issue more than some. I do not understand how - in light of documented cases of coal ash spills in other areas and independent testing on our water ways - DENR can possibly allow Duke Energy to continue to carelessly waste our water supply. We don't need more studies on the hazards of coal ash - we need Duke Energy to take responsibility for their actions and clean up the waste so that it does not continue to leach into groundwater and/or the surface water sources.

Please explain to me how a token fine and more studies are going to protect our water source? We need action rather than talks and mediation; fining a huge company like Duke Energy is not going to protect our drinking water. I would like to know exactly why they haven't been required to clean up and line existing ponds? I ask these questions not just for myself, but for my daughter and the generations who will come after her - we all deserve clean drinking water!

I look forward to your reply; thank you.

Jennifer Fogle

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Mark Adams [mark.adams@sonoco.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 4:39 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Coal Ash Settlement

Ms. Palmer, DENR and Duke Energy,

I believe that minimum requirements for a settlement with Duke Energy include:

- immediate steps to stop the current pollution from the Riverbend site
- defined remediation plan to secure the ash lagoons while the contents are re-located to a properly designed and maintained state landfill
- remediation of the site after ash removal to insure that no contaminants remain that could contaminate groundwater or other waterways

The ongoing illegal and irresponsible pollution of Mountain Island Lake from Duke Energy's Riverbend coal ash lagoons is an unjust abuse of the environment that diminishes the quality and safety of Charlotte's drinking water and poses a known catastrophic risk to residents and the environment.

This issue does not require study, it requires remediation. The ongoing pollution has been documented and acknowledged by DENR and Duke. A DENR settlement that fails to stop the pollution AND prevent future pollution from this site, represents a failure of DENR's enforcement of environmental regulation and law. This agreement neither protects citizens and the environment, nor holds Duke accountable to the same standards that exist for the rest of the State's industry.

I believe that the current settlement is evidence of corruption and the ability of a major corporation to simply ignore legal requirements written to protect citizens and the environment. There are laws being broken; Duke has acknowledged this, and at the same time says they are doing nothing wrong. The settlement fine at a level below SEC Reporting requirements combined with a lack of ANY remediation requirements is nothing short of corruption. It allows Duke to continue ignoring this tremendous liability while it harms the public.

Yes, Duke is a major corporation with tremendous power and leverage, however they have also ignored an escalating liability for many years and that is not a reason for exemption from their legal and ethical responsibilities.

Mark W. Adams

This e-mail message and all documents which accompany it are intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which addressed, and may contain privileged or confidential information. Any unauthorized disclosure or distribution of this e-mail message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail message in error, please notify the sender and delete this from all computers.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: GDnls@aol.com
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 4:05 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: sam@catawbariverkeeper.org
Subject: DUKE/DENR SETTLEMENT

We need a settlement that gets Duke to clean up its pollution, not a settlement that asks for a study of it. Significant studies have already been made. The facts are known so that I do not have to repeat them. DENR has already said under oath that this pollution is illegal and a threat to public health and our water supplies. The law requires action now to stop the coal ash pollution, but this proposal fails to require any action.

In summary:

- I want a **public hearing on the proposal** so the public's voice can be heard.
- I want to **stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake**.
- I want DENR to **take action and end the delays**.
- I want Duke to **move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake** and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.
- I want Duke and DENR to take immediate action to **protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people**.
- I and all other citizens have a **right to clean water**, and I do **not** want the problems at Riverbend to linger for generations to come.

Eugene O. Daniels
15620 Chatfield Dr.
Charlotte, NC 28278
704-588-2162

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joe Bearden [chickadeebirders@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 4:14 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on Proposed Duke Settlement (Mountain Island Lake)

I have serious concerns about the proposed settlement between DENR and Duke Energy. Even though DENR has stated that Duke's unlawful pollution is "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina," you recently proposed a settlement with Duke Energy that does nothing to clean up coal ash pollution at Mountain Island Lake.

The proposed settlement lets Duke continue to pour contaminated water into the Lake and leaves coal ash in unlined lagoons. Please hold public hearings on your unacceptable proposal. DENR needs to hear from the public!! Two key items to be considered should be: 1) Stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake. Duke and DENR need to take immediate action to protect the drinking water reservoir for 860,000 people. 2) Duke should move its coal ash away from Mountain Island Lake and store it safely in a dry state in a lined landfill.

Kind Regards,

Joe Bearden

1809 Lakepark Drive

Raleigh, NC 27612

chickadeebirders@gmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Joe Brown [joe_lakeman@comporium.net]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 4:10 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: polluton

I think Duke energy should take better action to control pollution from our lakes and streams by redirecting coal ash to safer areas such as a safe land fill rather than letting it run off into our lakes"

Joe M. Brown
Lake Wylie, SC 29710

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Legendsman@aol.com
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:44 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Hello Lisa

Thank you for the opportunity to express my thoughts on coal ash ponds and the water discharge from Duke Power plants into the waters of North Carolina. As a resident of NC, this is a very important matter to me. I feel that it would be appropriate for the public at large to have a voice in the settlement that Duke is proposing as this settlement is very concerning to me and could set a very bad precedent on how matters similar to this are resolved in the future on other NC bodies of water like Lake Norman and Lake Wylie.

Thank you again and please let me know if I should voice my concerns to other parties.

Richard

Palmer, Lisa M

From: June Gregor [gregorsbetterhealth@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:40 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke and DENR deal

Dear Ms Palmer,

As a concerned citizen of NC I feel it is very important for us to deal with anything that is contaminating water. If the coal ash problem is not taken care of we could end up having a major problem with drinking water, wildlife dying, trees and other plants can also be effect. Big business needs to realize that they will be effect by these problems along with the rest of us, and they need to be responsible for their actions, just like the rest of us.

Thank you for taking the time to read this email.

Sincerely,

June Gregor

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Dave Cole [daveemc@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:27 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash ponds

Hi Lisa and NCDENR staff-

I use mountain island lake for paddling, swimming, and drinking.

AND I live downstream from this body of water.

I find it very troubling that NCDENR is planning to allow the toxic coal ash ponds remain and continue to dump arsenic into this very vital body of water that I use.

Please - if democracy exists at all any more in America, please consider this as a vote against your plan to leave the ponds in place, unlined and leaking into this highly endangered river.

Please - consider this a vote for further independent studies to better measure contaminants from these ponds and their impact to the river and surrounding ground water.

Please - consider installing groundwater monitoring wells - both shallow well and deep well monitoring.

Please - consider increasing the fine on Duke/Progress for these ponds, making the fine annually reoccurring, with an increasing scale for each year these ponds remain in place and use the proceeds for public education and funding non-profits who fight to protect waterways, watersheds and coves of the Catawba river.

I am requesting a public hearing on this matter.

Please advise next steps.

Thank you,

Dave

704/942-5331

Palmer, Lisa M

From: brett@greensborohousingcoalition.com
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:22 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke/ DENR coal ash settlement

To whom it may concern:

I am both an avid sport fisherman, and water drinker.

I have been following the Duke Energy settlement issue for the past few months. The citizens of NC have a right to be heard on this issue. There should be a public hearing on this proposal.

Duke should be forced to stop polluting Mountain Island Lake and the Catawba and clean up the ash ponds.

Sincerely

Brett Byerly
High Point, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Edith [edith@okhazel.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:21 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: please stop the pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Ms. Palmer,

As a property owner on Lake Wylie, I am especially concerned about water quality in the Catawba River. Please take action and put an end to the delays and studies which continue the pollution from Riverbend. I would like to see the coal ash removed from the Riverbend coal ash pond and public hearings to hear from people affected by the pollution. We need clean drinking water now and for generations to come.

Sincerely,
Edith Upchurch

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Rogers, William [rogersw@winthrop.edu]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:13 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Proposed Settlement DUKE-DENR

Ms. Palmer:

I wish to state my objection to the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and the DENR. Those objections include:

- 1) I see no plans to hold a public hearing on the proposal. Why can the public not weigh in on this matter in a forum setting?
- 2) There is nothing about ceasing the on-going pollution of Mountain Island Lake. We are long past the time when we as a state can allow the dumping of materials into public areas. We know that is no solution.
- 3) If Duke needs to deal with coal ash then it needs to find a lined landfill and store it in a dried state.
- 4) Both Duke and DENR must make sure that Mountain Island lake's water is protected from here on out. It is the drinking water for over ¾ of a million people.

Thank you,

Dr. William Rogers

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Keith Schermerhorn [keith724376@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 3:07 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: please keep Duke Power liable for its pollution of Mountain Island Lake

Please make sure that Duke Power cleans up its pollution, and stops polluting, Mountain Island Lake. Thanks you.

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Elizabeth Walles [elizabeth_walles@hotmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, July 27, 2013 11:41 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: elizabeth_walles@hotmail.com
Subject: Comment letter - oppose Duke Energy coal ash settlement

Dear N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality, attention of Ms. Lisa Palmer:

My family and I oppose your proposed Coal Ash settlement with Duke Energy. **Public health and welfare depends on a settlement that STOPS pollution, and doesn't merely request information on it.** We fear for the 860,000 people who source drinking water from Mountain Island Lake as well as my family, friends and community downstream. We do agree with you that Riverbend's coal ash waste lagoons that seep into Mountain Island Lake pose "a serious danger to the health, safety and welfare of the people of North Carolina and serious harm to the water resources of the state."

We implore you to request the information beforehand, and require resolution be the term for any settlement to which you agree.

Please protect the public. Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely yours,

Elizabeth W. Duda

1081 Palmyra Drive

Tega Cay, SC 29708

elizabeth_walles@hotmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Massengale, Susan
Sent: Friday, July 26, 2013 10:12 AM
To: cdzikeli@gmail.com
Cc: Elliot, Drew; Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke vs NC State Lawsuit

Hello Ms Zikeli,

Your inquiry about the proposed Duke Energy consent order was forwarded to me. The documents that support the proposed order are available on-line. The quickest link is:

http://portal.ncdenr.org/web/wq/hot-topics/asheville_riverbend_steamstadoes

Please make sure you send your comments to Lisa Palmer by the August 14 end date for the comment period.

Thank you for taking the time to be involved and comment,
Susan

Susan Massengale
Public Information Officer
DENR- Division of Water Quality
1617 MSC, Raleigh, NC 27699-1617
(919) 807-6359; fax (919) 807-6492

Please note: my e-mail address has changed to susan.massengale@ncdenr.gov

E-mail correspondence to and from this address may be subject to the North Carolina Public Records Law and may be disclosed to third parties.

From: Palmer, Lisa M
Sent: Friday, July 26, 2013 9:55 AM
To: Massengale, Susan
Subject: FW: Duke vs NC State Lawsuit

Tom told me to forward this to you.

Lisa M. Palmer

NCDENR/DWQ/Point Source Branch
1617 Mail Service Center
Raleigh, NC 27699-1617
(919) 807-6304

From: Christina Zikeli [<mailto:cdzikeli@gmail.com>]
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2013 12:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke vs NC State Lawsuit

Hey Lisa,

I live on Lake Wylie and am interested in reading more about the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and NC State concerning the coal ash plants.

Are the settlement documents available online? Or can you send me a copy of the document?

I only read the summary in the Charlotte Observer and Gaston Gazette, I would like to submit a public comment and want to make sure I have the facts straight.

Thanks for your help,

Christina Zikeli

704-226-6580

cdzikeli@gmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Jeff Poupart [jeff.poupart@ncdenr.gov]
Sent: Friday, July 26, 2013 9:19 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Message from "RNP0026733F34F1"
Attachments: 201307260918.pdf

This E-mail was sent from "RNP0026733F34F1" (Aficio MP C4502).

Scan Date: 07.26.2013 09:18:30 (-0400)

Queries to: rcollins@systemloa.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: deidre duffy [ddduffy88@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2013 1:43 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Coal Ash settlement

Dear NCDENR,

I express the sentiment with Duke Energy regarding the Coal Ash plant pollution. We do not just need more studies, we need cleanup. The safety of our future is at stake in the health of our community. Duke is responsible for cleaning up its mess. It is your responsibility to make them do this.

Deidre Duffy
Charlotte, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Eva Westheimer [eva.westheimer@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2013 1:34 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy Coal Ash Settlement

Lisa,

The settlement that DENR and Duke Energy came to agreement on for the Asheville power plant is not acceptable for me. Duke Energy needs to be taking direct steps to clean up its coal ash pollution. For more than a year the French Broad RiverKeeper, Hartwell Carson, has been monitoring the pollution for the coal ash pounds. To only continue to monitor the pollution will not stop, or clean up, the pollution. I do agree that continued monitoring is a good thing, however, DENR also needs to make Duke take direct steps in cleaning the mess up. We need real solutions for a real problem. Our community is in danger because of Duke's negligence, and the continued study of pollution will not make our community any safer.

Thank you.

Eva Westheimer

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Christina Zikeli [cdzikeli@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2013 12:33 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke vs NC State Lawsuit

Hey Lisa,

I live on Lake Wylie and am interested in reading more about the proposed settlement between Duke Energy and NC State concerning the coal ash plants.

Are the settlement documents available online? Or can you send me a copy of the document?

I only read the summary in the Charlotte Observer and Gaston Gazette, I would like to submit a public comment and want to make sure I have the facts straight.

Thanks for your help,

Christina Zikeli

704-226-6580

cdzikeli@gmail.com

Palmer, Lisa M

From: dohconsult@aol.com
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2013 11:17 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: The State Settlement With Duke Progress Energy Over Asheville Coal Ash Ponds

Lisa,

We would like to advise of our displeasure with the State of North Carolina's proposed settlement with Duke Progress Energy over the leaking coal ash ponds at their Asheville power plant. There is already much evidence that the ponds are leaking toxic chemicals that endanger our water supplies, the French Broad River, and human life. Continuing to study when proof already exists and assessing an insignificant fine will not solve the problem, only delay a solution and increase the risk of a major disaster like the one in the Tennessee Valley. The settlement should not be agreed upon, and Duke Progress Energy made to take immediate action to fix the ponds and pay significant fines until the fixes are complete.

Furthermore, the fact that the meaningless settlement usurped the right of several worthy environmental organizations to sue Duke Progress Energy over these ponds is offensive to the public and suggests a potential conflict of interest. Thank you for your service and attention to this matter.

Linda and Don Hewitt

Biltmore Lake, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Bill Maloney [maloneyw@bellsouth.net]
Sent: Tuesday, July 23, 2013 8:53 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy needs to clean up the Coal Ash pollution

Lisa

We have documented proof that Coal Ash pollution is leaching into our groundwater and into the French Broad River.

For an excellent summary with graphics see this past Sunday's Asheville Citizen Times.

This does not need to be studied any further. You need to take some action to get Duke energy to come up with a solution to fix the problem rather than have this go on and on and on.

Sincerely,

Bill Maloney

Asheville, NC. 28804

Sent from my iPhone

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Erin McCombs [erinesinger@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 23, 2013 12:52 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal Ash Comment

Hi Lisa,

I am writing to express my dissatisfaction with the coal ash settlement. I believe we need immediate sweeping action to stop the documented contamination of our important water resources. The French Broad River brings in millions of dollar to our area from sportsmen and other tourists. The river is why many people choose to live in our area. Please help take a stand and protect the environment for us and for future generations. Thank you.

Erin Singer McCombs
Cell: (901) 647-7562

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Elaine Robbins [elaine.robbins@hughes.net]
Sent: Sunday, July 21, 2013 1:06 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Coal ash settlement / Asheville

Please note my firm agreement with WNCA that a never-ending sampling plan with no cleanup is NOT the solution to toxic coal ash polluting the French Broad in Asheville. Actual cleanup is needed, the sooner the better.

Elaine Robbins
1168 Madison Heights Dr
Marshall NC 28753
828-380-1817

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Grady Hoyle [gradyhoyle@yahoo.com]
Sent: Saturday, July 20, 2013 9:51 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash pond riverbend steam station

Duke Energy is responsible for any coal ash that may be leaking into the river. They should be made to fix the problem at their own expense not going up on their electric rates to their customers. This potentially is an issue that has been going on for years. We as humans need clean drinkable water to survive life. The people that make these decisions, have to live in this area also, why do they put our water supply at risk of contamination.

I would like to take the opportunity to address another issue that is also alarming. I see it in my neighborhood, city employee, lawn service, cutting grass, and blowing it in the roads, and leaving it to wash down the drains into our streams, and rivers. Fertilizers, weed killers are used on this grass, also gets washed down the streets into drains and into our rivers. This also putting contaminants into our drinking water sources. This may seem extreme, but if our source of clean water is destroyed, our existence as the human race may be in jeopardy. Our citizens need to somehow be educated, most people know the importance of our water supply, but they just don't think about what it is doing to our environment.

sincerely,
concern citizen

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Cody James [cody.h.james@hotmail.com]
Sent: Saturday, July 20, 2013 8:43 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: gastongazette@gastongazette.com; opinion@charlotteobserver.com; localnews@charlotteobserver.com
Subject: Duke Energy proposed consent order for Riverbend coal ash liability

Hello Ms. Palmer,

I read with considerable interest the Gaston Gazette's article, "NC proposes settlement with Duke," as it appeared in the Saturday, July 20, 2013, print edition. I would like to submit comments below regarding the proposed consent order.

Thank you.

Cody James

It is pure lunacy to leave a resource hazard like coal ash so close to the water supply of Gaston and Mecklenburg Counties! I can't believe the state agency trusted with protecting our water quality would even consider containment on the shores of Mountain Island Lake a reasonable option. Higher standards are applied to bare soil abutting surface waters!

Besides all the debate on what concentrations of toxins may be seeping through the soil into the lake, what guarantees are there the earthen embankment will forever maintain structural integrity from natural forces or even sabotage and terrorism? Why take such a chance to rank up there with the Kingston Fossil Plant coal ash disaster when simply removing the hazardous waste is the best solution?

It was a great achievement when Duke Energy closed the coal plant but the decommission process should include remediation of the site such that it could revert back to natural habitat and serve as a water quality buffer much like the educational forest does for the rest of Mountain Island Lake. It is a joke to think how a buffer can be effective when it contains contaminants as described by the Sierra Club's link below!

I really hope more common sense emerges in the final analysis and decision because DENR's reputation is on the line. Even as a shareholder of Duke Energy, I believe the most environmental and socially responsible action is warranted in this situation. North Carolinians are counting on DWQ to make this situation right so that our drinking water supply is preserved as well as all the other positive benefits that Mountain Island garners for the region.

Thanks for your time and opportunity to provide comment. Remember, federal law and tax payers have empowered the agency to act on their behalf; please don't fail us!

Disposal: Coal Ash Waste
<http://content.sierraclub.org/coal/disposal-ash-waste>

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Gloria Shen [gloshen@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, July 18, 2013 6:32 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Comments on the Proposed Consent Order re. Duke Energy

Dear Ms. Palmer,

I would like to take this time to express my comments concerning the proposed consent order that the state has prepared for Duke Energy.

I do not feel it is punitive enough for the actions and violations that have occurred. Fines come and go, but contamination can continue indefinitely and unless there is an order to stop it in its tracks, we are looking at inevitable local disasters-in-the-making. Please consider Royal British Petroleum (BP) and its response to the massive oil spill and devastation in the Gulf. Did this corporation admit to its role in the widespread, life-changing destruction of the region that ensued? No, it did not. To this day, the area is not even close to being recovered and the culpable party is still wanting to dismiss its responsibility in paying punitive damages and taking corrective actions.

More study and more assessment is going to be TOO LITTLE, TOO LATE.

It is my opinion that Duke Energy be forced to take corrective actions immediately for its proven contamination of ground and surface water in addition to the payment of fines. After all, state rules have been violated, the federal Clean Water Act has been violated and Duke Energy's spokesperson still contends that the company has complied with all permits and that water quality in the French Broad is good? Rubbish.

Not so fast, I say. Failure to take appropriately firm measures will set the bar so low for every other operating company or corporation that has to comply with water quality standards. It would set a poor precedent that could present problematic challenges in the future if/when more violations occur.

I trust that you will do the right thing with regard to the consent order between your agency and Duke Energy.

I thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,
Gloria Shen
Asheville, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ann H. Deupree [anndeupree@alumni.duke.edu]
Sent: Thursday, July 18, 2013 11:55 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Cc: katie@cwfn.org
Subject: Please Proceed with Clean-up

Dear Ms. Palmer,

This statement came in an email from "Pollution Action Pipeline":

"The Riverbend facility discharges wastewater to Mountain Island Lake, which feeds the Catawba River, a source of drinking water for almost 1 million people.

Now that the plant is closed, the testing required in this Consent Order is NOT enough - the unlined ponds at Riverbend should be cleaned up for good!"

As a member of a community based group, South Durham Green Neighbors, I urge you to take all possible steps to clean up this Duke Energy facility.

Thank you,
Ann H. Deupree
Durham NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Ken Kneidel [kendl2@earthlink.net]
Sent: Tuesday, July 16, 2013 3:57 PM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: coal ash settlement

The purpose of this email is to voice my opinion on the proposed settlement between the NCDENR and Duke Energy with regard to the coal ash ponds near Mountain Island Lake.

I've recently been reviewing Duke's responses to the Public Utilities Commission with regard to environmental issues that the public raised during recent hearings, and over and over I see the same thing. As an excuse to their actions they always say "we are in compliance with all state and federal regulations". Pardon me, but in a state where the legislature is trying to make it a law that sea level can't rise above 15 inches, this is nothing to brag about.

I'd much rather see Duke show some vision, and act proactively to clean up these ash ponds before the situation worsens. Mecklenburg County's water supply is too important to put at risk.

Although Duke has posted billions of dollars in profit in recent years, they always seek the cheapest route, especially with regard to environmental matters. If the new testing that takes place shows that leakage is within state and federal guidelines, please do not allow this to close the book on this issue. I encourage you to push Duke to do the right thing. That would be to treat the ponds like a superfund site and have them cleaned up at Duke's expense.

Sincerely,

Kenneth Kneidel

Charlotte, NC

Palmer, Lisa M

From: Kritzer, Jamie
Sent: Tuesday, July 16, 2013 10:06 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: FW: Let's Assess the Extent of Contamination or How much must we bleed before we call the Doctor?

Lisa,

Here's a public comment on the proposed consent order with Duke for your records.

Jamie Kritzer
Public information officer
N.C. Department of Environment and Natural Resources
1601 Mail Service Center, Raleigh, NC 27699-1601
(919) 707-8602
Jamie.Kritzer@ncdenr.gov



An Equal Opportunity / Affirmative Action Employer

E-mail correspondence to and from this address may be subject to the North Carolina Public Records Law and may be disclosed to third parties.

From: John Clark [<mailto:johnhclark@att.net>]
Sent: Tuesday, July 16, 2013 12:04 AM
To: Kritzer, Jamie
Subject: Let's Assess the Extent of Contamination or How much must we bleed before we call the Doctor?

Mr. Kritzer, I read the following...."Duke agrees to assess the sources and extent of contamination at Riverbend and at its Asheville power plant." Clearly, the Division is cowing to vested financial interests that favor increased stock values versus the safety of drinking water for about ¾ of a million citizens, including me. It's like the fellow who has severed his arm in a buzz saw accident and his boss says let's first measure the flow of blood to see how serious the matter is.

Give us a break! I don't know how you and your staff keep a straight face.

John Clark
Bad taste is simply saying the truth
before it should be said. - Mel Brooks

Palmer, Lisa M

From: willbdone [willbdone@peoplepc.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 16, 2013 7:05 AM
To: Palmer, Lisa M
Subject: Duke Energy coal ash storage settlement inadequate

Dear N.C. DENR Division of Water Quality:

The DENR's settlement with Duke Energy regarding coal ash storage is unacceptable. Please change it so as we common folks in North Carolina are protected from pollution from coal ash.

Please do better.

Sincerely,

Michael Thomas

NC Native, Independent Voter, Tax Payer, Property Owner, and Well Water Drinker

2915 Adventist Circle

Morganton, NC 28655